

Annotated Bibliography on Developmental States, Political Settlements and Citizenship Formation

Towards Increased State Capacity and Legitimacy?

Compiled by Laura Routley

The Effective States and Inclusive Development (ESID)
Research Centre

DFID Department for
International
Development

MANCHESTER
1824

Table of Contents

Introduction	3
Key Cross Cutting Literature	5
Developmental States Literature	17
Introduction.....	17
Overarching Literature on Developmental States	18
Developmental States - The Government Business Relationship.....	24
Developmental States – Historical Examples.....	33
Building Developmental States.....	45
Developmental States – Governance, Public Goods and Democracy.....	54
Developmental States – Patrimonialism, Clientelism and Patronage	64
Developmental States and Elites	68
Political Settlements Literature	72
Introduction.....	72
Overarching Literature on Political Settlements	73
State – Society Relations: Antecedents to the concept of Political Settlements.....	77
Political Settlements - Elite Bargains, Elite Coalitions and Elite Resistance	84
Political Settlements- State Formation.....	94
Political Settlements and Effective(?) States	100
Political Settlements - Violence and Conflict	106
Sub-National and Policy Area Political Settlements	109

Inclusive(?) Political Settlements	116
Analyses of Particular Political Settlements	120
Citizenship Formation Literature.....	125
Introduction.....	125
Overarching Literature on Citizenship Formation	126
Concepts, Understandings and Experiences of Citizenship.....	130
Citizenship Formation and State Formation	141
Citizenship Formation and Effective(?) States	146
Citizenship Formation - Inclusion/Exclusion and Poverty	158
Citizenship Formation and Civil Society.....	175
Citizenship Formation – Patrimonialism, Clientelism and Patronage	179
Related Research Programmes.....	185
Other Newly Established DFID Funded Research Programme Consortia	185
Other relevant Research Programmes and Centres.....	186
Index.....	189
References.....	191

Introduction

This annotated bibliography has been produced as part of the inception phase of the Effective States and Inclusive Development (ESID) Research Centre. This research centre based at Manchester University, with funding from the UK's Department for International Development (DFID), has been set up to examine the politics of **different routes towards social justice**.

Policymakers and academics agree that an effective state is the foundation for inclusive development, whilst also recognising the critical role of non-state actors in the delivery of goods and services to poor people. Recent research has offered important insights into the role of state-society relations and bargaining amongst elites in shaping development, and of the progressive role that informal forms of politics can sometimes play. However, little is known about the how and why these forms of politics take on developmental forms or of what steps can be taken to encourage this and most governance research has tended to focus on either elitist *or* popular forms of politics (rarely both), to ignore the importance of global influences, and to deal with one-off case-studies. The *Effective States and Inclusive Development (ESID)* research centre will address these gaps through research that is rigorous and comparative across multiple-levels of analysis.

What will we investigate?

1. What forms and levels of state capacity and political commitment are required to underpin inclusive development?
2. Under what political economy conditions do states become effective within and across different domains of development (e.g. growth and employment, basic service delivery)?
3. How can non-state actors deliver development effectively whilst also strengthening the developmental capacity of the state?
4. What forms of politics, including relationships between civil and political society, are associated with keeping governments accountable as well as effective?
5. What role can and do global level factors play in supporting effective forms of state capacity and elite commitment? What kinds of intervention by development agencies over what timescales are most effective here?

This annotated bibliography offers a starting point for these investigations drawing together what is known about the politics of what works, and laying out current insights into the key political processes which operate to build effective states and enable inclusive development. The bibliography concentrates on scholarship focused on three areas; **Developmental States**, **Political Settlements** and **Citizenship Formation**. These key concepts are a crucial element of the foundation on which ESID's research will be built.

Here, within the annotated bibliography, each of these three key areas is dealt with in turn in discrete sections; however, this should not occlude the fact that there are many intersections and overlaps between them. These crossing cutting issues include (but are not limited to); the centrality of politics in development, the function of institutions, leadership and the role of elites. One highly pertinent overarching issue centres on the relationship between the state and society

and reflects the overarching concern within the research programme to identify successful routes towards social justice, founded on an inclusive social contract between states and citizens.

How to use this Annotated Bibliography

The annotated bibliography is split into five sections. The first two, *Online Resources* and *Key Crosscutting Documents*, give some general starting points for research dealing with the broad sweep issues with which we are concerned here. The three sections which follow outline research conducted on the key areas with which this document is concerned; *Developmental States*, *Political Settlements* and *Citizenship Formation*. Each of these sections has an introduction which lays out some of the general themes and provides information on what is covered by each subsection. Each entry gives the bibliographic details for the piece of work and also a short summary of its contents.¹ There is also an indication of the types of methodologies used and keywords to indicate the main themes covered. As there are many intersections and crossovers between the three areas of research these keywords are used as the basis for an index, which can be found at the end of the document, it is intended that this will help identify pieces of work covering similar issues located in different sections.

¹ The source of these summaries varies and is indicated with each entry. If no source is cited the summary has been written by the compiler.

Key Cross Cutting Literature

What's politics got to do with it?: Why donors find it so hard to come to terms with politics, and why this matters

Sue Unsworth (2009)

Journal of International Development, Volume 21, Issue 6, Pages 883–894

Donors are paying more attention to politics, and some are applying political analysis to specific aspects of development practice. But this is having little influence on mainstream debates about aid, and donors are not questioning their implicit assumptions about how development happens. There are powerful intellectual and institutional barriers to recognising that politics is central to the whole development process. This matters because, without a change in their mental models, donors will not invest in understanding local political dynamics, or give priority to strategically important but difficult issues. If they did so they would discover some very practical opportunities for progress.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

External Assistance

Elites, governance and the public interest in Africa: working with the grain?

David Booth, (2009)

Africa Power and Politics Programme, Discussion Paper No. 6

Available at: <http://www.institutions-africa.org/publications/discussion-papers>

At the heart of current policy thinking about Africa there is a significant knowledge gap concerning governance and development. This paper is concerned with what can be done about that state of affairs, drawing on the initial experience of a new research venture, the Africa Power and Politics Programme. The APPP proposes to discover forms of governance that might work better for development than those prescribed by the current 'good governance' orthodoxy. It aims to do so chiefly by examining systematically the range of postcolonial experience within the sub-Saharan African region.

The paper reviews the issues and challenges posed during initial efforts to implement this plan. They include the choice of a suitable approach to gathering and analysing the relevant data; how to arrive at some reasonably firm working hypotheses while finding a pathway through the conceptual and methodological disputes among Africanist social scientists and historians with which such attempts tend to get entangled; and avoiding 'reinventing the wheel' by failing to draw fully on the concepts and methods pioneered in other fields of comparative institutional enquiry. The writer's personal take on the work in progress in two of the programme's seven research streams is the subject of the final section of the paper.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Analysis of Methods
Outlining of Research Agenda

Keywords

Elites
Governance
State-Society Relations
Public Goods

Violence and Social Orders: A Conceptual Framework for Interpreting Recorded Human History

Douglass C. North, John Joseph Wallis, and Barry R. Weingast (2009)
Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

All societies must deal with the possibility of violence, and they do so in different ways. This book integrates the problem of violence into a larger social science and historical framework, showing how economic and political behavior are closely linked. Most societies, which we call natural states, limit violence by political manipulation of the economy to create privileged interests. These privileges limit the use of violence by powerful individuals, but doing so hinders both economic and political development. In contrast, modern societies create open access to economic and political organizations, fostering political and economic competition. The book provides a framework for understanding the two types of social orders, why open access societies are both politically and economically more developed, and how some 25 countries have made the transition between the two types.

[Cambridge University Press Publishers Summary

http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item2428034/?site_locale=en_GB]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Political Settlements
Elites
Elite Coalitions
Violence and Conflict

Changing Paths: International Development and the New Politics of Inclusion

Peter P. Houtzager and Mick Moore, Editors (2003)
University of Michigan Press: Michigan

After two decades of marketizing, an array of national and international actors have become concerned with growing global inequality, the failure to reduce the numbers of very poor people in the world, and a perceived global backlash against international economic institutions. This new concern with poverty reduction and the political participation of excluded groups has set the stage for a new politics of inclusion within nations and in the international arena. The essays in this volume explore what forms the new politics of inclusion can take in low- and middle-income countries. The contributors favor a polity-centered approach that focuses on the political

capacities of social and state actors to negotiate large-scale collective solutions and that highlights various possible strategies to lift large numbers of people out of poverty and political subordination.

The contributors suggest there is little basis for the radical polycentrism that colors so much contemporary development thought. They focus on how the political capabilities of different societal and state actors develop over time and how their development is influenced by state action and a variety of institutional and other factors. The final chapter draws insightful conclusions about the political limitations and opportunities presented by current international discourse on poverty.

[University of Michigan Press Publisher's Summary:
<http://press.umich.edu/titleDetailDesc.do?id=17792>]

See in particular:

Coalition Building from Below

Peter Houtzager and Jonathan Pattenden

This Volume, Pages 88-118

Methods

Various

Keywords

Political Settlements

State-Society Relations

Institutions

Citizenship

Seeing the State: Governance and Governmentality in India

Stuart Corbridge, Glyn Williams, Manoj Srivastava, and René Véron, (2005)

Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

Poor people confront the state on an everyday basis all over the world. But how do they see the state, and how are these engagements conducted? This book considers the Indian case where people's accounts, in particular in the countryside, are shaped by a series of encounters that are staged at the local level, and which are also informed by ideas that are circulated by the government and the broader development community. Drawing extensively on fieldwork conducted in eastern India and their broad range of expertise, the authors review a series of key debates in development studies on participation, good governance, and the structuring of political society. They do so with particular reference to the Employment Assurance Scheme and primary education provision. *Seeing the State* engages with the work of James Scott, James Ferguson and Partha Chatterjee, and offers a new interpretation of the formation of citizenship in South Asia.

[Cambridge University Press Publishers Summary:
http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item1151338/?site_locale=en_GB]

Methods

Case Studies

Fieldwork

Keywords

Citizenship-Formation
State Formation
Public Goods

Social Origins of Dictatorship and Democracy

Barrington Moore, Jr., (1967)
Beacon Press: Boston

“This book endeavors to explain the varied political roles played by the landed upper classes and the peasantry in the transformation from agrarian societies (defined simply as states where a large majority of the population lives off the land) to modern industrial ones. Somewhat more specifically, it is an attempt to discover the range of historical conditions under which either or both of these rural groups have become important forces behind the emergence of Western parliamentary versions of democracy, and dictatorship of the right and the left, that is, fascist and communist regimes.”

[Extract from preface]

Methods

Historical Analysis

Keywords

State-Society Relations
Change
Governance

Social Democracy in the Global Periphery: Origins, Challenges, Prospects

Richard Sandbrook, Marc Edelman, Patrick Heller, and Judith Teichman, (2007)
Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

Social Democracy in the Global Periphery focuses on social-democratic regimes in the developing world that have, to varying degrees, reconciled the needs of achieving growth through globalized markets with extensions of political, social and economic rights. The authors show that opportunities exist to achieve significant social progress, despite a global economic order that favours core industrial countries. Their findings derive from a comparative analysis of four exemplary cases: Kerala (India), Costa Rica, Mauritius and Chile (since 1990). Though unusual, the social and political conditions from which these developing-world social democracies arose are not unique; indeed, pragmatic and proactive social-democratic movements helped create these favourable conditions. The four exemplars have preserved or even improved their social achievements since neoliberalism emerged hegemonic in the 1980s. This demonstrates that certain social-democratic policies and practices - guided by a democratic developmental state - can enhance a national economy's global competitiveness.

[Cambridge University Press Publisher's Summary:

http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item1173956/?site_locale=en_GB]

Methods

Comparative Analysis

Keywords

Developmental States
Political Settlements
Inclusion

An upside down view of governance

Centre for the Future State, (2010)

Institute of Development Studies, Sussex

Available at: <http://www2.ids.ac.uk/gdr/cfs/pdfs/AnUpside-downViewofGovernance.pdf>

[...]

This paper draws together findings from a five-year research programme by the Centre for the Future State. It explores in an open-minded way how elements of public authority are being created through complex processes of bargaining between state and society actors, and the interaction of formal and informal institutions. [...]

Informal institutions and personalised relationships are usually seen as governance problems, but the research suggests that they can also be part of the solution. All the findings have implications for policymakers. [...]

But the value of this research for policymakers does not reside only – or even primarily – in a list of policy messages. It makes a more important, broader point. Programmes to improve the investment climate, strengthen the rule of law, or fight corruption do not fail just for lack of ‘ownership’ or attention to politics. They fail because they make the wrong starting assumption: that progressive change consists in, and can be achieved through, strengthening formal, rules-based institutions that reflect a clear division between public and private spheres of life. The key to making progress in the short-to-medium term may not be direct external intervention to orchestrate and support rules-based reform, but more indirect strategies to shift or influence the incentives and interests of local actors.

With this in mind, the research suggests a list of questions that seem particularly salient in understanding causes of bad governance and identifying ways of supporting more constructive bargaining between public and private actors. They are likely to be relevant in a great variety of circumstances. What is shaping the interests of political elites? (Sources of revenue are likely to be critical.) What is shaping relations between politicians and investors, and might they have common interests in supporting productive investment? What might stimulate and sustain collective action by social groups to demand better services? What informal local institutions are at work, and how are they shaping development outcomes? Where does government get its revenue from, and how is that shaping its relationships with citizens?

This way of thinking about governance and development implies that donors need to reassess their own role in the process, and their traditional approaches to managing ‘donor-recipient’ relationships. But the first step is for them to change their mental models, and to stop viewing the world through an OECD lens. Without this they will not make the necessary investment in understanding local political dynamics, or make the (often uncomfortable) changes needed to their own organisation, values, practices and behaviour.

[Abridged Executive Summary]

Methods

Synthesis of Research

Keywords

Governance
State-Society Relations
Elites

Societies, States and Citizens: A policymaker's guide to the research of the Centre for the Future State

M. Moore and S. Unsworth (2010)

IDS: Sussex

Available at: <http://www.dfid.gov.uk/r4d/SearchResearchDatabase.asp?OutputID=184867>

This document draws on the 'Upside-down' synthesis report and presents the key policy messages in a summarised form. Based on a ten year programme of DFID-funded research by the Centre for the Future State, the central message is that achieving better governance is not a precondition for development but an integral part of the development process. States and societies help to build each other. Bargaining between the state and society – between people who hold political/military power and organised social groups – is fundamental to achieving progressive change: more peaceful resolution of conflict, more productive investment of resources, and more inclusive public goods. Understanding how these domestic political processes play out in a particular country context, and how they are influenced by external interventions, is key to improving the effectiveness of aid-funded development efforts. Instead of top-down programmes to impose Western institutional models and best practice, donors should focus more on local capacity and local political processes, and look for ways of building on them.

[DFID Research 4 Development Database Summary]

Methods

Review of Research

Keywords

State-Society relations
State Formation
Political Settlements
Public Goods
Effective States

The Politics of Poverty: Elites, Citizens and States - Findings from ten years of DFID-funded research on Governance and Fragile States 2001–2010

DFID (2010)

DFID: London

Available at: <http://www.dfid.gov.uk/Documents/publications/evaluation/plcy-pltcs-dfid-rsch-synth-ppr.pdf>

Evidence shows that in order to deliver sustainable international development we must be able to understand and work with its politics.

[...]

The Centre for Future States and the Citizenship, Accountability and Participation Programmes (Institute of Development Studies, Sussex); the Crisis States Research Centre (London School of Economics); and the Centre for Research on Inequality and Ethnicity (CRISE, Oxford University) have been funded by DFID over the past ten years. This paper provides a brief overview of what these different programmes have told us about governance, fragility and conflict in the developing world.

The research argues that the political settlement is central to all development; and one that does not exclude powerful players is more likely to prevent conflict. But settlements also need to work at the grass roots level, representing the interests of social groups. Security is a precondition for development; this is a matter of survival and must be prioritised in countries recovering from conflict. Evidence presented here shows that in countries where cultural or ethnic groups feel there is economic, political and social inequality, wars are more likely. The future face of insecurity is not restricted to civil wars – more and more people are dying in social violence, particularly in cities [Chapters 2, 3 and 4].

The research looks at how governments can become more inclusive, and therefore more stable. States that are accountable only to some groups or that do not regard some members of society as ‘citizens’ create inequalities that can fuel conflict. When citizens actively participate in society through local associations and movements outside the state, there are benefits to both state and society [Chapters 5 and 6].

The poor, more than any other group, rely on basic Public Goods. For vulnerable families, access to education and healthcare are important routes out of poverty. The politics matters: services work better for the poor when poor citizens participate in reform of service delivery and the research looks at how this can be most effectively achieved. In conflict affected states the provision of services is very sensitive. Service delivery targeting excluded groups can reduce political tensions and improved security [Chapter 7].

DFID-funded research has made a key contribution in drawing attention to the importance of taxation in building effective states. Taxes, raised in ways that encourage economic growth and promote political accountability, build the political legitimacy of the state and offer the eventual ‘exit strategy from aid’. Tax revenues allow states to provide security and Public Goods while prioritising their own (rather than donor) policy concerns. Tax reforms can encourage interest groups in society to mobilise politically – an important bargaining process between state and citizen-taxpayers who perceive they may have a genuine stake in better government [Chapter 8].

Economic growth allows people to escape cycles of poverty and countries to end dependency on aid. But the findings shown here question some of the blueprints donors recommend for achieving growth. Some of the most successful examples of rapid economic growth in the developing world, such as China and Vietnam, have certainly not followed the ‘investment climate’ prescription. Donors may need to acknowledge the political dynamics of growth, including that some forms of informal relationships between business and state in developing countries can succeed in generating and sustaining high levels of growth [Chapter 9].

[...]

[Abridged Executive Summary from Report]

Methods

Review of Research

Keywords

Political Settlements

Citizenship

Effective States

Poverty

State-Society Relations

Better Government for Poverty Reduction: More Effective Partnership for Change

DFID (2004)

Drivers of Change, DFID: London

Available at: www.dfid.gov.uk/pubs/files/bettergovpovreduction.pdf

Governments are crucial to the enabling environment for poverty reduction. However, some governments – even in formal democracies where most voters are poor – lack the capacity or incentives to promote economic growth and pro-poor policies. This paper asks why, and what aid donors and other outside actors could do to encourage the emergence of better government in poor countries.

The problem goes deeper than weak technical capacity and lack of “political will”. Individuals matter, but so does the context within which they operate. History suggests that more effective and accountable government cannot be achieved just by creating new formal institutions. It is a more uncertain, incremental process which depends on each country’s historical circumstances, and involves fundamental changes in society, economic structures and political culture. It is thus closely connected with other sorts of economic and social progress. This has some important implications for donors and other external actors in the development process:

- They should start with an analysis of each country’s particular context, not a specific list of policies. [...]
- [...] Seemingly technical issues such as tax and public expenditure management have important implications for relations between state and civil society. Being more alert to these causal relationships could enhance the impact of development interventions.
- It is important to think about change more strategically. [...]
- Internal incentives matter greatly in determining how societies use the resources and opportunities available to them. External actors, including donors, can help by supporting a conducive enabling environment – national, regional and international - for growth and poverty reduction. [...]

[...] Making the country context the starting point for interventions implies more than just adding “political analysis” to the donor skills set: it would also require some significant changes in donor practice and culture.

There are no short cuts to better government. However, there are small but cumulatively important ways in which external actors could do more to support a long term process of social, political and institutional change which would benefit poor people. This may not involve doing a lot of new things: many of the changes in donor practice already under way support a more strategic approach. But it does imply a shift of focus - from “what” countries need to do to eliminate poverty, to “how” best to support the processes of change involved.

[Abridged Summary from Report]

Methods

Review of Literature

Keywords

Taxation

Public Goods

Effective States

State-Society Relations

Poverty

Political Elite Studies at the Year 2000

John Higley and Gwen Moore (2011)

International Review of Sociology, Volume 11, Issue 2, Pages 175-180

This paper conducts an informative review of the scholarship undertaken on political elites as of 2000. It offers a useful overview of the issues being explored in elite studies at a juncture when the study of elites had undergone rapid expansion. As part of this summary shifts away from biographical explorations towards wider survey methods and statistical analysis are detailed. In conclusion Higley and Moore argue that there is a need for further theoretical developments in the study of political elites.

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Elites

State Formation and the Origins of Developmental States in South Korea and Indonesia

Tuong Vu, (2007)

Studies in Comparative International Development Volume 41, Issue 4, Pages 27-56

This article addresses the question why developmental states emerged where they did, with a focus on the cases of South Korea and Indonesia. The analysis centers on state developmental structures, not on developmental roles or pro-growth policies. In contrast with existing scholarship that stresses colonial legacies, I argue that intralite and elite-mass interactions, especially, but not necessarily during state formation, are the primary origin of developmental states. The framework suggested here not only fills in a critical theoretical lacuna in the developmental state literature, but also contributes to the debate on the relationship between regime types and development.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Developmental States

State Formation

Elites
State-Society Relations
Political Settlements

The Origins of Political Order: From Prehuman Times to the French Revolution
Francis Fukuyama, (2011)
Profile Books: London

Nations are not trapped by their pasts, but events that happened hundreds or even thousands of years ago continue to exert huge influence on present-day politics. If we are to understand the politics that we now take for granted, we need to understand its origins. Francis Fukuyama examines the paths that different societies have taken to reach their current forms of political order. This book starts with the very beginning of mankind and comes right up to the eve of the French and American revolutions, spanning such diverse disciplines as economics, anthropology and geography. *The Origins of Political Order* is a magisterial study on the emergence of mankind as a political animal, by one of the most eminent political thinkers writing today.

[Profile Books Publisher's Summary:

<http://www.profilebooks.com/isbn/9781847652812/>]

Methods

Historical Analysis

Keywords

Political Settlements
State-Society Relations

In Search of Prosperity: Analytic Narratives on Economic Growth
Dani Rodrik, Editor. (2003)
Princeton University Press: Princeton
Introduction available at: <http://press.princeton.edu/chapters/s7518.html>

This edited volume “offers a series of analytical country narratives that try to provide answers to selected growth puzzles...” “These narratives explore the respective roles of microeconomic and macroeconomic policies, institutions, political economy, and initial conditions in driving patterns of technological convergence and accumulation in selected countries. Since the authors tend to be growth theorists and macroeconomists rather than country specialists, these are not country studies in the usual sense of the word. The strength of the chapters lies in drawing the connections between specific country experiences, on one side, and growth theory and cross-national empirics, on the other. The authors evaluate and extend our understanding of economic growth using the country narratives as a backdrop.”

[Extract from Introduction]

Methods

Theoretical Exploration
Case Studies

Keywords

Growth

States and Power in Africa: Comparative Lessons in Authority and Control

Jeffrey Herbst, (2000)

Princeton University Press: Princeton

Theories of international relations, assumed to be universally applicable, have failed to explain the creation of states in Africa. There, the interaction of power and space is dramatically different from what occurred in Europe. In his groundbreaking book, Jeffrey Herbst places the African state-building process in a truly comparative perspective, examining the problem of state consolidation from the precolonial period, through the short but intense interlude of European colonialism, to the modern era of independent states. Herbst's bold contention--that the conditions now facing African state-builders existed long before European penetration of the continent--is sure to provoke controversy, for it runs counter to the prevailing assumption that colonialism changed everything.

In identifying how the African state-building process differs from the European experience, Herbst addresses the fundamental problem confronting African leaders: how to extend authority over sparsely settled lands. Indeed, efforts to exert control over vast, inhospitable territories of low population density and varied environmental and geographical zones have resulted in devastating wars, millions of refugees, and dysfunctional governments perpetrating destructive policies.

Detailing the precise political calculations of distinct African leaders, Herbst isolates the basic dynamics of African state development. In analyzing how these leaders have attempted to consolidate power, he is able to evaluate a variety of policy alternatives for dealing with the fundamental political challenges facing African states today.

[Princeton University Press Publisher's Summary:

http://books.google.com/books/p/princeton?id=rd1CzDFXErEC&printsec=frontcover&cd=1&source=gbs_ViewAPI&hl=en#v=onepage&q&f=false]

Methods

Comparative

Historical Analysis

Keywords

State Formation

The Political Economy of Economic Growth in Africa, 1960–2000 (Volume 1)

Benno J. Ndulu, Stephen A. O'Connell, Robert H. Bates, Paul Collier, and Chukwuma C. Soludo, (2007)

Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

The period from 1960 to 2000 was one of remarkable growth and transformation in the world economy. Why did most of Sub-Saharan Africa fail to develop over this period? Why did a few small African economies succeed spectacularly? The Political Economy of Economic Growth in Africa, 1960–2000 is by far the most ambitious and comprehensive assessment of Africa's post-independence economic performance to date. Volume 1 examines the impact of resource wealth and geographical remoteness on Africa's growth and develops a new dataset of governance regimes covering all of Sub-Saharan Africa. Separate chapters analyze the dominant patterns of governance observed over the period and their impact on growth, the ideological formation of

the political elite, the roots of political violence and reform, and the lessons of the 1960–2000 period for contemporary growth strategy.

[Cambridge University Press Publisher's Summary:

http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item1174634/?site_locale=en_GB]

Methods

Case Studies

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Elites

Institutions

Growth

Working with the Grain? Rethinking African Governance

Special Edition of *IDS Bulletin*

Volume 42, Issue 2, Pages iii–iv, 1–101 (2011)

The Institutions of Development and the Development of Institutions

Special Edition of *Journal of International Development*

Volume 23, Issue 3, Pages 319–460 (2011)

Developmental states is a term which has been frequently used to describe countries such as; Korea, Taiwan, Singapore, Viet Nam, and Japan, who have experienced rapid economic growth through state led policies or interventions (see for example, Leftwich, 1995). The work of Peter Evans on what he calls ‘embedded autonomy’ (Evans, 1995), as well as Chalmers Johnson’s examination of the government-business relationship in Japan (Johnson, 1982, 1987), have been particularly influential in their analysis of how developmental states achieved their economic growth. The concerns of the ESID research project as well as a considerable section of the literature are, however, focused not solely on economic growth but also on inclusive development. As Leftwich points out “growth is not automatically or necessarily inclusive” (Leftwich 2008, p.4). Developmental states often do achieve a particular kind of inclusion basing their legitimacy on their developmental results measured by their citizens rising standards of living (Leftwich 2008, p.16, see also Johnson 1987, p.143). However, they have often been authoritarian states and possess what can be seen as a problematic lack of accountability (Fitz and Menocal 2007 p.536). These issues of growth, inclusion, and accountability are addressed in different ways by the pieces of work outlined in this section.

Subsections

Debates around what constitutes a developmental state, what attributes they possess and what elements make them successful are contained in the literature listed within *The Concept of the Developmental State – Relationships with Business* sub-section.

As highlighted above the term developmental states emerged out of the analysis of particular countries and has also been applied to others. A selection of this considerable body of literature exploring the developmental character (or otherwise) of particular states is laid out in the sub-section on *Developmental States - Historical Examples*.

East Asian developmental states’ impressive and relatively sustained growth records have led to an interest in the transferability of this mode of governance to other developing ‘countries’. The sub-section entitled *Building Developmental States* outlines literature which focuses on attempts to learn and implement these lessons in order to build developmental states.

The often authoritarian nature of developmental states has led to debates around the compatibility, or otherwise, of democracy and the particular state-society relations constructed within developmental regimes (Leftwich, 2005). Literature addressing these debates as well as more general discussions on the governance issues of developmental states is laid out in the *Developmental States – Governance, Public Goods and Democracy* subsection.

Further, to these governance debates interesting analysis has been conducted by the Africa Power and Politics Programme and others, addressing how patrimonial forms of governance can also perhaps be developmental (Kelsall et al, 2010; Booth and Golooba-Mutebi, 2011; Cammack and Kelsall 2010). For these discussions see the *Developmental States –Patrimonialism, Clientelism, and Patronage* sub-section.

The subsection *Developmental States and Elites* highlights literature which deals directly with the significance and emergence of elites in developmental states. These issues surrounding the role of the elite intersect with the literature in the next section on Political Settlements.

Overarching Literature on Developmental States

Developmental states in the new millennium

Special Edition of *Development Policy Review*

Volume 25, Issue 5, Pages 531–656, (2007)

Aid, Institutions and Governance: What Have We Learned?

Special Edition of *Development Policy Review*

Volume 29, Issue Supplement s1, pages s5–s251, (2011)

Embedded Autonomy: States and Industrial Transformation

Peter Evans, (1995)

Princeton University Press: Princeton, NJ

In recent years, debate on the state's economic role has too often devolved into diatribes against intervention. Peter Evans questions such simplistic views, offering a new vision of why state involvement works in some cases and produces disasters in others. To illustrate, he looks at how state agencies, local entrepreneurs, and transnational corporations shaped the emergence of computer industries in Brazil, India, and Korea during the seventies and eighties.

Evans starts with the idea that states vary in the way they are organized and tied to society. In some nations, like Zaire, the state is predatory, ruthlessly extracting and providing nothing of value in return. In others, like Korea, it is developmental, promoting industrial transformation. In still others, like Brazil and India, it is in between, sometimes helping, sometimes hindering. Evans's years of comparative research on the successes and failures of state involvement in the process of industrialization have here been crafted into a persuasive and entertaining work, which demonstrates that successful state action requires an understanding of its own limits, a realistic relationship to the global economy, and the combination of coherent internal organization and close links to society that Evans called "embedded autonomy."

[Princeton University Press Publishers Summary:

<http://press.princeton.edu/titles/5690.html>]

Methods

Theoretical Exploration

Keywords

Developmental States

State-Market Relations

State-Society Relations

Effective States

Bureaucracy

MITI and the Japanese miracle: the growth of industrial policy 1925 – 1975

Chalmers Johnson, (1982)

Stanford University Press: Stanford

This volume is in the main a institutional history of the Ministry of International Trade and Industry (MITI). However out of this historical exploration Johnson is also able to draw out some wider trends and reflect upon Japanese industrial policy and the government business relationships in Japan. Out of these explorations Johnson highlights the significance of the MITI, industrial policy and government business relations for the economic growth experienced by Japan. He is also able to point out the weakness in alternative explanations which highlight cultural factors through his in depth historical approach.

[Summary written by compiler but draws upon the review by Kent Calder (1983)]

Methods

Historical Analysis

Keywords

Developmental States

State-Market Relations

Growth

Social Sciences and the Next Development Agenda

Thandika Mkandawire, (2008)

Forum for Development Studies, Volume 35, Issue 1, Pages 101-117

The author argues that today's development agenda is animated by concerns for economic growth and structural change, democracy and human rights and social inclusion. In academia this has produced 'literatures' that separately address problems of developmental states, democratic transitions and social policy and welfare regimes. The author argues for the need to bridge these literatures to exploit the intellectual synergies to address these issues whose interconnections are widely recognized.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Public Goods

Democracy

The Developmental State

Meredith Woo-Cumings. Editor. (1998)

Cornell University Press: Ithaca, New York

[...]

The notion of the developmental state has come under attack in recent years. Critics charge that Japan's success in putting this notion into practice has not been replicated elsewhere, that the concept threatens the purity of freemarket economics, and that its shortcomings have led to financial turmoil in Asia. In this informative and thought-provoking book, a team of

distinguished scholars revisits this notion to assess its continuing utility and establish a common vocabulary for debates on these issues. Drawing on new political and economic theories and emphasizing recent events, the authors examine the East Asian experience to show how the developmental state involves a combination of political, bureaucratic, and moneyed influences that shape economic life in the region.

Taking as its point of departure Chalmers Johnson's account of the Japanese developmental state, the book explores the interplay of forces that have determined the structure of opportunity in the region. The authors critically address the argument for centralized political involvement in industrial development (with a new contribution by Johnson), describe the historical impact of colonialism and the Cold War, consider new ideas in economics, and compare the experiences of East Asian countries with those of France, Brazil, Mexico, and India.

[Abridged Cornell University Press Publishers Summary
http://www.cornellpress.cornell.edu/cup_detail.taf?ti_id=242]

Methods

Review of the literature
Case Studies

Keywords

Developmental States
State-Market Relations

State-Directed Development: Political Power and Industrialization in the Global Periphery

Atul Kohli, (2004)

Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

Why have some developing country states been more successful at facilitating industrialization than others? An answer to this question is developed by focusing both on patterns of state construction and intervention aimed at promoting industrialization. Four countries are analyzed in detail - South Korea, Brazil, India, and Nigeria - over the twentieth century. The states in these countries varied from cohesive-capitalist (mainly in Korea), through fragmented-multiclass (mainly in India), to neo-patrimonial (mainly in Nigeria). It is argued that cohesive-capitalist states have been most effective at promoting industrialization and neo-patrimonial states the least. The performance of fragmented-multiclass states falls somewhere in the middle. After explaining in detail as to why this should be so, the study traces the origins of these different state types historically, emphasizing the role of different types of colonialisms in the process of state construction in the developing world.

[Cambridge University Press Publishers Summary:
http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item1171677/?site_locale=en_GB]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Developmental States
State-Society Relations

Developmental States in the New Millennium: Concepts and Challenges for a New Aid Agenda

Verena Fritz and Alina Rocha Menocal (2007)

Development Policy Review Volume 25, Issue 5, Pages 531–552

The developmental state is back at the centre of the international policy debate. But policy-makers still have much to learn from the large research-based literature on the subject. In introducing a theme issue of *DPR* on this subject, this article provides an overview of three central topics: the relationship between the project of building or rebuilding effective states and the ‘good governance’ agenda; the role of the international aid community in stimulating or hindering state-building; and the search for a way forward which incorporates awareness of the variety of successful development models and of the role that aid inevitably plays in the incentive structure of state elites in poor developing countries.

[Authors’ Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Effective States

State Formation

Elites

External Assistance

(Re)building developmental states: from theory to practice

V. Fritz; A. Rocha Menocal (2006)

Overseas Development Institute, London

Available at: <http://www.odi.org.uk/resources/download/1568.pdf>

This paper contributes to a dialogue about the role of the state in promoting development and about what the international aid community can (and cannot) do to help build stronger, more effective and better-governed states in the developing world. It draws together academic research and recent evidence on the role of the state in developing countries and reviews how the current aid system interacts with states.

A key premise of the paper is that states – and their political economy – matter for social and economic development. The authors suggest that political economy factors and their social underpinnings lie at the heart of why some states function better than others.

The authors say that the situations emerging from the interaction of certain social and political structures in many developing settings are not favourable to development. Such structures – clientelism, patronage and populism, as well as ‘neo-patrimonialism’ and state capture – are not irreversible, but they can be deeply entrenched.

The challenge for the international community is to determine how it can best support reform efforts that interact both directly and indirectly with such structures towards the goal of creating more modern states.

Drawing on the analysis presented in the paper, the authors develop a set of implications

regarding how to move forward on supporting more effective and accountable states with a three-pronged agenda:

- bringing politics back in, and translating this into concrete policies and practices
- seriously tackling the limitations of capacity development to date
- building more incentives into the aid system for improving the quality and capacity of governments

The authors conclude with a word of caution and of optimism.

International aid is always only one among many influences affecting politics and states in recipient countries. However, in an increasingly interdependent world, there is an increasing commitment to solving development problems that have been intractable in the past.

A more balanced and analytically informed approach to the state and to the importance of the political sphere is emerging – informed also by lessons from the past – which can help to translate this commitment into more effective support.

[ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Effective States

External Assistance

Clientelism

Bringing politics back in: Towards a model of the developmental state

Adrian Leftwich, (1995)

Journal of Development Studies, Volume 31, Issue 3, Pages 400 - 427

The few cases of rapid economic growth in the Third World in the last 30 years have occurred in democratic, quasi-democratic and non-democratic polities. They are thus clearly not a function of common regime type. I suggest that they are best explained by the special character of their states, understood 'as developmental states'. This article outlines some common characteristics of these states. However the forms and features of these states are not simply a function of their administrative structures or principles of governance, but of their politics. The article thus also underlines the importance of political analysis in both development theory and policy, from where it has been extruded for too long.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Theoretical Model

Keywords

Developmental States

Thinking about developmental states in Africa

Thandika Mkandawire (2001)

Cambridge Journal of Economics, Volume 25, Pages 289-313

During much of the 1980s and 90s, a literature emerged suggesting that 'developmental states' were impossible in Africa. The arguments given ranged from cultural ones about the pervasive nature of clientalism to structural ones on the dependence of African economies or the atypical levels of rent seeking in African economies. This paper argues that Africa has had states that were 'developmental' in both their aspirations and economic performance. It further argues that these experiences need to be examined critically for useful lesson, an exercise that has been hindered by an excessive levelling of the African political and economic landscapes.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Clientelism

The state they're in: an agenda for international action on poverty in Africa

(Second Edition)

Matthew Lockwood, (2005)

Practical Action Publications: Rugby

The book draws on a substantial body of research to argue that much thinking on Africa--from both official donors and from international NGOs alike--is flawed, because that thinking either does not recognize or does not draw out the implications of the central role of politics and the state in Africa's development problems. In almost all African countries the political elites are uninterested in leading a development process. Western donor countries and institutions have largely turned a blind eye to this situation, and indeed aid has become an important resource in maintaining anti-developmental states. By contrast, in almost all other successful development episodes--such as in East Asia--the state has played a key role. This book places the arguments in the context of the Make Poverty History campaign of 2005, the outcomes of the G8 summit in Gleneagles, and the WTO summit in Hong Kong. It also broadens the scope to address the American approach to aid and the new "transformational diplomacy" agenda.

[Book Summary From Google Books:

[http://books.google.co.uk/books?id=xg62AAAAIAAJ&q=The+State+They%27re+in&dq=The+State+They%27re+in&hl=en&ei=JpW4Tb6kApSn8QPfjohQ&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&ved=0CDIQ6AEwAA\]](http://books.google.co.uk/books?id=xg62AAAAIAAJ&q=The+State+They%27re+in&dq=The+State+They%27re+in&hl=en&ei=JpW4Tb6kApSn8QPfjohQ&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&ved=0CDIQ6AEwAA)

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Elites

Institutions

External Assistance

The Developmental State in Africa: Problems and Prospects

Peter Meyns and Charity Musamba. Editors. (2010)

Institute for Development and Peace, Report 101/2010

Against the background of successful developmental experiences in East Asia this report discusses the relevance of the developmental state concept to conditions in Africa. In her contribution Charity Musamba reviews the main theoretical literature on the developmental state and identifies four key features which have informed successful implementation in East Asian countries. With regard to Africa, she challenges the “impossibility theorem” and supports African analysts who defend the need for a *democratic* developmental state in Africa. Peter Meyns analyzes the development path of an African country, Botswana, which – not withstanding certain weaknesses – can be seen as an example of a successful developmental state in the African context.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Case Study

Keywords

Developmental States

Developmental States - The Government Business Relationship

Governing the Market: Economic Theory and the Role of Government in East Asian Industrialization

Robert Wade, (2003)

Princeton University Press: Princeton

Published originally in 1990 to critical acclaim, Robert Wade's *Governing the Market* quickly established itself as a standard in contemporary political economy. In it, Wade challenged claims both of those who saw the East Asian story as a vindication of free market principles and of those who attributed the success of Taiwan and other countries to government intervention. Instead, Wade turned attention to the way allocation decisions were divided between markets and public administration and the synergy between them. Now, in a new introduction to this paperback edition, Wade reviews the debate about industrial policy in East and Southeast Asia and chronicles the changing fortunes of these economies over the 1990s. He extends the original argument to explain the boom of the first half of the decade and the crash of the second, stressing the links between corporations, banks, governments, international capital markets, and the International Monetary Fund. From this, Wade goes on to outline a new agenda for national and international development policy.

[Princeton University Press Publisher's Summary: <http://press.princeton.edu/titles/4724.html>]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

State-Market Relations

Developmental States

Growth

The Changing State–Market Condominium in East Asia: Rethinking the Political Underpinnings of Development

Geoffrey R.D. Underhill and Xiaoke Zhang, (2005)

New Political Economy, Volume 10, Issue 1, Pages 1-24

This article addresses the long-running debate concerning the changing nature of state–society relations in the development process in East Asia and elsewhere in the developing world. It affords a critical re-examination of the developmental state model that has become central to the study of the politics of economic growth and achieved the status of a dominant paradigm in international policy circles. The relationship between state institutions and private market agents, as portrayed in the model, is viewed as one of two analytically distinctive entities—a state–market dichotomy that obscures as much as it illuminates the political underpinnings of development. Recent revisionist efforts have critically reviewed the developmental state claims about state–society relations and provided a more nuanced view of the complex and interdependent interaction between states and markets that has shaped industrialisation policies in East Asia. This article argues that while the revisionist efforts have correctly emphasised the importance of state–market interactions in the development process there is still a further and crucial conceptual step to take in order to move beyond the developmental state thesis and to overcome the conceptual constraints of the state–market distinction. The concept of the state–market condominium is proposed as an alternative approach to the political economy of development and argues that the experience of East Asia can be more fruitfully theorised if states and markets are viewed as an integrated ensemble of governance.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

State-Society Relations

State-Market Relations

Developmental States

Beyond Institutions: Institutions and organizations in the politics and economics of growth and poverty reduction – a thematic synthesis of research evidence

Adrian Leftwich and Kunal Sen, (2010)

Available at: [http://www.ippg.org.uk/8933_Beyond%20Institutions.final%20\(1\).pdf](http://www.ippg.org.uk/8933_Beyond%20Institutions.final%20(1).pdf)

“Institutions are the formal and informal ‘*rules of the game*’ that shape, but do not determine, human behaviour in economic, social and political life. For more than 20 years it has been argued that institutions matter for growth and poverty reduction as well as for political stability and inclusive social development. The IPPG Research Consortium set out to examine the practical implications through a broad range of economic, political and social research, including projects on state-business relations in India and Africa, land reform in Malawi, contract labour in India and contract farming in Nigeria, territorial development in Latin America and a case study of privatisation, agri-business and the institutional constraints on small farmers in Mali.”

[...]

“Organizations aggregate and articulate interests, whether they are business or professional associations, trades unions, political movements, farmers’ organizations, women’s coalitions or

other formal or informal groups. They are therefore the critical political links between citizens and the decision-making organs of the state. Hence while it is true that ‘institutions matter’, individuals and organizations matter too, for it is they who forge, maintain, implement and change institutions.”

[...]

[Abridged Executive Summary]

Methods

Review of Research

Keywords

Developmental States

State-Market Relations

Institutions

Institutions and growth in East Asia

Stephan Haggard, (2004)

Studies in Comparative International Development, Volume 38, Issue 4, Pages 53-81

Institutions have played a central role in political economy explanations of East Asia’s growth, from the developmental state to the micro-institutions of industrial policy. A review of these institutional explanations finds that few if any of the postulated institutional explanations involve either necessary or sufficient conditions for rapid growth. This finding suggests two conclusions. First, there are multiple institutional means for solving the various collective action, credibility, and informational problems that constitute barriers to growth. The search for a single institutional “taproot” of growth is likely to be a misguided exercise, and more attention should be given to understanding the varieties of capitalism in East Asia. Second, institutions are themselves endogenous to other political factors that appear more consequential for growth, including particularly the nature of the relationship between the state and the private sector.

[Author’s Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Institutions

Growth

State-Market Relations

State-Business Relations and Economic Growth in sub-Saharan Africa: A review of case studies in Ghana, Mauritius, South Africa and Zambia

Dirk Willem te Velde with Adrian Leftwich, (2010)

Improving Institutions for Pro-Poor Growth (IPPG), University of Manchester

Available at: <http://www.ippg.org.uk/publications.html>

“When the state and business interact effectively they can promote a more efficient allocation of scarce resources, appropriate industrial policy and a more effective and prioritised removal of key obstacles to growth, than when the two sides fail to co-operate or engage in harmful collusion. A major challenge which the cluster of research on state business relations (as part of

IPPG) has addressed is to understand the relationship between state-business relations and economic performance. This paper synthesises four African case studies which cover four broad areas: 1) The drivers of state-business relations (SBRs); 2) measures of SBRs; 3) economic functions of SBRs; and 4) effects of SBRs. Whilst the case studies employ different methodologies and methods, this categorisation is a useful lens to analyse the findings of the case studies.

[...]

The studies have a number of take-away messages. For academics, the case studies provided new ways (methods and methodologies) of examining growth by including SBRs (empirical examinations rooted in theory). For government policy makers, whilst it is known that informal networks matter, formalised ways of engaging with business can also be useful for economic development. For business leaders, engaging in a well informed democratic conversation with government helps (and pays for itself); SMEs feel under-represented in meetings with government. And for donor agencies, it is important to consider SBRs in donor advice on economic development and in governance indices.”

[Abridged Executive Summary]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Growth

State-Market Relations

Effective state-business relations, industrial policy and economic growth

Dirk Willem te Velde, Editor. (2010)

Improving Institutions for Pro-Poor Growth (IPPG), University of Manchester

Available at: <http://www.ippg.org.uk/publications.html>

“This collection of essays by internationally distinguished scholars discusses the nature of state-business relations (SBRs) and the links between SBRs and economic performance. It is generally accepted that economic growth directly depends on economic fundamentals such as skills and capital formation as well as the efficiency through which factors of production are put together. But beyond this, the briefings in this publication all bring out that the nature of state-business relations is a crucial factor behind efficient skills development, capital formation and ultimately higher productivity and incomes. But there is considerable debate about how the effects work, whether current state-business relations are conducive to or hamper economic performance, and about how the nature of state-business relations conditions the conduct of more active policies encouraging economic growth.

This study is the result of the work of researchers linked through the Research Programme Consortium for Improving Institutions for Pro-Poor Growth (IPPG) which conducted research from 2005-2010. The study of state-business relations (SBRs) was at the heart of the Consortium. Relationships between states and business are usefully understood as giving rise to and reflecting both economic and political institutions. Economic, because SBRs embody formal and informal rules and regulations that are designed to perform economic functions, such as solving information-related market and coordination failures, and hence will affect the allocative and dynamic efficiency of the economy. Political, because SBRs reflect the way in which power among different agents, elites and coalitions of interest is shared. This manifests itself in both

formal and informal institutional arrangements between the private sector (e.g. business associations, including organised farmer groups) and the public sector (e.g. different ministries or departments of state, politicians and bureaucrats). IPPG devoted one of three clusters of work to the study of SBRs covering sub-Saharan Africa and India.

This publication consists of three main parts. Part A introduces theoretical aspects of the study of SBRs. Part B examines two technical and methodological aspects that have been at the forefront of the study of SBRs: how to measure SBRs and how to deal with endogeneity concerns in the relationship between SBRs and economic performance. This part is designed specifically for quantitative specialists. Part C discusses the findings, evidence and policy suggestions of IPPG research on SBRs and major work related to SBRs. A set of conclusions follows.

[...]"

[Extract from Introduction and Overview of Study]

Methods

Review of Literature
Review of Research
Case Studies

Keywords

State-Market Relations
Growth
Effective States

Tungurahua: An alternative means of economic development - Final report

Marcela Alvarado, Gloria Camacho, Diego Carrion, Manuel Chiriboga, Patric Hollenstein, Carlos Larrea, Ana Isabel Larrea, Silvia Matuk, Ana Lucia Torres and Pablo Ospina Peralta (coordinator). (2010)

Improving Institutions for Pro-Poor Growth (IPPG), University of Manchester

Available at: <http://www.ippg.org.uk/publications.html>

This research project draws on a previous study into Ecuadorian territorial economic dynamics which identified areas where there was evidence of socially inclusive economic growth (Larrea et al 2008). The study endeavoured to identify appropriate areas to select as case studies during the second phase of the research. Accordingly, the study analysed poverty, social inequality and local economic growth in Ecuador between 1990-1995 and 2001-2006. This was based on district social maps, drawn up with the aim of identifying territorial dynamics on a micro-regional scale. The research focused on three social variables, applied at district level: incidence of poverty and indigence; social inequality, as measured by the Gini coefficient; and family consumption per individual. Districts are the smallest administrative divisions in the country. In 1995 there were 995 districts in Ecuador - with the exception of towns, where a municipal scale is applied.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Quantitative Analysis

Keywords

Growth
Poverty
Inclusion

Politics and Growth

Gareth Williams, Alex Duncan, Pierre Landell-Mills, and Sue Unsworth, (2011)

Development Policy Review, Volume 29, Issue Supplement s1, Pages s28–s55

Theories of growth have made progress in understanding the mechanisms of growth in economic terms. However, there is less understanding of the political processes that enable or obstruct these mechanisms. This article provides a four-stage framework to clarify and analyse the connections between politics and growth: (i) discussing the basic conditions essential for growth; (ii) suggesting that whether or not these conditions emerge depends on specific forms of public-private interaction; (iii) linking these relationships to the incentives facing those in political power and investors; and (iv) considering the factors at country level that may help to push incentives in a pro-growth direction.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Growth

State-Society Relations

State-Market Relations

State, Business and Growth in Post-Apartheid South Africa

Nicoli Nattrass and Jeremy Seekings (2010)

Research Programme Consortium on Improving Institutions for Pro-Poor Growth (IPPG), Discussion Paper No. 34

Available at: <http://www.ippg.org.uk/publications.html>

This paper explores the relationship between 'state-business relations' (SBRs) and pro-poor growth in South Africa. It provides a history of business organization and the role of the large corporations in facilitating the democratic transition and creating a momentum for the development of post-apartheid tripartite negotiating institutions notably the National Economic, Development and Labour Council (Nedlac). Nedlac, however, failed to live up to its promise as a forum for forging consensual socioeconomic policies. We suggest that this was because the Congress of South African Trade Unions (Cosatu) was in an alliance with the ruling African National Congress (ANC) and thus could by-pass Nedlac altogether and pursue its labour-market policy objectives directly with the Ministry of Labour. Whilst the Treasury promoted business-friendly policies, the Ministry of Labour promoted pro (organised labour) policies; a policy incoherence which exacerbated the post-apartheid unemployment crisis. This undermined collective action on the part of business – as did subsequent black economic empowerment (BEE) policies which incentivised the emerging black business elite to pursue individual rather than collective agendas with government. This undermined the collective action required for a genuine social accord or tripartite consensus necessary for the emergence of a development coalition for pro-poor (i.e. employment-oriented) growth.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Poverty
Elites
Developmental States
Effective States
Political Settlements

State-business relations and pro-poor growth in South Africa

Jeremy Seekings, and Nicoli Nattrass, (2011)

Journal of International Development, Volume 23, Issue 3, Pages 338–357

By comparison with most African countries, post-apartheid South Africa appears to be characterised by growth-oriented cooperation between state and business. Economic growth has remained weak, however, and income poverty persists as the economy continues down an inequalitarian growth path that fails to reduce unemployment and thus has little effect on poverty. This paper argues that the appearance of close state-business relations is misleading: selectively pro-market public policies have not reflected a pro-business orientation on the part of the state. The governing African National Congress concurred with established business on the need for increased productivity and selective state interventions in a mixed economy. But most of the political elite overestimated the commandist powers of the state in the short-term, viewed established South African business with deep suspicion if not hostility, and was unwilling to deliberate or negotiate on distributional issues in either formal bilateral or corporatist institutions, or even informally. The state sought to discipline and transform business, not work with it. Unable to sustain an active growth coalition, a pro-poor, developmental coalition was far out of reach. The politics of the governing party precluded substantive concessions on labour market regulation and pushed it towards ever more interventionist 'black economic empowerment' policies. The result was that economic growth remained modest, and of little benefit to the poor.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

State-Market Relations
State-Society Relations
Poverty
Political Settlements
Developmental States

Are State Business Relations important to Economic Growth? Evidence from Mauritius

Sawkut Rojid, Boopen Seetanah and Ramessur Shalini, (2010)

Research Programme Consortium on Improving Institutions for Pro-Poor Growth (IPPG), Discussion Paper No. 36

Available at: <http://www.ippg.org.uk/publications.html>

This paper examines the role of an effective 'State Business Relations' (SBR) in promoting economic performance for the case of Mauritius. Rigorous dynamic time series analysis, a so called VAR framework, is used to address the dynamic and endogeneity issue normally present in

growth modelling. The results show that SBRs have a positive and significant effect on output in Mauritius in the long run with an implied elasticity of 0.18. Private capital is the most important factor for growth followed by openness and the quality of labour. These results also apply to the short run. Moreover we suggest it is important to include a dynamic specification in growth modelling. Interestingly SBRs also appear to have an indirect effect on output in the short-run via 'the private capital channel'. As such SBR can also promote further openness of the country.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Statistical Analysis

Keywords

Growth

Developmental States

State-Market Relations

State-Business Relations and Economic Performance in Ghana

Charles Ackah, Ernest Aryeetey, Joseph Ayee and Ezekiel Clottey, (2010)

Research Programme Consortium on Improving Institutions for Pro-Poor Growth (IPPG),
Discussion Paper No. 35

Available at: <http://www.ippg.org.uk/publications.html>

[...] This study used a multi-disciplinary approach that included both qualitative and quantitative aspects of the disciplines of political science, economics, history, sociology and organizational management. To seek to understand what constitutes effective state-business relations, and to assess how state-business relations are related to economic performance, the study relied on historical institutionalist inductive theories- comparative historical analysis and path-dependence, among others. For this analysis, the study relied on both primary data, from interviews with selected formal and informal enterprises and regulatory agencies within Ghana, and secondary data derived from a review of statutory literature [...] The purpose here was to examine the characteristics of formal and informal rules and regulations governing the establishment and operation of foreign and indigenous businesses, how these have evolved over time and how they may have impacted economic performance.

For the quantitative economic analysis, the study used a panel of 256 Ghanaian manufacturing firms over the period 1991-2002 to analyze the extent to which an effective state-business relationship is beneficial to economic performance. Focusing on total factor productivity, we have found that an effective State Business Relations (SBR) or a sound investment climate correlates positively with better firm performance, possibly channelled via a more optimal allocation of resources in the economy. [...]

[...]

Overall, our findings contribute to understanding the link between an effective state-business relations and economic performance. [...] Apart from the positive effect of SBRs on economic performance, the other lesson which can be drawn from the paper is that even though successive governments in Ghana have shown some commitment to supporting a viable private sector that commitment has, at the same time, been undermined by governments' own fear of a strong private sector acting as a countervailing force and thereby weakening their monopoly over neo-

patrimonialism. Consequently, the commitment may be seen as a public relations hoax. An effective SBR in Ghana requires sustained formalized political commitment to policies that sees the private sector as a catalyst and initiator of pro-poor growth and development.

[Abridged Author's Abstract]

Methods

Interviews

Statistical Analysis

Keywords

Growth

State-Market Relations

DPR Debate: Growth Identification and Facilitation: The Role of the State in the Dynamics of Structural Change

Justin Lin, Célestin Monga, Dirk Willem te Velde, Suresh D. Tendulkar, Alice Amsden, K. Y. Amoako, Howard Pack, and Wonhyuk Lim, (2011)

Development Policy Review, Volume 29, Issue 3, Pages 259–310

World Bank Working Paper Available at: [http://www-](http://www-wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/IW3P/IB/2010/05/18/000158349_20100518154747/Rendered/PDF/WPS5313.pdf)

[wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/IW3P/IB/2010/05/18/000158349_20100518154747/Rendered/PDF/WPS5313.pdf](http://www-wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/IW3P/IB/2010/05/18/000158349_20100518154747/Rendered/PDF/WPS5313.pdf)

This *DPR Debate* is based on the contribution by Justin Lin, Chief Economist at the World Bank, and his colleague Célestin Monga, on 'Growth Identification and Facilitation: The Role of the State in the Dynamics of Structural Change'. The article under consideration is important and timely as it articulates a number of new policy implications from Justin Lin's earlier work on New Structural Economics, which was discussed in a previous *DPR debate* (Lin and Chang, 2009). This symposium contains the article and comments on it from five distinguished specialists, and closes with a rejoinder by Lin and Monga. This introduction discusses the article, the comments and the rejoinder.

The historical record indicates that, in all successful economies, the state has always played an important role in facilitating structural change and helping the private sector sustain it across time. This article puts forward a new approach to help policy-makers in developing countries identify those industries that may hold latent comparative advantage, and recommends ways of removing binding constraints to facilitate private firms' entry into those industries. Two types of government interventions are distinguished: first, policies that facilitate structural change by overcoming information, co-ordination and externality issues, which are intrinsic to industrial upgrading and diversification; and second, policies aimed at protecting certain selected firms and industries that defy the comparative advantage determined by the existing endowment structure.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Debate

Keywords

State-Market Relations

Change

Effective States

After the Crisis: Industrial Policy and the Developmental State in Low-Income Countries

Robert Wade, (2010)

Global Policy, Volume 1, Issue 2, Pages 150 -161

The current global economic crisis has been disastrous for many millions of people. But it has also had the desirable effect of prompting a little more skepticism towards the economic beliefs that have constituted the mainstream view about public economic strategy for the past three decades, both in the major western states and in international lending organizations like the World Bank and the IMF. They have at their core the proposition that ‘government failure is generally worse than market failure’, which supports the default policy setting of ‘more free market’ in most countries most of the time. The new crisis-induced skepticism is good news because the previous confidence rested more on what J. S. Mill called ‘the deep slumber of a settled opinion’ than on a solid empirical base. The present article begins by summarizing some powerful pieces of evidence that challenge core mainstream propositions in the context of developing countries, which have received less attention than they deserve. Having shown why the mainstream prescription for the role of government in development is questionable, the article describes some key points about the nature of industrial policy in East Asia and about the general rationale for a certain kind of industrial policy even where state capacity is relatively weak. The rationale is all the stronger in the world economy after the crisis, when a major surge of innovation around energy, water, nanotechnology and genetics is likely, rendering many existing specializations unviable. The article then presents an argument about the institutional arrangements of a ‘developmental state’ through which national strategies can be formed and implemented. It ends by describing small signs of new flexibility in World Bank and IMF thinking.

[Author’s Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Growth

Developmental States – Historical Examples

Political Institutions and Economic Performance: The Government-Business Relationship in Japan, South Korea, and Taiwan

Chalmers Johnson (1987)

In The Political Economy of the New Asian Industrialisation Frederic C. Deyo. Editor.

Cornell University Press: Ithaca, NY

Johnson examines aspects of the political and social context which accompanied the exceptional economic performance of Japan, South Korea and Taiwan, focussing on the relationship between the government and business. This exploration brings to light the positive role that state planning, policy and intervention played in these cases and serves to question the proposition that state intervention distorts and damages economies. Johnson moves on to examine what elements made the role of the state so positive in these cases and highlights several key factors which he argues were positively influential and can be discussed as a ‘structural model of East-Asian high-growth systems’. Aspects of this model include the existence of a

developmental elite, which enables the emergence of a bureaucratic elite who are insulated from political demands and are thus able to focus on achieving developmental ends without interference. The separation of this elite from political pressure is in part made possible by a “public-private agreement on economic goals” (p.138) which engender cooperation and assist in the attainment of growth. However, he also argues that a ‘pilot planning agency’ which takes on the role of planning and guiding movement towards growth is a vital aspect of ensuring that this end is achieved. Moreover, he sees the success of these states also rests on the uptake of policies to ensure wealth distribution across the population.

The chapter also raises the issue of the authoritarian nature of these states, which Johnson sees as an essential part of their success in allowing for the bureaucracy to remain autonomous from political pressure, and providing the opportunity to take a long term view. However, he does not view all authoritarian states as developmental. Rather he sees the success of the states examined as emanating from the fact that “they have discovered ways to surmount the rigidities of zero-sum domestic competition without falling into the trap of authoritarian displacement of the market and private enterprise” (p. 164).

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Developmental States

State-Market Relations

State Formation

State-Society Relations

Systemic Vulnerability and the Origins of Developmental States: Northeast and Southeast Asia in Comparative Perspective

Richard F. Doner, Bryan K. Ritchie, and Dan Slater (2005)

International Organization Volume 59, Pages 327-361

Scholars of development have learned a great deal about what economic institutions do, but much less about the origins of such arrangements. This article introduces and assesses a new political explanation for the origins of “developmental states”—organizational complexes in which expert and coherent bureaucratic agencies collaborate with organized private sectors to spur national economic transformation. Conventional wisdom holds that developmental states in South Korea, Taiwan, and Singapore result from “state autonomy,” especially from popular pressures. We argue that these states’ impressive capacities actually emerged from the challenges of delivering side payments to restive popular sectors under conditions of extreme geopolitical insecurity and severe resource constraints. Such an interactive condition of “systemic vulnerability” never confronted ruling elites in Indonesia, Malaysia, the Philippines, or Thailand—allowing them to uphold political coalitions, and hence to retain power, with much less ambitious state-building efforts.

[Author’s Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Case Studies

Keywords

Developmental States
State-Society Relations
State Formation

Colonial Legacies: Economic and Social Development in East and Southeast Asia

Anne E. Booth, (2007)

University of Hawai'i Press: Honolulu

It is well known that Taiwan and South Korea, both former Japanese colonies, achieved rapid growth and industrialization after 1960. The performance of former European and American colonies (Malaysia, Singapore, Burma, Vietnam, Laos, Cambodia, Indonesia, and the Philippines) has been less impressive. Some scholars have attributed the difference to better infrastructure and greater access to education in Japan's colonies. Anne Booth examines and critiques such arguments in this ambitious comparative study of economic development in East and Southeast Asia from the beginning of the twentieth century until the 1960s.

Booth takes an in-depth look at the nature and consequences of colonial policies for a wide range of factors, including the growth of export-oriented agriculture and the development of manufacturing industry. She evaluates the impact of colonial policies on the growth and diversification of the market economy and on the welfare of indigenous populations. Indicators such as educational enrolments, infant mortality rates, and crude death rates are used to compare living standards across East and Southeast Asia in the 1930s. Her analysis of the impact that Japan's Greater Asian Co-Prosperity Sphere and later invasion and conquest had on the region and the living standards of its people leads to a discussion of the painful and protracted transition to independence following Japan's defeat. Throughout Booth emphasizes the great variety of economic and social policies pursued by the various colonial governments and the diversity of outcomes.

Lucidly and accessibly written, *Colonial Legacies* offers a balanced and elegantly nuanced exploration of a complex historical reality. It will be a lasting contribution to scholarship on the modern economic history of East and Southeast Asia and of special interest to those concerned with the dynamics of development and the history of colonial regimes.

[University of Hawai'i Press Publisher's Summary:

<http://www.uhpress.hawaii.edu/shopcore/978-0-8248-3161-5/>]

Methods

Comparative
Historical Analysis

Keywords

Developmental States
Bureaucracy

The Developmental State and Beyond: The Case of China

Yu Jian-xing and Shi De-jin, (2010)

Fudan Journal of the Humanities and Social Sciences, Volume 3, Issue 4, Pages 42-66

Based on the discussion of the concept of the developmental state and the socialist developmental state, this article describes and analyzes the development process of China's economy and society since the reform and opening from the perspective of state transformation, and explores the deep-level causes of the difficulties contemporary China is facing in its economic and social development. It argues that the Chinese state has gradually become a developmental state with a new form, which has played an important role in promoting the development of China's economy and society but meanwhile has brought some negative impacts. China has made many efforts to go beyond the developmental state, and achieved notable success in various aspects since 2002, but there are still many problems, especially when struck by the 2008 world financial crisis; the negative impacts of the developmental state are gradually emerging. Moreover, the Chinese government still tends to sidestep some systemic and structural problems, and some policies are in fact consolidating the dominance of the old system, which will inevitably increase the difficulties for the Chinese state to go beyond the developmental state.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Awakening Giants, Feet of Clay: Assessing the Economic Rise of China and India

Pranab Bardhan, (2010)

Princeton University Press: Princeton

The recent economic rise of China and India has attracted a great deal of attention--and justifiably so. Together, the two countries account for one-fifth of the global economy and are projected to represent a full third of the world's income by 2025. Yet, many of the views regarding China and India's market reforms and high growth have been tendentious, exaggerated, or oversimplified. *Awakening Giants, Feet of Clay* scrutinizes the phenomenal rise of both nations, and demolishes the myths that have accumulated around the economic achievements of these two giants in the last quarter century. Exploring the challenges that both countries must overcome to become true leaders in the international economy, Pranab Bardhan looks beyond short-run macroeconomic issues to examine and compare China and India's major policy changes, political and economic structures, and current general performance.

Bardhan investigates the two countries' economic reforms, each nation's pattern and composition of growth, and the problems afflicting their agricultural, industrial, infrastructural, and financial sectors. He considers how these factors affect China and India's poverty, inequality, and environment, how political factors shape each country's pattern of burgeoning capitalism, and how significant poverty reduction in both countries is mainly due to domestic factors--not global integration, as most would believe. He shows how authoritarianism has distorted Chinese development while democratic governance in India has been marred by severe accountability failures.

Full of valuable insights, *Awakening Giants, Feet of Clay* provides a nuanced picture of China and India's complex political economy at a time of startling global reconfiguration and change.

[Princeton University Press Publisher's Summary:

http://books.google.co.uk/books?id=WvgW3B3XEsAC&printsec=frontcover&dq=Bardhan&hl=en&ei=Sh_TajvMcKu8QPDmPypCQ&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&ved=0CCsQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q&f=false]

Methods

Comparative

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Growth

Effective States

The transformation of the developmental state and economic reform in Korea

Haeran Lim, (2010)

Journal of Contemporary Asia, Volume 40, Issues 2, Pages 188-210

This paper analyses the political economy of economic reform and the ways in which the characteristics of developmental states have been changed in this reform process. It does this with attention to the experience of structural transformation in the manufacturing, information technology and financial sectors in Korea. Using the coalition theory of policy reform, the main finding from these cases is that the relationships among politicians, bureaucrats and interest groups have been altered so that interest groups' power has been strengthened compared to politicians and bureaucrats. Although a crisis is important in promoting economic reform, broader-ranging trends, such as democratisation, globalisation and technological progress, have also been important fundamental forces. Even with change, the reform process in Korea continues to reflect the legacies of the developmental state, with the state still playing an important role in planning, implementing and sustaining economic reform

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

State-Society Relations

Bureaucracy

Developmental States

The developmental state in the era of globalization: beyond the Northeast Asian model of political economy

Shigeko Hayashi, (2010)

Pacific Review, Volume 23, Issue 1, Pages 45-69

Criticism of the developmental state can be divided into two categories. One is the neoliberal position that criticizes the efficacy of the developmental state model itself. According to this view, the developmental state was not an important factor in East Asian development and the adoption of industrial policy would in fact be detrimental to developing countries. A second

critical position concedes that a degree of achievement was indeed attained by the developmental state in the past, but argues that the developmental state model is no longer a viable option today. This position holds that the high level of government intervention in successful East Asian countries more or less contributed to their economic development, but that this policy is no longer feasible. While deepening globalization in the world economy is regarded as inimical to the developmental state, some also argue that the developmental state model could only have worked during the Cold War and could not function in today's international political and economic climate. Despite these negative observations, the purpose of this article is to demonstrate the viability of the developmental state model. First, the article supports the statist position by broadening the scope of the argument: developmental states exist not only in Northeast Asia, but also in Southeast Asia, and the East Asian authoritarian regimes had a role in economic development. Second, this article directly counters new criticism of the developmental state. It argues that the developmental state model is still an effective development strategy in the post-Cold War period and even in the era of globalization: the model was useful in East Asia, and could be useful beyond East Asia.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Effective States

The Rise of "The Rest": Challenges to the West from Late-Industrializing Economies

Alice H. Amsden, (2004)

Oxford University Press: Oxford

After World War II a select number of countries outside Japan and the West--those that Alice Amsden calls "the rest"--gained market share in modern industries and altered global competition. By 2000, a great divide had developed within "the rest", the lines drawn according to prewar manufacturing experience and equality in income distribution. China, India, Korea and Taiwan had built their own national manufacturing enterprises that were investing heavily in R&D. Their developmental states had transformed themselves into champions of science and technology. By contrast, Argentina, Brazil and Mexico had experienced a wave of acquisitions and mergers that left even more of their leading enterprises controlled by multinational firms. The developmental states of Mexico and Turkey had become hand-tied by membership in NAFTA and the European Union. Which model of late industrialization will prevail, the "independent" or the "integrationist," is a question that challenges the twenty-first century.

[Oxford University Press Publisher's Summary:

<http://ukcatalogue.oup.com/product/9780195170597.do>]

Methods

Comparative

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Growth

State, Institutions and Development: The Korean Model and the Interpretation of the Asian Crisis

Alexandre Queiroz Guimaraes, (2009)

Revista de Sociologia e Politica, Volume 17, Issue 34, Pages 301-318

The present article is part of a theoretical line that researches the relationship between institutions, the State & economic performance. Its central object is the study of Developmental States, that is, interventionist states that performed a central role in the development strategies of certain countries. In spite of the numerous historical analyses that have been carried out regarding these experiences, the theme is considered controversial & many economists are reluctant in accepting that such states made any positive contribution. The article therefore deals with a theme that is very dear to economic science from the upstart, the relationship between State & market & its impact on the "wealth of nations." It attempts to contribute to this issue through a critique of more abstract analyses geared toward interpretation of the Asian model & the 1997 crisis. Identifying a methodological flaw in these analyses, we argue that the crisis cannot be deduced from possible institutional weaknesses in the South Korean model. Institutional characteristics, including the developmental State & large entrepreneurial groups, were the central variables used to explain South Korea's major success in the decades that followed 1960. In this regard, the difficulties of the 1990s should be interpreted as the result of a hurried process of economic liberalization & deregulation, implemented before a new regulatory structure to substitute earlier forms of regulation could be established. In refusing certain interpretations of the crisis, this article emphasizes the importance of recognizing the institutional specificities of different countries & the existence of different types of capitalism. The South Korean case, just as the Japanese one, reveals a model of capitalism in which the Developmental State played an extremely active role, constituting a fundamental variable for explaining the major success that these countries' development strategies were able to achieve.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Developmental States

State-Society Relations

State-Market Relations

Growth

Developmental States in East Asia: A Comparison of the Japanese and Chinese Experiences

Mark Beeson, (2009)

Asian Perspective, Volume 33, Issue 2, Pages 5-39

In the aftermath of the East Asian crisis and Japan's prolonged economic downturn, many observers considered that East Asia's distinctive model of state-led development had become redundant and irrelevant. And yet not only have aspects of this model persisted in Japan despite attempts to reform it, but China is actively embracing elements of neo-mercantilism and state interventionism that owe much to the Japanese exemplar. Even more strikingly, China's success and the influence of the "Beijing consensus" are encouraging other countries to follow suit. This article explores the trajectory of East Asian forms of developmentalism and suggests that reports of their death may prove premature.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Comparative
Review of the literature
Case Studies

Keywords

Developmental States

Whither the Developmental State? Explaining Singapore's continued Developmentalism

Alexius A. Pereira, (2008)

Third World Quarterly, Volume 29, Issue 6, Pages 1189-1203

This paper examines why the Singapore developmental state, unlike the other East Asian developmental states, has shown no signs of devolving but instead appears to be strengthening its position within society by embarking upon several 'post-industrial' economic programmes. By utilising a class relations perspective, the paper argues that the resilience of the Singapore developmental state results from the continued weakness of the domestic capitalist class as well as from the state's collaboration with transnational capital and government-linked corporations. At the same time the working class has continuously been 'incorporated' by the state. To illustrate these processes, the paper examines Singapore's Biomedical Sciences Initiative, and the Work Restructuring Scheme, which have reinforced the supremacy of the Singapore developmental state, particularly in the economic sphere. The paper concludes that developmental states need not necessarily devolve, if they can continue to provide economic growth as well as to carefully 'manage' class relations in society.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Review of the literature
Case Studies

Keywords

Developmental States
State-Society Relations
Political Settlements

Night watchman, extractive, or developmental states? Some evidence from late colonial south-east Asia

Anne Booth, (2007)

Economic History Review, Volume 60, Number 2, Pages 241-266

The article examines aspects of government policy in different parts of colonial south-east Asia, and in nominally independent Siam (Thailand) in the first four decades of the twentieth century. The emphasis is on taxation and expenditure policies, and their implications for the development of infrastructure and also for the welfare of indigenous populations. Attention is also given to the impact of government regulation of both factor and product markets. On the basis of the empirical evidence, the article argues that the traditional view of the colonial state as a 'night watchman' was not applicable to most parts of south-east Asia after 1900. Governments were

increasingly involved in implementing policies that today would be considered developmental, including building infrastructure and improving access to secular education and modern health care for the indigenous populations. But given the resources that they had, or had the potential to mobilize, more could have been achieved.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Review of literature
Historical Case Studies

Keywords

Developmental States
Taxation
State-Society Relations

Power and Developmental Regimes in Singapore, China and Malaysia

Alexius Pereira, and Chee Kiong Tong, (2005)

Global Economic Review, Volume 34, Number 1, Pages 129-144

This paper examines three developmental regimes in Singapore, China & Malaysia. In these three cases, heavy state intervention was necessary because their economies required significant economic restructuring. For Singapore, state intervention was necessary for the process of industrial transformation. For Malaysia, state intervention was necessary because the government wanted to reallocate economic resources as a means to deal with ethnic conflict. For China, state intervention was necessary in order to gradually "marketize" the socialist economy. The paper also briefly discusses the impact of the Asian Financial Crisis (1997-1999) on these developmental regimes. It finds that for all three cases, economic restructuring was successful because of long-term & heavy state intervention. It explains that, unlike the other developmental states of Asia, these developmental regimes were able to undertake such significant restructuring because of the state's power base, which even managed to survive the Asian Financial Crisis. It concludes with some comments about the future of state intervention in a rapidly globalizing world.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Review of the literature
Case Studies

Keywords

Developmental States
State-Society Relations
State-Market Relations

Globalization, "New Tigers," and the End of the Developmental State? The Case of the Celtic Tiger

Denis O'Hearn, (2000)

Politics and Society, Volume 28, Issue 1, Pages 67-92

Examines Ireland's rapid economic growth over the 1990s, suggesting it represents a neoliberal alternative that challenges most familiar developmental explanations. The nature of Ireland's success is described, along with major approaches to developmental states, especially Peter Evans's work on embedded autonomy (1995). The impact of globalization on the ability of developmental states to achieve rapid economic growth is explored, & the recent experience in southern Ireland is compared to other developmental states, as well as to its own problematic economic past. It is argued that certain aspects of Irish growth cast doubt on its sustainability, especially its dependence on foreign investments from a limited range of sectors. Social instability stemming from the unequal distribution of economic gains is discussed, & Sean O Riain's (1999) concept of the flexible developmental state is drawn on to examine potential developmental roles for states under neoliberalism. It is determined that the neoliberal development model is becoming increasingly limited, & the Irish option cannot apply to the European periphery.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Case Study

Keywords

Developmental States

Growth

Developmental states and crony capitalists

Putzel, James (2002)

In Pietro P. Massina, Editor. *Rethinking development in East Asia: From illusory miracle to economic crisis*.

Curzon Press; Richmond, UK

Focuses on three interrelated aspects: the impact of evolving international and regional dynamics on national development strategies; the rethinking of national and regional development models after the crisis; and the analysis of the socio-economic transformations produced in East Asian countries during the period of accelerated economic growth and the long-term socio-economic implication of the crisis.

[Abstract from LSE Research Online Database]

Methods

Developmental States

Growth

The Adaptive Developmental State in East Asia

Joseph Wong, (2004)

Journal of East Asian Studies, Volume 4, Issue 3, Pages 345-362

It had seemed that by the late 1990s, particularly after the 1997 Asian financial crisis, the appeal of the developmental state model had run its course. Terms like 'booty capitalism' and 'crony capitalism' had come to replace more laudatory references such as the postwar 'East Asian Miracle'. Drawing on the articles featured in this special issue, this introductory essay evaluates the idea of the adaptive developmental state. It initially reviews the main characteristics of state-led development in the region, then follows with an analysis of emergent pressures on the developmental state. The state has had to confront both exogenous economic constraints and endogenously created pressures, such as demographic shifts, corruption, and demands for political liberalization. The last section of the article contemplates the assertion, 'after the developmental state'. Here I contend that the developmental state, while still relevant, must attend to and adapt to changing political, socio-demographic and economic realities.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

State-Market Relations

State-Society Relations

The Potentiality of 'Developmental States' in Africa: Botswana and Uganda Compared

Pamela Mbabazi and Ian Taylor, (2005)

CODESRIA: Dakar

The Potentiality of 'Developmental States' in Africa investigates the potential role of the state in Africa in promoting development in this era of globalisation. Using Botswana and Uganda as case studies, the volume argues that it is not the amount of state involvement in the economy that matters, but the quality. This set of original studies compares and contrasts issues that distinguish the two countries' development record and style of activity of the state in promoting development.

Written by a collection of researchers drawn mainly from Botswana and Uganda, this book argues that there are some elements of the developmental state model which can be seen in both countries. These elements have arguably contributed to some of the relative successes in the two states. Contextualising the case studies within the history and political economy of the respective countries, the book is a valuable addition to the on-going debate on the role, nature and character of states in Africa. A must read for development studies students, researchers, politicians and development practitioners.

[CODESRIA Publishers Summary: <http://www.codesria.org/spip.php?article864>]

Methods

Case Studies

Comparative

Keywords

Developmental States
State-Market Relations

**State, Business, and Economic Growth
in India**

Atul Kohli, (2007)

Studies in Comparative International Development, Volume 42, Issue 1-2, Pages 87-114

For the past 25 years, India's economy has grown at an average rate of nearly 6% annually. The widely embraced argument that this growth acceleration results from the Indian state's adoption of a pro-market strategy is inadequate for two reasons: the higher growth rate began a full decade before the liberalizing reforms in 1991; and post-1991 industrial growth has not accelerated. Instead, India's economy has grown briskly because the Indian state has prioritized growth since about 1980, and slowly embraced Indian capital as its main ruling ally. This pro-business growth strategy is likely to have adverse distributional and political consequences.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Developmental States
Growth
Poverty
Inclusion

Asia's Next Giant: South Korea and Late Industrialization

Alice H. Amsden, (1992)

Oxford University Press: Oxford

While much attention has been focused on Japan's meteoric rise as an economic power, South Korea has been quietly emerging as the next industrial giant to penetrate the world market. South Korea is one of a series of countries (ranging from Taiwan, India, Brazil, and Turkey, to Mexico, and including Japan) to have succeeded through borrowing foreign technology rather than by generating new products or processes. Describing such countries as 'late-industrializers,' Amsden demonstrates why South Korea has become the most successful of this group.

[Oxford University Press Publisher's Summary:

<http://ukcatalogue.oup.com/product/9780195076035.do>]

Methods

Review of the Literature
Comparative
Case Study

Keywords

Developmental States

“Developmental” States and Economic Growth at the Sub-National Level: The Case of Penang

Francis Edward Hutchinson, (2008)

Southeast Asian Affairs, Volume 2008, Pages 223-244

“The theory of comparative advantage argues that patterns of industry location are driven by the geographical distribution of factors of production. Yet, following this logic, Penang’s initial endowments of scarce capital and greater supplies of land and labour, would have restricted it to labour-intensive activities. Thus, it is pertinent to ask how it altered its comparative advantage away from hosting simple labour-intensive tasks towards more complex, capital intensive ones.”

“To date, the Developmental State literature has largely retained its focus on the national level. While this framework is useful for establishing whether and how national-level institutions fostered a specific industry, it is less useful for understanding why an industry developed in one part of a country and not another. However, by applying the Development State framework at the sub-national level - in particular concepts such as state capacity, autonomy, and communication with the private sector - much insight can be gained as to how and whether local-level institutions and policies influence economic activity.

Thus, this chapter will analyse the case of Penang, paying particular attention to its economic trajectory on one hand and its political, institutional, and policy environment on the other.”

[Extract’s from Introduction]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Developmental States

Building Developmental States

Building the developmental state: achieving economic growth through co-operative solutions: a comment on 'Bringing politics back in'

W. G. Huff, G. Dewit, C. Oughton, and A. Leftwich, (2001)

Journal of Development Studies, Volume 38, Issue 1, Pages 147- 155

Continues a debate begun by Leftwich (1995, 31(1) pp400-27). Drawing on the insights of game theory and East Asian experience, argues the importance of cooperative solutions in achieving economic development. To realise these, even genuine developmental states must convince a sceptical private sector of their commitment to economic development. Because of this, credibility should be added to the mix of ingredients necessary for a successful developmental state.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Debate

Keywords

Developmental States

State-Society Relations

State-Market Relations

Legitimacy

In Search of African Developmental States: Challenges and Missed Opportunities

G .Okoth, (2009)

Africa Insight, Volume 39, Issue 2

The article starts from the premise that development, by definition, must be people-driven. This is because it is their welfare in the political, economic, social and cultural wellbeing which is at stake. This requires development from below rather than the statist notion of development from above. The major thesis of the article is that over the decades, the state in Africa has performed dismally in matters pertaining to development. A conceptualisation of the developmental states is attempted, theoretical issues are articulated, the challenges of the developmental state grappled with, and missed opportunities reflected in the several development projects that are analysed.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Review of the literature

Case Studies

Keywords

Developmental States

State-Society Relations

Can Fragile States Learn from the Development Tigers?

Ivan Briscoe, (2008)

Policy Brief No.2 Dec 2008

Fundación para las Relaciones Internacionales y el Diálogo Exterior (FRIDE), Madrid

Available at: <http://www.fride.org/publication/536/can-fragile-states-learn-from-the-development-tigers>

Can the developmental success of East Asian countries be used as a road map for low-income economies run by weak states? This paper from Fundación para las Relaciones Internacionales y el Diálogo Exterior argues that the national and historical context of fragile states makes it difficult to export the experience of states like South Korea or Taiwan. However, lessons can be learned. Active state intervention, strategic economic policies and a hands-off approach by the international community are all crucial to kick-starting fast economic growth. There are huge difficulties in bringing fast development to weak states, divided elites and informal subsistence economies, but greater freedom of action for poor countries is essential.

[...]

The core of the difficulties in generalising the experience of developmental states to the rest of the developing world is transferability. The transplant of public, industry-promoting institutions from a successful context to a low-income economy – particularly when it is ruled by a fragile state – is no guarantee that development can be initiated:

- There is an absence of bureaucratic expertise in many low-income countries.
- A long cultural learning process is needed for successful development institutions, particularly when these depend for their effectiveness on being embedded in social and business circuits.
- State agencies with the resources and power to intervene in national economies will, in weak state contexts, often serve private or sector-based interests above those of national welfare.

No policy is universally effective. Much depends on the moment of a country's development and the contribution of the sector it supports to the cause of national development. However, it is possible to pick out the policies and approaches that have helped countries achieve hyper-growth:

- Labour-intensive industry is an effective mode of development but must eventually be superseded by higher levels of technology.
- Close links between the state and business can speed up development until they become the means of clan-based corruption.
- Tariff protection of industry and pricing policies can provide an impetus towards the establishment of a manufacturing base.
- An egalitarian impulse in development policy is essential to create the conditions for a skilled and upwardly mobile workforce as well as a wide consumer base.
- It is important to have careful sequenced controls on capital flows until a country's domestic financial system is mature in order to speed development and consolidate economic achievement.

A 'hands off' approach focusing on a country's growth needs is, however, problematic. The socioeconomic processes of rapid development tend not to favour social and institutional stability, and the international community is unwilling to tolerate the trade protections that would nurture manufacturing in poor countries. In economic terms, then, neither the modern global economy nor the aid community seem ready to embrace a new cohort of poor countries working their way up the developmental ladder. While many of today's fragile states could not withstand the turbulence of a totally development-oriented approach, the international economic, social and political environment should allow them the liberty to take certain steps down that path.

[Abridged Summary from GSDRC Website:

<http://139.184.194.47/go/display&type=Document&id=3263>]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

External Assistance

Financing the Developmental State: Tax and Revenue Issues

Alice Sindzingre (2007)

Development Policy Review, Volume 25, Issue 5, Pages 615-632

Asian developmental states do not rely on high levels of taxation. Their key features are the capacity to commit and intervene credibly in the form of policies directed towards growth rather than taxation. These features are often lacking in sub-Saharan Africa where the problem is compounded by three main constraints that prevent taxation from financing African states in a developmental way: their dependence on commodities, the effects of trade liberalisation, and the impact of aid, which provides incentives that may undermine the tax structures and key institutions of recipient countries.

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Developmental States
Taxation
Resources
External Assistance

Tracking Development in Southeast Asia and Sub-Saharan Africa: the primacy of policy

Jan Kees van Donge, David Henley, and Peter Lewis, (2009)

Tracking Development

Available at:

http://www.trackingdevelopment.net/resources/docs/TD%20in%20SA%20and%20SSA_The%20primacy%20of%20policy.pdf

The Tracking Development project compares four countries in Southeast Asia with four in Sub-Saharan Africa in order to explain why the former region has developed rapidly in the past half century, and the latter has not. In particular, the question is whether the contrast can be explained by specific policy choices. In Southeast Asia, the transition to sustained growth has consistently been associated with policies aimed at (1) macroeconomic stabilization; (2) improving life in the rural sector, increasing agricultural productivity, and ensuring an ample supply of food; and (3) liberalizing the economy and creating conditions of economic freedom, particularly for peasant farmers and other small actors. However, state intervention remains essential; the typical development trajectory of Southeast Asia is not one in the style of the Washington consensus. In Africa initiatives in these directions have in some instances been present, but the simultaneous pursuit of all three policy objectives has not. Other factors that appear to be of somewhat lesser importance, but that nevertheless deserve further study, are: (1) industrialization on the basis of foreign direct investment; (2) systems of politics and governance; and (3) cultural patterns as manifest in policy choices.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Comparative Analysis

Keywords

Developmental States
Growth

Transferable lessons? Re-examining the institutional prerequisites of East Asian economic policies

Peter Evans, (1998)

Journal of Development Studies, Volume 34, Issue 6, Pages 66 - 86

Competing theories of East Asian economic policy share the assumption that a highly capable, coherent economic bureaucracy, closely connected to, but still independent of, the business community, has been an essential institutional prerequisite for successful policy formation and implementation. In East Asia these institutional prerequisites were constructed in a variety of concrete forms with great difficulty and imperfect results. As long as the idea of 'transferable lessons' is understood as an invitation to indigenous innovation that takes advantage of the

underlying analytical logic of East Asian institutions, other countries can reap important benefits from East Asia's experience.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

External Assistance

Developmental States

Effective States

State-Market Relations

Bureaucracy

State Failure in Developing Countries and Institutional Reform Strategies

Mushtaq M. Khan, (2004)

In Towards Pro-Poor Policies: Aid Institutions and Globalization, B Tungodden, N, Stern, and I. Kolstad, Editors.

Annual World Bank Conference on Development Economics, Europe (2003). Oxford University Press and World Bank

Available at: <https://eprints.soas.ac.uk/3683/>

“This paper argues that the distribution and disposition of political power in society is a key determinant of enforcement success, and that the emergence of high-growth states is therefore as much a task of political engineering as it is of institutional engineering to ensure that states are able to enforce painful and socially contested decisions. This explains why institutions that work well in one context may fail badly in another. The evidence supports the claim that the most persistent types of state failure occur when institutions fail because of an inappropriate match between internal political settlements (defined as the distribution of organizational and political power between competing groups and classes) and the institutions and interventions through which states attempt to accelerate transformation and growth (Khan 1995; Rodrik forthcoming).”

[Extract from Chapter's Introduction]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Institutions

Political Settlements

Growth

Building a democratic developmental state: Social democracy in the developing world

Gordon White, (1998)

Democratization, Volume 5, Issue 3, 1998, Pages 1 - 32

While reviewing the various arguments about the influence of democracy on socio-economic development in the developing world, the article argues that, since many 'democracies' are likely to persist in form if not in substance, the key point at issue is what particular form of democracy can help to hinder socio-economic development. The latter is defined in terms of infrastructural, regulative and distributive capacities which inhere in the emergence of an effective democratic developmental state. The article explores the nature of such a state, and the key environmental conditions which make it more or less likely to come about. It also identifies three sets of conditions and choices which influence the shape of democratic polities: the institutional design of the state itself, the character of political society and the nature and role of civil society. The article concludes that achieving such ambitious and comprehensive developmental goals requires a developmental form of social democracy akin to that found in the industrialized societies of northern and central Europe. This outcome is relatively unlikely, in the short and medium term at least, given the institutional configurations and socio-economic structures of many societies. However, other forms of developmental democracy are possible even if they do not achieve such a wide range of developmental objectives. In analytical terms, we should realize that 'democracies' vary greatly across societies and it is the job of the political scientist to unravel this complexity in a post-cold war world.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Democracy

Institutions

Civil Society

State-Society Relations

Business associations and growth coalitions in Sub-Saharan Africa

Deborah Bräutigam, Lise Rakner and Scott Taylor, (2002)

Journal of Modern African Studies, Volume 40, Issue 4, Pages 519-547

Why are 'growth coalitions' involving business interest groups and governments so rare in Africa? How has democratisation affected the possibilities for growth coalitions? In three cases with varying degrees of democracy – Mauritius, Zambia, and Zimbabwe – we find that hypotheses about growth coalitions that place importance on the organisation of the business sector are generally borne out. Yet even when the business community is organised in an 'ideal' manner, growth coalitions still depend on factors within the state: leadership, ideas, and capacity. Democratisation has a mixed effect. We find that in the case of Zambia, business–state relations did not improve despite a pro-democracy stance by business and the pro-business agenda of the democratic government coming to power in 1991. In Zimbabwe, the erosion of democracy reduced business access to state elites, breaking up a growth coalition that initially showed considerable promise. In Mauritius, the strengthening of democracy has paralleled the deepening of the growth coalition, and both have been reinforced by a strong economy. Our study shows

that growth coalitions are possible in Africa; the key lies in determining the conditions under which such coalitions can be sustained in Africa's fragile polities.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

State-Market Relations

State-Society Relations

Political Settlements

Elite Coalitions

Democracy

An Asianist's perspective on the Africa Power and Politics Programme

James Manor, (2008)

Africa Power and Politics Programme, Discussion Paper No. 4

Available at: <http://www.institutions-africa.org/publications/discussion-papers>

This paper is written on the assumption that insights from the study of Asia may suggest lines of enquiry about politics and power in Africa. While there is certainly no Asian 'model', Asian and especially Indian experience is relevant in a number of respects. It suggests a need for caution in attempting to improve accountabilities or 'get things done' by reviving old institutions, and points to the feasibility of mobilising constructive social resources with responsive project designs; the desirability of balance between assertiveness and accommodation in political leadership; and the importance of senior politicians as agents of change. Other topics discussed include the spread of 'postclientelist' electoral strategies, alternative approaches to containing corruption and the value of South-South policy emulation.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Political Settlements

Change

Clientelism

External Assistance

Leadership

Rethinking civil service reform in Africa: 'islands of effectiveness' and organisational commitment

Richard C. Crook, (2010)

Commonwealth and Comparative Politics, Volume 48, Issue 4, Pages 479–504

After many decades of reform efforts and capacity-building, the delivery of public goods in most sub-Saharan African states remains in crisis. Yet explanations of this failure which focus on failure of implementation, continued overstaffing, lack of political will or the inherent problems

of 'neo-patrimonialism' are unconvincing. In fact the key problems of African public goods remain those of understaffing and lack of organisational commitment. It is argued that the best way forward is to identify and work with the competent managers to be found in 'islands of effectiveness', encouraging and spreading more effective kinds of incentives and developing more positive organisational cultures. Pressure from the public for better performance is only likely to work if the need to respond is incorporated into organisational incentive structures.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Bureaucracy

Effective States

Developmental States

State-Society Relations

The National Project as a Public Administration Concept: The problematic of State Building in the Search for New Development Paradigms in Africa

Tukumbi Lumumba-Kasongo, (2008)

Paper Presented at CODESRIA 12th General Assembly: Governing the African Public Sphere, 7th -11th December 2008, Yaoundé, Cameroon

Available at: <http://www.codesria.org/spip.php?article623&lang=en>

In the center of the debate regarding the values and importance of decolonization, development thought, and the post-colonial state building in Africa, the question of the national project is central. In theory a national project, as either an imaginary concept of the political elite, a tool of political domination, or a real complex embodiment of the mobilization of ideas and thoughts, is about governance. It implies the existence of some dimensions of political, economic and cultural nationalism both in its policy framework and political basis. At the time of political independence, most of the African political regimes, regardless of the nature of their ideologies, history of their state formations, and how they gained political independence, adopted and/or created some forms of national projects as the foundation of their social and economic platforms. However, it is generally known that African states have produced a relatively weak, fragmented, individualized and personalized public administration based on ambiguous and confused national projects. In Africa, even the reactionary regimes have claimed to be nationalistic. Why has this consistently been the case?

There are various interpretations of African national projects, which became the policy blueprints through which the African political elites and the people were, in principle, supposed to be connected with one another and with the people in exploring new developmental models. Although many studies have been conducted on some aspects of the role of national projects and public administrations in projecting social progress in Africa, so far there have not been enough studies that historically examine the notion of national projects and their relationship with public administration. [...] It is argued that no contemporary state is able to effectively render services that, in the long run, can be translated into solid infrastructures without building a public administration that is relevant and appropriate as part of the state's national project. Public administration should be an apparatus of the public space in which integrative ideas, public management, societal values, and collective citizenry are articulated.

I am also interested in understanding the nature of the relationship between the national project as an ideology of the state and the public administration as the functional foundation of the state in Africa and see how this relationship can foster the thoughts about the notion of public agenda or the public space. Behind this analytical reflection, the broader issue is the idea that the concept of the “political public” defined through the relationship between national projects, public administrations, and the civil societies should be viewed as the cement for the collective political culture

[Abridged Author’s Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

State Formation

Developmental States

Bureaucracy

Political Settlements

State-Society Relations

Citizenship

A “liberal” developmental state in Ghana: an emerging paradigm for democracy and economic growth?

Emmanuel Gyimah-Boadi, (2009)

(Forthcoming) Centre for Democracy and Development, Accra, Ghana, Working Paper.

“It has been several years since Chalmers Johnson first posited the concept of the “developmental state” in his seminal account of Japan’s post-World War II economic boom (Johnson, 1982). The concept has subsequently been used to describe a number of East Asian success stories, particularly, Korea (Amsden 1989) , Taiwan (Wade 2004), Singapore, Malaysia, Indonesia, Thailand, and Hong Kong. The term “developmental state” has come to represent a certain type of development trajectory with its own distinct characteristics. Inspired by the “developmental state” literature, political economists and development theorists have subsequently attempted to identify the leading characteristics of the developmental state with a view to seeing if the successes of the East Asian developmental states can be successfully replicated in other parts of the world (Woo-Cummings 1999, Lewis 2006, Good 2002). This paper makes a modest attempt to add to this body of literature. Specifically it seeks to discover if the concept can be applied to Ghana, a country that has been one of the Africa’s star performers economically and politically in recent times. This paper suggests Ghana has demonstrated some of the characteristics of a developmental state while becoming increasingly less authoritarian and more liberal, and that this is true of a number of progressive African states that may also be described as “developmental”. This suggests that a new form of a developmental state may be emerging – or at least that current thinking about the relationship between the development state and liberalism within the context of Africa should perhaps be re-examined.”

[Introduction from Paper]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Developmental States

Democracy

Developmental states, effective states and poverty reduction: The primacy of politics

Adrian Leftwich (2008)

UNRISD Project on Poverty Reduction and Policy Regimes

Available at:

[http://www.unrisd.org/unrisd/website/projects.nsf/89d2a44e5722c4f480256b560052d8ad/68c40b61b9f737f6c125743900508c69/\\$FILE/Leftwichweb.pdf](http://www.unrisd.org/unrisd/website/projects.nsf/89d2a44e5722c4f480256b560052d8ad/68c40b61b9f737f6c125743900508c69/$FILE/Leftwichweb.pdf)

[...]

Poverty reduction and general improvement in welfare, in short, is not simply a matter of enhancing aid flows, designing appropriate policy regimes and supporting institutional development. For we have seen that very different policy regimes and institutional set-ups in diverse socio-economic contexts can promote poverty reduction, as the very different cases of Uganda, Viet Nam, Mauritius, the Republic of Korea and Cuba all illustrate (World Bank 2005; UNDP 2006). Poverty reduction is a matter of politics. But where the politics are not equal to the task it is, first and foremost, a matter for donors to identify, nurture, encourage and support those social and political forces which are necessary for forming the kinds of growth coalition which will demand, design and implement the institutional arrangements which will deliver pro-poor growth and social provision.

In this paper I elaborate, first, what is to be meant by politics here and go on to suggest that the politics of growth and development is a special and difficult kind of politics, most dramatically reflected in what have come to be called developmental states. I suggest that only effective states and preferably development ones – whether democratic or not – are capable of elaborating the institutions which will establish poverty reducing growth and associated welfare regimes. But I also argue that building such states cannot be had to order and that their evolution will depend on the political processes that have everywhere and always established them. Current anti-statist and pro-market orthodoxies, though somewhat on the decline, and pro-democratic concerns, do not make building effective development states a straightforward matter. I conclude by suggesting that the challenge for donors is a difficult one, but that it is time to start thinking how they move into new areas of assistance and aid so as to be able to invest in, and support, the *political processes* which contribute towards the negotiated construction of effective developmental states.

[Abridged Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Poverty

Elite Coalitions

Effective States

External Assistance

Democracy

Rethinking the developmental state model: divided Leviathan and subnational comparisons in India

Aseema Sinha, (2003)

Comparative Politics, Volume 35, Issue 4, Pages 459-476

Comparative politics approaches the question of the appropriate role of the state in economic life through a nation-centric prism. India, a crucial but puzzling case, offers an alternative framework. The search for developmental states has until now proceeded at too aggregate a level. India is inaccurately perceived as a failed developmental model because of a misspecification of the level of analysis. Under a common interventionist regime, some subnational provinces proved to be high performers. A two level interactive model posits that the policy framework of growth in India is not centrally guided but is a joint product of central rules, provincial strategic choices, and subnational institutional variation.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Developmental States

Towards a theory of local governance and public goods' provision in sub-Saharan Africa

David Booth (2010)

Africa Power and Politics Programme, Working Paper No. 13

Available at: <http://www.institutions-africa.org/publications/working-papers>

Under-provision of essential public goods is a key source of the malaise of development in sub-Saharan Africa. It is widely accepted that this is largely a governance problem, but current approaches to improving governance are not working. This paper provides a midterm report on a multi-country research effort to shed light on the institutional sources of variation in public goods' provision at the sub-national level, with a particular focus on key bottlenecks to improvement in maternal mortality, water and sanitation, facilitation of markets and enterprise, and public order and security. Drawing on fieldwork evidence and secondary literature, it identifies three clusters of issues and associated explanatory variables which seem to account for much of the variation in intermediate outcomes. The paper identifies questions to be settled in the final phase of research and discusses emerging policy implications, including several relating to the current form and scale of external development assistance.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of Literature

Review of Research

Keywords

Public Goods

External Assistance

Bureaucracy

Legitimacy

Towards a Theory of Local Governance and Public Goods Provision

David Booth, (2011)

IDS Bulletin, Volume 42, Issue 2, Pages 11-21

Under-provision of essential public goods is making development in Africa slower and more inequitable than it needs to be. A good part of this problem concerns the governance of provision at sub-national levels. This article provides a mid-term report on a multi-country research effort to shed light on the institutional sources of variation in local public goods provision. The particular focus is on key bottlenecks to improvement in maternal mortality, water and sanitation, facilitation of markets and enterprise, and public order and security. Drawing on fieldwork evidence and secondary literature, it identifies three clusters of issues and associated explanatory variables which seem to account for much of the variation in intermediate outcomes. They concern the extent of policy-driven incoherence in the institutional framework, the strength of corporate disciplines in provider organisations and the degree to which self-help is able to be 'locally anchored' in two particular senses.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Governance

Public Goods

External Assistance

Political Parties and Democratic Developmental States

Vicky Randall (2007)

Development Policy Review, Volume 25, Issue 5, Pages 633-652

This article focuses on the contribution, actual or potential, of political parties to the project of a 'democratic developmental state'. In the classic developmental state, individual hegemonic parties often, though by no means always, played a key role. However, on the available evidence, parties make a very limited contribution to the emergence of new democratic developmental states, in terms of either democracy-building or policy-making, recruitment, ensuring accountability or policy implementation. Reasons include weak institutionalisation and the prevalence of clientelism. External assistance, nevertheless, is likely to be limited in impact and, given the importance of autonomous party development, should ideally be indirect.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Clientelism

External Assistance

Democracy

Governance and Policy Performance in Korea

Yeonho Lee and Yoojin Lim, (2010)

Asian Perspective, Volume 34, Issue 3, Pages 137-163

With the successful economic development of the East Asian tigers, it has been taken for granted that insulating the policy process from social influences results in better policy outcomes. However, empirical studies conducted since the 1990s on both developing and developed countries cast doubt on this assumption. Instead, good governance has emerged as an alternative to enhance the government's policy outcomes and engineer sustainable development, which is defined as the formal and informal institutions in which the state, market, and civil society form an egalitarian network to make and implement policies in a democratic and transparent manner. The three variables of the governance model-namely, social trust, local governance, and transparent and open policymaking-could enhance the policy process in the era of democratization. Using a case study of the Korean government's selection process for finding a radioactive waste repository site, the authors empirically show that the governance approach generates successful policy outcomes in the era of democratization.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Review of the literature

Case Study

Keywords

Developmental States

Governance

Effective States

State-Society Relations

Policy learning and transfer: the experience of the developmental state in East Asia

Huck-ju Kwon, (2009)

Policy and politics, Volume 37, Issue 3, Pages 409-421

As late industrialisers, East Asia's developmental states - Japan, the Republic of Korea and Taiwan - assimilated the front runners' policy innovations and experience, taking advantage of lateness. This article examines policy learning and transfer in these countries' developmental states and their characteristics in policy learning processes; explores the rationale for policy learning and transfer, focusing on Fukuzawa's paradox; investigates policy learning and transfer patterns, applying the 'flying geese' hypothesis to health insurance; and considers whether the three states will adapt future challenges to their own creative policy ideas, going beyond Fukuzawa's paradox. Although policy learning is effective for development, these states should now secure their own policy vision to meet the challenges ahead.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Effective States

External Assistance

Democratization and the transformation process in East Asian developmental states: Financial reform in Korea and Taiwan

Haeran Lim, (2009)

Asian Perspective, Volume 33, Issue 1, Pages 75-110

This study explores the impact of democratization on financial reform in Korea and Taiwan. In Korea, democratization decreased the autonomy and efficiency of bureaucrats and increased the power of business groups, which led to unregulated financial liberalization. Crisis contributed to the urgency of reform, coalitional support, and burden sharing among people. After the crisis, the re-strengthened bureaucracy and weakened veto power of business and labor sectors resulted in "path-breaking" reform in Korea. In Taiwan, the historically conservative financial system remained stable, allowing Taiwan to escape the Asian crisis but later becoming obstacles to reform. Democratization decreased the autonomy of bureaucrats and increased money politics: Lack of consensus among parties, divided government, and opposition within vested interest groups led to "lagged and stalemated" financial reform in Taiwan

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Democracy

Developmental States

Bureaucracy

State-Society Relations

State-Market Relations

Challenging the developmental state: Nature conservation in Singapore

Harvey Neo, (2007)

Asia Pacific Viewpoint, Volume 48, Issue 2, Pages 186-199

Nature conservation efforts are often reactive to encroaching development plans and systematic conservation planning that is integral with development is not only uncommon, but is often fraught with difficulties even where it is actually attempted. Such obstacles to conservation are especially apparent in developmental states where state legitimacy is largely derived from the state's ability to develop the country. Among other things, developmental states place a premium on physical and economic development. This paper critiques, through the standpoint of nature conservation, the inadequate conceptualisation of 'development' in the developmental state thesis. Specifically, this paper argues that the seemingly value-free (but ultimately economically based) underpinnings of development goals pushed by the developmental state needs to be tempered with a broader concern for the ethics of development. To that end, I draw on two case studies of nature conservation tussles in Singapore to show how alternative extra-economic visions of development have been articulated, notwithstanding the developmental state's monopoly on the discourse (and practice) of progress and development. The case studies, set in the heady economic growth of the early 1990s, will critique two related aspects of the developmental state: its 'amoral' economic conception of development and its use of growth and materialism as legitimacy.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Review of literature

Case Study

Keywords

Developmental States
State-Society Relations
Growth
Public Goods

Late Industrialisers, Late Democratisers: Developmental States in the Asia-Pacific

Mark R. Thompson, (1996)

Third World Quarterly, Volume 17, Issue 4, Pages 625-647

Developmental states in the Asia-Pacific area illustrate how modernization theory continues to be relevant. The idea that economic growth first leads to social mobilization, then to new forms of political activity, is apparent in the democratization, pseudo-democratization, & industrialization of South Korea, Taiwan, Malaysia, & Singapore. The rise of civil society in South Korea & Taiwan was largely the result of the growing middle class created by relatively high levels of economic development; late democratization followed late industrialization. However, the cases of Malaysia & Singapore show an opposite effect, where justification for tight state regulation was offered after achieving considerable economic advances. This increased rulers' undemocratic tendencies & weakened opposition's ability to challenge them. It is suggested that these successful developmental dictatorships may encourage other late-industrializing Asian countries to resist democratization.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Democracy
State-Society Relations
Civil Society
Elites

Public Service Delivery in a Democratic, Developmental State

E Fakir (2007)

Centre for Policy Studies, Johannesburg, South Africa

Available at: <http://www.eldis.org/assets/Docs/32287.html>

This paper discusses the notion of service delivery by the public service in a democratic developmental state. It maintains a particular focus on the definitions of a developmental state and the challenges it faces whilst looking at South Africa as a case study.

The authors argue that the skills and values required in the public service of a democratic developmental state are defined by its development priorities and challenges as well as the specific institutional conditions that exist or may need to be created.

Some of the key internal challenges to the functioning of a developmental state that are discussed include:

- monitoring and evaluation of staff and the services it delivers, as well as the way the institution functions overall
- management of financial resources so that they may be optimised
- acquiring the relevant skills to be able to execute the delivery mandate
- investing in proper knowledge management systems so that appropriate records can be kept for the purposes of monitoring and evaluation.

[ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Public Goods

Bureaucracy

Democracy

Transforming the Developmental Welfare State in East Asia

Huck-ju Kwon, (2005)

Development and Change, Volume 36, Issue 3, Pages 477–497

This article attempts to explain changes and continuity in the developmental welfare states in Korea and Taiwan within the East Asian context. It first elaborates two strands of welfare developmentalism (selective vs. inclusive), and establishes that the welfare state in both countries fell into the selective category of developmental welfare states before the Asian economic crisis of 1997. The key principles of the selective strand of welfare developmentalism are productivism, selective social investment and authoritarianism; inclusive welfare development is based on productivism, universal social investment and democratic governance. The article then argues that the policy reform toward an inclusive welfare state in Korea and Taiwan was triggered by the need for structural reform in the economy. The need for economic reform, together with democratization, created institutional space in policy-making for advocacy coalitions, which made successful advances towards greater social rights. Finally, the article argues that the experiences of Korea and Taiwan counter the neo-liberal assertion that the role of social policy in economic development is minor, and emphasizes that the idea of an inclusive developmental welfare state should be explored in the wider context of economic and social development.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Developmental States

Public Goods

Inclusion

Exclusion

Political Settlements

Is Development Path Dependent or Political? A Reinterpretation of Mineral-Dependent Development in Botswana

Amy R. Poteete (2009)

Journal of Development Studies, Volume 45, Issue 4, Pages 544 – 571

Poor management of earnings from valuable natural resources results in a syndrome known as Dutch Disease, characterised by real exchange rate appreciation, high labour costs, and structural imbalances in economic development. Often a product of rentier politics, Dutch Disease undermines long-term economic performance in resource dependent economies resulting in a 'resource curse'. The conventional wisdom argues that institutions and state development at the time of a resource boom lock countries into divergent developmental trajectories. I argue that political coalitions lay the foundation for development of state and other institutions, and that changes in coalitions drive changes in policy responses to resource booms. Botswana's experience illustrates the argument. Botswana has not entirely avoided symptoms of Dutch Disease, but has kept them largely in check despite the fragility of state institutions when diamonds were discovered. A broad and stable political coalition during the first decades of independence encouraged adoption of pro-growth policies and institutions. Rather than lock the country into a persistent development trajectory, these institutions left room for changes in political coalitions. As political coalitions change, economic policies and performance are also likely to change.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Political Settlements

Elite Coalitions

Growth

States and Development: Historical Antecedents of Stagnation and Advance

Matthew Lange and Dietrich Rueschemeyer, (2005)

Palgrave Macmillan: New York and Basingstoke

One of the most important issues in comparative politics is the relationship between the state and society and the implications of different relationships for long-term social and economic development. Exploring the contribution states can make to overcoming collective action problems and creating collective goods favourable to social, economic, and political development, the contributors to this significant volume examine how state-society relations as well as features of state structure shape the conditions under which states seek to advance development and the conditions that make success more or less likely. Particular focus is given to bureaucratic oversight, market functioning, and the assertion of democratic demands discipline state actions and contribute to state effectiveness. These propositions and the social mechanisms underlying them are examined in comparative historical and cross-national statistical analyses. The conclusion will also evaluate the results for current policy concerns.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

State-Society Relations

Public Goods

Developmental States

Bureaucracy

State-Market Relations

Review of DFID's Target Strategy Paper on Governance

Mushtaq Khan, (2005)

Available at: <http://eprints.soas.ac.uk/9955/>

“DFID’s Governance Target Strategy Paper (TSP), published in 2001, identifies seven key governance capabilities that it argues are necessary for effective poverty reduction and the achievement of the International Development Targets. Developing country states must be able to operate political systems responsive to all sections of the population, they must be able to provide macroeconomic stability and facilitate private sector investment, to use fiscal systems for pro-poor policies, to provide effective basic services, to provide security and justice, to resolve and prevent conflicts, and to operate honest and accountable government. These governance capabilities provide the analytical grid for DFID country offices to develop country specific packages of governance reforms. While the seven capabilities identified are extremely ambitious, the document is consistent with support for more limited country specific reforms. The TSP is careful not to propose a standard blueprint for all developing countries. And it is careful to point out the limited success achieved by many of the ongoing institutional reform programmes that have attempted to improve governance in developing countries along these lines in the recent past. In all these respects, the TSP is a sophisticated document drawing qualified conclusions from its reading of the available theory and evidence on governance. However, this theory and evidence is itself highly contested and in our review, we focus on a number of critical questions that policy-makers have to be aware of in developing governance reforms that can make an impact on poverty reduction.”

[Extract from Paper]

Methods

Critique of Strategy Paper

Keywords

Developmental States

Effective States

Botswana’s “Developmental State” and the Politics of Legitimacy’

Ian Taylor, (2005)

In Global Encounters: International Political Economy, Development and Globalisation Graham Harrison, Editor.

Palgrave: Basingstoke

“Indeed, in Africa the international financial institutions have argued that African states lack the capacity to pursue developmental state policies, whilst being far too susceptible to vested interests in the political realm. Elites in Africa have frequently taken on board such judgements and have come to believe, albeit at times reluctantly and at varying speeds across the continent,

that a minimalist role for the state is required. However, across the board liberalization and state rollback has had dubious effects (Fine and Stoneman 1996). It is thus important to interrogate the orthodox thesis that state involvement inexorably leads to economic decline and that developmental states in Africa are an impossibility. Comparative studies from East Asia suggest that there are some lessons to be learnt (Bräutigam 1994; Stein 1995).

In this chapter, Botswana is provided as an illustration of a state that has pursued certain policies in the construction of what might be regarded as a ‘developmental state’, that is, as state that pursues policies that coordinate investment plans; has a national development vision – implying that the state is an entrepreneurial agent; that engages in institution building to promote growth and development; and that plays a role in domestic conflict management (Change 1994: 192-9).”

[Extract from Article]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Case study

Keywords

Developmental States

Growth

Political Settlements

Clientelism

Democracy and development: Is there institutional incompatibility?

Adrian Leftwich, (2005)

Democratization, Volume 12, Issue 5, Pages 686 - 703

Since the end of the Cold War, two central foreign policy goals have risen to the top of the agenda of Western governments and development agencies. On the one hand, the reduction of poverty has increasingly dominated development thinking. Pro-poor economic growth, it is argued, is essential for these goals to be met. Moreover, it is also widely held that such growth and development is essential for reducing political instability, insecurity and conflict by expanding the arc of stakeholders in developing economies and deepening economic and political ties between countries. But democratization, on the other hand, remains a policy priority, not only for the usual moral reasons, but also because of the now widely accepted thesis that consolidated democracies are both more stable and also less likely to engage in conflict with each other. The problem, however, is that whatever the merits or limitations of these goals may be, there are also very complicated and potentially compromising structural tensions between the *institutions* required for stable and consolidated democracy and those required for rapid, effective and sustained growth and development. This argument is advanced here by looking at both development and democracy from an institutional point of view.

[Author’s Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Developmental States

Democracy

Institutions

Developmental patrimonialism? Questioning the orthodoxy on political governance and economic progress in Africa

Tim Kelsall and David Booth with Diana Cammack and Frederick Golooba-Mutebi (2010)

Africa Power and Politics Programme Working Paper No. 9

Available at: <http://www.institutions-africa.org/publications/working-papers>

The relationship between neo-patrimonialism and development seems more complex than is allowed for in either orthodox policy advice on ‘good governance’ or the standard political science accounts. This paper explores the range of historical and current experience among African political regimes, with particular reference to seven countries of Middle Africa. Drawing inspiration from literature on Asia, it proposes a way of getting to grips analytically with the diversity of African experience by setting out some elements of a typological theory about regimes and development performance. This centres on two aspects of the way rents are managed under different regimes: the degree of centralisation and the length of the time-horizon. The strengths and limitations of the particular type termed ‘developmental patrimonialism’ are discussed in relation to various periods in the history of Côte d’Ivoire, Malawi, Kenya, Rwanda and Tanzania. Issues for further research are identified.

[Authors’ Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Case Studies

Historical Analysis

Keywords

Developmental States

Clientelism

Public Goods

Resources

The Logic of African Neopatrimonialism: What Role for Donors?

Diana Cammack (2007)

Development Policy Review Volume 25, Issue 5, Pages 599-614

Today a number of sub-Saharan African countries display the outward signs of modern, democratic states. International aid agencies often treat them as though power and decision-making reside within government institutions and that they function as designed. When they do not they are labelled dysfunctional though their action is actually quite logical when viewed through a ‘neopatrimonial lens’. This article outlines a number of neopatrimonial practices observed in Africa in the past two decades and attempts to explain the ‘logic’ that underpins them. It provides several recommendations about the way donors should assist states where deeply rooted anti-democratic and non-developmental behaviour dominates.

[Author’s Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Clientelism
External Assistance
Developmental States

Rents, Rent-Seeking and Economic Development

Mushtaq H. Khan and Kwame Sundaram Jomo, Editors. (2000)

Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

The concepts of rents and rent-seeking are central to any discussion of the processes of economic development. Yet conventional models of rent-seeking are unable to explain how it can drive decades of rapid growth in some countries, and at other times be associated with spectacular economic crises. This book argues that the rent-seeking framework has to be radically extended by incorporating insights developed by political scientists, institutional economists and political economists if it is to explain the anomalous role played by rent-seeking in Asian countries. It includes detailed analysis of Thailand, Malaysia, the Philippines, the Indian sub-continent, Indonesia and South Korea. This new critical and multidisciplinary approach has important policy implications for the debates over institutional reform in developing countries. It brings together leading international scholars in economics and political science, and will be of great interest to readers in the social sciences and Asian studies in general.

[Cambridge University Press Publishers Summary:

http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item1167532/?site_locale=en_GB]

Methods

Review of Literature
Case Studies

Keywords

Developmental States
Growth
Clientelism

Developmental patrimonialism? The case of Rwanda

David Booth and Frederick Golooba-Mutebi, (2011)

Africa Power and Politics Programme, Working Paper No. 16

Available at: <http://www.institutions-africa.org/publications/working-papers>

In the modal pattern of governance for development in sub-Saharan Africa, political competition fuels unbridled corruption which undermines the interest and ability of the state to provide the public goods necessary for transformative, poverty-reducing development. APPP research has identified a type of deviation from the modal pattern which is more realistic than the standard 'good governance' alternative, which we are calling developmental (neo)patrimonialism. This paper considers whether Rwanda since 2000 is a current example of this type of regime, and argues that in several but not all respects it is. A defining feature of developmental patrimonialism is the interest and ability of the ruling elite to impose a centralised management of the rents which are an unavoidable feature of early capitalism, and to deploy these with a view to the long term. The relevance of this to the Rwanda case hinges on an interpretation of the role of the private holding company owned by the ruling party, known successively as Tri-Star

Investments and Crystal Ventures. We maintain that these arrangements, which are controversial with donors, have provided Rwanda with the 'early-stage venture capitalism' it needed to achieve economic recovery post-1994 and to maintain respectable rates of investment and socio-economic progress under otherwise unfavourable conditions during the last decade.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Developmental States

Clientelism

Political Settlements

State-Market Relations

Developmental patrimonialism? The case of Malawi

Diana Cammack and Tim Kelsall, with David Booth, (2010)

Africa Power and Politics Programme, Working Paper No.12

Available at: <http://www.institutions-africa.org/publications/working-papers>

Economic governance in Malawi has never been without problems. Yet, for significant periods, the country's development performance has been better than might be expected given its geographical location and natural resource endowments and the global context of the time. This paper argues that underlying the episodes of better performance are institutional configurations which include: centralized, long-horizon rent utilization, a disciplined economic technocracy, and an inclusive form of ethno-regional politics. In particular, the 1964-79 phase of the presidency of Kamuzu Banda conforms closely to the concept of 'developmental patrimonialism', defined in this way. It tends also to support the proposition that regimes of this type are associated with relatively good development outcomes. Furthermore, the characteristics and performance of subsequent regimes (Banda II, Muluzi and Mutharika) are consistent with the emerging theory.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Developmental States

Clientelism

Growth

Neo-patrimonialism, Institutions and Economic Growth: The Case of Malawi, 1964–2009

Diana Cammack and Tim Kelsall, (2011)

IDS Bulletin, Volume 42, Issue 2, Pages 88-96

For significant periods Malawi's economy has performed as well or better than might have been expected given its geographical location and natural resource endowments. Underlying these promising episodes is a pattern of centralised, long-horizon rent management and technocratic integrity. This case study of 'developmental patrimonialism' found that the period 1965–79 was

one of centralised, long-horizon rent management and a vertically disciplined technocracy, and the economy grew healthily; 1980–94, by contrast, was a period in which rent management drifted. Although it remained quite centralised, it became geared more to the short term, while the civil service began to deteriorate as it was politicised. These resulted in a comparatively directionless reform programme. The situation deteriorated still further under President Bakili Muluzi (1994–2004). This was a period of decentralised, short-horizon rent management and a further deterioration of the state bureaucracy. The economy entered a tailspin. A recovery was made during the first term of President Bingu wa Mutharika (2004–09), who reintroduced some aspects of long-horizon rent centralisation and promoted a more vertically disciplined technocracy.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Clientelism

Growth

Developmental States

Bureaucracy

Patrimonialism, Administrative Effectiveness and Economic Development in Cote d'Ivoire

Richard C. Crook, (1989)

African Affairs, Volume 88, Issue 351, Pages 205-228

“My purpose in this article, however, is to argue that there are distinctive features to the Ivorian experience, on the grounds that any other assumption leaves too many unanswered questions. Whilst the economic policies pursued may have been common in post-colonial Africa, their successful outcomes remain on the record and cannot be gainsaid, regardless of the current difficulties. Various explanations of this unusual record have, of course, been mooted: the 'vent for surplus' permitted by large amounts of unused land and labour; dedication to 'market'-oriented strategies; the influence of agricultural interests within the state; the impact of political stability, and the unique quality of the country's relationship with France.

Most of these explanations, however, beg the question of state capacity or the ability to implement and sustain a particular orientation. The question of whether Ivorian state capacity is also unusually high cannot easily be tackled if the political model of Cote d'Ivoire as a 'neo-patrimonial/personal rulership state like other African states' is accepted uncritically. The concept of neo-patrimonialism is, in the current literature, used predominantly to explain the political decay, economic collapse and administrative grotesqueries of African states such as Zaire, Uganda or Ghana. It would seem theoretically inadequate, to say the least, to expect the same concept to explain the Ivorian (or Malawian or Kenyan) experience merely by adding the qualification 'decent' to the term 'neo-patrimonialism'. For clearly what is most distinctive about Cote d'Ivoire is its ability, at a very crude level of comparison, to implement its policies. The export crops have been successfully grown and marketed; the farmers get paid and receive their inputs; feeder roads get built and taxes collected. How can a model which mostly explains why African bureaucracies are inefficient be an adequate characterization of a state in which what needs to be explained is its relative bureaucratic efficiency and level of state capacity?”

[Extract from Article]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Effective States

Clientelism

Bureaucracy

Rethinking the Relationship between Neo-patrimonialism and Economic Development in Africa

Tim Kelsall, (2011)

IDS Bulletin, Volume 42, Issue 2, Pages 76–87

Is it possible to work with the grain of neo-patrimonial politics to boost investment and growth in Africa? Current donor orthodoxy is that neo-patrimonialism is irredeemably bad for economic development, but evidence from other regions, together with a re-examination of the African record itself, suggests that this may not be true. We present evidence from case studies of Kenya, Côte d'Ivoire, Malawi and Rwanda to show that provided mechanisms can be found to centralise economic rents and manage them with a view to the long term, neo-patrimonialism can be harnessed for developmental ends.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Developmental States

Clientelism

Developmental States and Elites**Do No Harm: Aid, Weak Institutions and the Missing Middle in Africa**

Nancy Birdsall (2007)

Development Policy Review, Volume 25, Issue 5, Pages 575-598

The implicit assumption of the donor community is that Africa is trapped by its poverty, and that aid is necessary if it is to escape. This article suggests an alternative view: that Africa is caught in an institutional trap, signalled and reinforced by the small share of income of its independent middle strata. Theory and historical experience elsewhere suggest that a robust middle-income group contributes critically to the creation and sustenance of healthy institutions, particularly of the state. The article argues that if external aid is to be helpful for institution-building in Africa's weak and fragile states, donors need to emphasise not providing more aid but minimising the risks more aid poses for this group.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Elites
External Assistance
Political Settlements

Elite Perceptions of Poverty and Inequality

Elisa P. Reis and Mick Moore, Editors. (2005)

Zed Books: London

Available at: <http://www.crop.org/viewfile.aspx?id=97>

This edited volume draws together case studies from a range of countries (Brazil, the Philippines, Bangladesh, Haiti and South Africa) on the issue of how elites perceive poverty. This is one of the first comparative exercises examining elite perceptions. The findings which emerge from these case studies highlight the plasticity of elite perceptions of poverty (p.198) and the possibilities for the formation of narratives which persuade elites to support certain types of 'pro-poor' policies (p.206). Reis and Moore therefore argue that "... a better understanding of how elites perceive poverty might contribute to public policies that will help reduce poverty." (p.207).

Methods

Survey
Interviews

Keywords

Elites
Inclusion
Exclusion

Beyond Institutions: Rethinking the Role of Leaders, Elites and Coalitions in the Institutional Formation of Developmental States and Strategies

Adrian Leftwich, (2010)

Forum for Development Studies Volume 37, Issue 1, Pages 93 - 111

Compared with economics, the engagement of political science with development studies and development policy is still (with notable exceptions) in its relative infancy. This can be illustrated by the manner in which fundamental issues of structure and agency in politics have barely been addressed in the development context. In the main, policy-makers and researchers - perhaps unwittingly, or perhaps simply oblivious to the profound epistemological and ontological issues at stake - have adopted emphatically structuralist approaches with their stress on institutions and institution building. In doing so they have not only often failed to account for the agential factors in the design, formation and maintenance of institutions, but also for the important success stories which run against the general patterns of institutional failure or corruption. This paper suggests that if researchers and policy-makers are to engage seriously with the politics of economic growth, state-building and social inclusion, they will need to have a much better analytical handle on the role of human agency in the developmental process and on the role of leaders, elites and coalitions in particular. To that end, the paper also reports on some of the initial findings of recent research conducted under the auspices of the *Leaders, Elites and Coalitions*

Research Programme (LECRP), the second phase of which is about to commence as *The Leadership Program: Developmental Leaders, Elites and Coalitions* (LPDLEC).

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Elites

Elite Coalitions

Developmental States

Leadership

Higher Education and the Formation of Developmental Elites: A literature review and preliminary data analysis

Laura Brannelly, Laura Lewis & Susy Ndaruhutse, (2011)

Developmental Leadership Program, Research Paper 10

Available at:

<http://www.dlprog.org/ftp/download/Public%20Folder/1%20Research%20Papers/Higher%20education%20and%20the%20formation%20of%20developmental%20elites.pdf>

There is increasing recognition that overcoming the challenges of development will require leadership across the public and private sectors. But how do developmental leaders emerge and acquire the necessary skills and values to lead? How might higher education influence this process, and how can it contribute towards improved governance?

This paper addresses the hitherto neglected question of whether and how higher education may contribute to the emergence of developmental leadership. It undertakes data analysis mapping higher education gross enrolment rates (GERs) with a 20-year lag against the World Bank's Worldwide Governance Indicators, used here as a proxy for the existence of developmental elites.

The study explores the multiple purposes and broadening scope of higher education, its potential for improving governance, and the changing nature of national government and donor support. As well as analysis of global patterns and regional variations, the report includes country case studies from Singapore, Jordan, Namibia and Zimbabwe.

This first phase of research has identified a positive correlation between higher education and good governance. While at this stage no definitive causation can be established, a review of literature illustrates ways in which higher education can contribute towards the formation of developmental elites. The paper also suggests some themes for future consideration, both for the international community and in planning the later stages of this research.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Statistical Analysis

Case Studies

Keywords

Elites

Developmental States

Elite Coalitions

Political Settlements

Leadership

Political Settlements is a term which has fairly recently come to be used within the development literature. The term foregrounds the interaction between institutions and the interests of powerful groups and focuses on how these interactions can work towards stability and/or development - or against it (Parks and Cole 2010, p.2; Khan 2010, p.4). Mushtaq Khan's conceptualisation of the term political settlement has been influential (Khan 2010, p.2; Di John and Putzel, 2009). He argues, that the impact of institutions depends in part upon the prior and ongoing relationship – the balance of power - between the classes and groups with which the institution engages. It is this balance of power which he terms the *political settlement*. Although Khan was not the first to use the term political settlement his work on the concept captures two key strands which continue to be significant in the way that political settlements are explored: Firstly, it gives a clear focus on the key role of negotiations and agreements between competing groups – particularly elite factions (Parks and Cole 2010, pp7-8 and 27; Di John and Putzel 2009, pp.14-17). Secondly, in its focus on classes it then draws in the relationship between these elite pacts and coalitions and the polity more broadly. The first aspect draws heavily on literature dealing with elite bargaining, whereas the second draws on a long history of political theory concerned with social contracts. Political settlements, elite bargains and social contracts are often context specific.² However, much of the political settlements literature argues that they are also highly influential on development outcomes both in terms of growth and poverty reduction (Parks and Cole, 2010; Walton, 2010).

Subsections

The use of the term political settlements to discuss the balance of power between groups and the ways in which this is maintained is a fairly recent trend within the politics literature.³ However, as indicated this term has antecedents within political theory's discussion of the relationship between state and society. Some of the texts dealing with this theme are laid out in the subsection *State-Society Relations: Antecedents to the concept of Political Settlements*.

The concept of political settlements also draws on and contributes to the literature which deals with the inter-relations of different elite groups. The subsection *Political Settlements - Elite Bargains, Elite Coalitions and Elite Resistance* details literature which deals with the role of elites especially within development and within the formation of political settlements.

The importance of political settlements both in terms of a working agreement between key elite groups and the relationship between state and society are also seen as important for state building (OECD, 2011). *Political Settlements- State Formation* subsection outlines some of the literature which deals with the relationship between the formation of the state and the ongoing negotiations of the political settlement.

² Here Charles Tilly's work on the variation in methods of state-society interaction perhaps offers a further insight into these particularities of different contexts. (Tilly, 2008).

³ The term has been used more widely in a different context to refer to a political –as opposed to military – settlement to conflict. (See Di John and Putzel 2009, p.6)

Just as political settlements are central to the production of the state they are also implicated in the type of state produced. The form of political settlement is thus implicated in the stability of particular states (Di John, 2010), as well as in how significant changes within states, such as democratisation, take place (O'Shaughnessy and Dodson, 1999). Literature dealing with how political settlements are implicated in producing stability and managing change is outlined in the *Political Settlements and Effective(?) States* subsection.

The subsection on *Political Settlements - Violence and Conflict* lays out literature which discusses how reaching a stable political settlement –balance of power – between key groups are often both; a part of the shift away from violence and conflict (DFID, 2009), and part of how violence is habitually avoided within stable states (North, Wallis and Weingast, 2009).

Much of the literature concerning political settlements deals with the state as a whole and focuses on the national level. Parks and Cole see this as one of the gaps within the literature (Parks and Cole 2010, p.3). Whilst it may be an area which is deserving of expansion there is some literature on sub-national political settlements - what Parks and Cole call Secondary Political Settlements (2010, p.18). and on particular aspects of political settlements dealing with issues such as tax and welfare. Works dealing with these sub-national and issue focused political settlements are detailed in the subsection *Sub-National and Policy Area Political Settlements*.

The *Inclusive(?) Political Settlements* subsection gathers together pieces of research which examine how political settlements can operate to include and exclude different groups. They highlight how any particular political settlement can be more or less inclusive.

Much of the literature dealing with political settlements has not necessarily used this term to describe their research as they have often been concerned with the dynamics of particular political settlements. Some of these explorations are listed in the last subsection *Analyses of Particular Political Settlements*.

Overarching Literature on Political Settlements

Political Settlements: Issues Paper

Jonathan Di John and James Putzel, (2009)

Governance and Social Development Resource Centre

Available at: <http://epapers.bham.ac.uk/645/>

Why do similar sets of formal institutions often have such divergent outcomes? An analysis of political settlements goes some way to answering this question by bringing into focus the contending interests that exist within any state, which constrain and facilitate institutional and developmental change. It provides a framework to analyse how the state is linked to society and what lies behind the formal representation of politics in a state.

The political settlement and the elite bargains from which it emerges are central to patterns of state fragility and resilience. The role of political organisation within the political settlement is crucial to both the stability of the settlement and the direction in which it evolves over time. The elite bargains that may lead to the establishment of what might be considered a resilient political settlement may also act as a barrier to progressive developmental change.

Analysis of political settlements suggests that state-building is far from a set of technical formulas, but is a highly political process. Creating capacity within a state to consolidate and expand taxation is fundamentally determined by the shape of the political settlement underlying the state. This is true as well for the development of service delivery or any other function of the state. This analytical framework provides a window for donors to grasp the politics of a place in order to design more effective interventions.

[University of Birmingham e-papers Repository Summary]

Methods

Review of Literature

Case Studies of Botswana and Malaysia

Keywords

Political Settlements

Taxation

Public Goods

Elite Bargains

Political Settlements: Implications for International Development Policy and Practice

Thomas Parks and William Cole, (2010)

The Asia Foundation, Occasional Paper No. 2

Available at: <http://asiafoundation.org/publications/pdf/745>

[...] The political settlements framework is an important new approach for international development organizations to better understand and respond to this reality and the challenges that result from political dynamics in developing countries. This framework allows policy makers and development practitioners to understand how development is driven by competition among elite groups, as an alternative to development approaches that focus on capacity-building or technical assistance.

The term “political settlement” is commonly used to describe the informal power arrangements or “social order” in a country. The key elements of a political settlement are actors, interests, and institutions. In most cases, it is a coalition of powerful elite factions that make up the key actors in a political settlement. The critical element that holds a political settlement together is the alignment of interests within the dominant elite coalition, and the dynamic relationship between elite interests and the broader array of interests in the society. Institutions are viewed as malleable – as the product of ongoing conflict, negotiation, and compromise among powerful groups, with the ruling coalition shaping and controlling this process. In most cases, power relations are fluid and dynamic, and political settlements are constantly adapting and subject to renegotiation and contestation. As a result, political settlements should not be interpreted as one-time events, but rather as rolling agreements between powerful actors.

[...]

This paper helps to translate these concepts into principles, strategies, and guidelines for practical action by donors and other development assistance organizations. The first step is to improve analysis through political settlement mapping to improve understanding of the key elements of the political settlement. This type of mapping can draw on several commonly used analytical

tools, such as political-economy analysis, actor mapping, and conflict audits, but will focus on some additional questions not addressed by these tools. The second step is to realign program or country strategy based on an analysis of key tradeoffs and plausible best-case scenarios. While the long-term objective may be to support inclusive, stable and developmental political settlements, the path to this ideal may be necessarily circuitous. Development organizations should adapt their strategies to promote the best-case scenario in the short term, while investing in long-term programs that will promote inclusiveness, development, and stability. Finally, this paper presents a set of practical approaches for international development organizations to improve their positive influence on political settlements. These approaches illustrate the variety of ways in which development assistance can be designed or modified using the political settlements framework to improve development outcomes.

[Abridged Executive Summary]

Methods

Theoretical Exploration
Review of the Literature

Keywords

Political Settlements
External Assistance

Capitalism, the state, and the underlying drivers of human development

Michael Walton (2010)

United Nations Development Programme, Human Development Reports Research Paper

Available at: http://hdr.undp.org/en/reports/global/hdr2010/papers/HDRP_2010_09.pdf

What are the underlying drivers of human development? This essay argues that long-term human development, in incomes, social conditions, security and so on, is fundamentally driven by capitalist dynamics and state functioning. The big issue is not state versus market, or growth versus equity, or dynamism versus security. It is the jointly determined functioning of both capitalism and the state. It is in particular a consequence of the extent to which both capitalist and state behaviour is oligarchic, extractive, exploitative and divisive as opposed to being inclusive, innovative, accountable, responsive and effective at mediating distributional conflict. This can be conceptualized, at a point of time, in terms of the nature of the political equilibrium, or, alternatively, the way in which social contracts work. This is a product of the historically shaped interaction between political and economic elites, and between these and various social groups. Specific policy designs of course matter, whether in terms of market-related policy, regulation, designs for social provisioning. But the ways in policy and institutional choices work, and indeed the choices societies make, is intimately linked to the nature and functioning of the underlying social contracts that in turn shape capitalist dynamics and state behaviour.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Literature Review

Keywords

Political Settlements
Poverty
State-Society Relations
State-Market Relations
Elites

Political Settlements and the Governance of Growth-Enhancing Institutions

Mushtaq H. Khan, (2010)

(Unpublished)

Available at: <http://eprints.soas.ac.uk/9968/>

It is well known that institutions work very differently across countries because their political contexts are different. It is also understood that this has important implications for the design of governance priorities in different countries. This paper develops an analysis of the 'political settlement' to provide an analytical framework for analysing institutions and governance in developing countries.

Central to this analysis is an understanding of the distribution of power. We define this as the relative holding power of different groups and organizations contesting the distribution of resources. Holding power is partly based on income and wealth but also on historically rooted capacities of different groups to organize. A political settlement emerges when the distribution of benefits supported by its institutions is consistent with the distribution of power in society, and the economic and political outcomes of these institutions are sustainable over time. In advanced countries, the distribution of power is largely based on the distribution of incomes generated by formal institutions and rights. The correspondence between power and formal institutions explains why Weberian states in advanced countries can effectively enforce formal institutions. In contrast, the distribution of power in developing countries draws significantly on organizational abilities based in non-capitalist sectors. In many cases, the historical roots of these capabilities go back to colonial history or earlier. Here, formal institutions alone cannot support distributions of benefits consistent with these distributions of power. Informal institutions like patron-client allocative rules, and informal adaptations to the ways in which particular formal institutions work play a critical role in bringing the distribution of benefits supported by the institutional structure into line with the distribution of power. Differences in the political settlement can therefore explain why developing country institutional structures are different and similar formal institutions also perform differently. The political settlement also defines the 'growth-stability trade-off' facing particular institutional changes: institutional changes cannot be implemented if their implementation pushes political stability below the tolerance limit of that society. An understanding of the political settlement can therefore provide a framework for looking at institutional performance and evolution across countries.

While all developing countries have variants of 'clientelist' political settlements, there are significant differences between these clientelist settlements. Differences between countries are examined along two dimensions: the organization of the ruling coalition and its relationship to the emerging productive sector. The analytical framework is applied to the case study countries studied in this series of papers to outline how their political settlements evolved over time in terms of these characteristics. The evolution of their political settlements is shown to be closely related to changes in their formal growth-enhancing institutions and the performance of these institutions. This analysis can therefore help to identify governance changes that can be sufficiently enforced to make a developmental difference in particular countries as well as providing a framework for understanding the paths along which the political settlement is changing in different countries.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Political Settlements

Institutions

Growth

Effective States

Protecting Soldiers and Mothers: The Political Origins of Social Policy in United States

Theda Skocpol, (1992)

Harvard University Press: Cambridge, MA

It is a commonplace that the United States lagged behind the countries of Western Europe in developing modern social policies. But, as Theda Skocpol shows in this startlingly new historical analysis, the United States actually pioneered generous social spending for many of its elderly, disabled, and dependent citizens. During the late nineteenth century, competitive party politics in American democracy led to the rapid expansion of benefits for Union Civil War veterans and their families.

[...]

Blending original historical research with political analysis, Skocpol shows how governmental institutions, electoral rules, political parties, and earlier public policies combined to determine both the opportunities and the limits within which social policies were devised and changed by reformers and politically active social groups over the course of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

[...]

[Abridged Harvard University Press Publisher's Summary:

<http://www.hup.harvard.edu/catalog.php?isbn=9780674717664>]

Methods

Historical Analysis

Keywords

Political Settlements

State-Society Relations

Public Goods

State – Society Relations: Antecedents to the concept of Political Settlements

Strong Societies and Weak States: State-Society Relations and State Capabilities in the Third World

Joel S. Migdal (1988)

Princeton University Press: Princeton, NJ

“This book offers a set of tools – a model and a theory – for approaching the difficult question of why some states succeed more and some less in realizing the visions of their leaders.

The main issues will be state capabilities or their lack: the ability of state leaders to use the agencies of the state to get people in society to do what they want them to do. Focussing on the

direct impact of states on societies however, would give us only a partial view of the relations between peoples and states and would miss important aspects of why some states are more capable than others. Societies also affect states. We will also explore how societies influence the character and style of states encountering great difficulties in getting people to follow their leaders. In addition, a full view of relations between a people and its state requires looking beyond domestic society. The calculus of state-society relations has changes dramatically because of forces outside the society altogether.”

[Extract from Prologue]

Methods

Theoretical exploration

Keywords

State-Society Relations

State in Society: Studying How States and Societies Transform and Constitute One Another

Joel S. Migdal, (2001)

Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

The essays in this book trace the development of Joel Migdal's 'state-in-society' approach. That approach illuminates how power is exercised around the world, and how and when patterns of power change. Despite the triumph of concept of state in social science literature, actual states have had great difficulty in turning public policies into planned social change. The state-in-society approach points observers to the ongoing struggles over which rules dictating how people will lead their daily lives. These struggles, which ally parts of the state and groups in society against other such coalitions, determine how societies and states create and maintain distinct ways of structuring day-to-day life - the nature of the rules that govern people's behavior, whom they benefit and whom they disadvantage, which sorts of elements unite people and which divide them, what shared meaning people hold about their relations with others and their place in the world.

[Cambridge University Press Publisher's Summary:

http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item1168255/?site_locale=en_GB]

Methods

Review of literature

Keywords

State-Society Relations

Balance of Power

Change

State Failure in Weak States: A Critique of New Institutional Explanations

Mushtaq Khan, (1995)

In The New Institutional Economics and Third World Development, John Harriss, Janet Hunter and Colin M. Lewis, Editors.

Routledge: London

“This chapter examines the implications of the new institutional economics (NIE) for analysing state failure in developing countries. The NIE approach aims to identify the institutional causes of state failure. [...]

It will be argued that the performance ranking of institutions is specific to the inherited political power of classes or groups subject to the institution. By ignoring this, NIE authors have come up with competing rankings. *Explaining* institutional performance requires an analysis of the inherited balance of power or ‘political settlement’. The institutional structure which is best for a particular society depends on its political settlement. *Responding* to institutional failures requires not just an understanding of the balance of power but also requires us to take political positions. This is not only because there are a multiplicity of potential improvements with different class and group implications. It is also because all solutions to institutional failure involve ‘political costs’ or ‘transition costs’. It is necessary to be explicit about these costs and recognise their incidence is not equal or inevitable. In attempting to sanitise the analysis of state failure by removing political judgements and political positions, NIE may have clouded rather than clarified this issue.”

[Extract from introduction]

Methods

Theoretical critique

Keywords

Political Settlements

Balance of Power

Institutions

Regimes and Repertoires

Charles Tilly, (2008)

University of Chicago Press, Chicago

The means by which people protest—that is, their repertoires of contention—vary radically from one political regime to the next. Highly capable undemocratic regimes such as China's show no visible signs of popular social movements, yet produce many citizen protests against arbitrary, predatory government. Less effective and undemocratic governments like the Sudan's, meanwhile, often experience regional insurgencies and even civil wars. In *Regimes and Repertoires*, Charles Tilly offers a fascinating and wide-ranging case-by-case study of various types of government and the equally various styles of protests they foster.

Using examples drawn from many areas—G8 summit and anti-globalization protests, Hindu activism in 1980s India, nineteenth-century English Chartists organizing on behalf of workers' rights, the revolutions of 1848, and civil wars in Angola, Chechnya, and Kosovo—Tilly masterfully shows that such episodes of contentious politics unfold like loosely scripted theater. Along the way, Tilly also brings forth powerful tools to sort out the reasons why certain political regimes vary and change, how the people living under them make claims on their government,

and what connections can be drawn between regime change and the character of contentious politics.

[University of Chicago Press Publisher's Summary:
<http://www.press.uchicago.edu/ucp/books/book/chicago/R/bo4100797.html>]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

State-Society Relations

Of the Original Contract

David Hume, (1994)

In *Hume: Political Essays* Knud Haakonssen, Editor.

Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

In this essay Hume discusses the concept of what he calls 'the original contract' between 'the people' and the sovereign and he is specifically interested in how a leader's authority is maintained. He is, however, sceptical of the idea of the sovereign's authority being derived from and resting with 'the people' in any straightforward manner, highlighting how skilled leaders may stay 'in power' through artfully managing their opposition (p.190) or through oppressive force (p.194). What is relevant for the concept of 'political settlements' is how Hume rejects a purely theoretical engagement in how this relationship between the sovereign and the people (i.e. between state and society) 'should' occur and concerns himself with 'looking abroad in the world' at the ways in which this contract or relationship is enforced and managed (p.188).

Methods

Theoretical Enquiry

Keywords

State-Society Relations

The autonomous power of the state: its origins, mechanisms and results

Michael Mann, (1984)

European Journal of Sociology, Volume 25, Pages 185-213

This essay tries to specify the origins, mechanisms and results of the autonomous power which the state possesses in relation to the major power groupings of 'civil society'. The argument is couched generally, but it derives from a large, ongoing empirical research project into the development of power in human societies. At the moment, my generalisations are bolder about agrarian societies; concerning industrial societies I will be more tentative. I define the state and then pursue the implications of that definition. I discuss two essential parts of the definition, centrality and territoriality, in relation to two types of state power, termed here *despotic* and *infrastructural* power. I argue that state autonomy, of both despotic and infrastructural forms, flows principally from the state's unique ability to provide a *territorially-centralised* form of organization.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Historical Analysis

Keywords

State-Society Relations

The Sources of Social Power: Volume I, a History of Power from the Beginning to AD 1760

Michael Mann, (1986)

Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

This is the first part of a three-volume work^[4] on the nature of power in human societies. In it, Michael Mann identifies the four principal 'sources' of power as being control over economic, ideological, military, and political resources. He examines the interrelations between these in a narrative history of power from Neolithic times, through ancient Near Eastern civilisations, the classical Mediterranean age, and medieval Europe, up to just before the Industrial Revolution in England. Rejecting the conventional monolithic concept of a 'society', Dr. Mann's model is instead one of a series of overlapping, intersecting power networks. He makes this model operational by focusing on the logistics of power - how the flow of information, manpower, and goods is controlled over social and geographical space-thereby clarifying many of the 'great debates' in sociological theory. The present volume offers explanations of the emergence of the state and social stratification; of city-states, militaristic empires, and the persistent interaction between them; of the world salvation religions; and of the peculiar dynamism of medieval and early modern Europe. It ends by generalising about the nature of overall social development, the varying forms of social cohesion, and the role of classes and class struggle in history. Volume II will continue the history of power up to the present, centering on the interrelations of nation-states and social classes. Volume III will present the theoretical conclusions of the whole work. This ambitious and provocative attempt to provide a new theoretical frame for the interpretation of the theory of societies will be challenging and stimulating reading for a wide range of social scientists, historians, and other readers concerned with understanding large-scale social and historical processes.

[Cambridge University Press Publisher's Summary:

<http://ebooks.cambridge.org/ebook.jsf?bid=CBO9780511570896>]

Methods

Historical Analysis

Keywords

State-Society Relations

⁴ However, it seems that only two volumes were published.

The Sources of Social Power: Volume 2, The Rise of Classes and Nation States 1760–1914

Michael Mann, (1993)

Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

This second volume of Michael Mann's analytical history of social power deals with power relations between the Industrial Revolution and the First World War, focusing on France, Great Britain, Hapsburg Austria, Prussia/Germany and the United States. Based on considerable empirical research it provides original theories of the rise of nations and nationalism, of class conflict, of the modern state and of modern militarism. While not afraid to generalise, it also stresses social and historical complexity. The author sees human society as 'a patterned mess' and attempts to provide a sociological theory appropriate to this. This theory culminates in the final chapter, an original explanation of the causes of the First World War.

[Cambridge University Press Publisher's Summary:

<http://ebooks.cambridge.org/ebook.jsf?bid=CBO9780511570902>]

Methods

Historical Analysis

Keywords

State-Society Relations

Politics as tragedy in several acts

James M. Buchanan, (2003)

Economics and politics, Volume 15, Issue 2, Pages 181-91

James Madison noted that government would be unnecessary if men were angels. The shortfall of value between the idealized anarchy of a society of angels and the society of men as they are measures the tragedy of politics, which emerges at several levels. Resources are required for the maintenance of order, and those agents who are guardians of order will not, themselves, be angels. Further, rents promised to such agents will attract efforts at capture. Reductions in the measure of the tragedy remain possible through both shifts in ethical standards, at all levels, and shifts in institutional-constitutional structures.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Theoretical Enquiry

Keywords

Governance

State-Society Relations

Institutions

Social Contract Theory

Michael Lessnoff, (1990)

New York University Press: New York

The concept of the 'social contract' is central to social and political theory, and is current not only within the academy, but also in the political arena, where it is frequently invoked to refer to live issues, problems and proposed solutions.

Not all of the writers who make up the historical lineage of social contract theory used the term themselves. Their works refer to 'pacts', 'compacts' and 'covenants', but they all address the same fundamental issue, seeking to explain the origins and binding force of mutual obligations and rights in society.

A social contract theory can be defined, most typically, as one which grounds the legitimacy of political authority, and the obligations of rulers and subjects (and the limits thereof), on a premised contract or contracts relating to these fundamental questions. This volume traces the theory through a series of classic essays by major theorists, from Althusius and Hobbes, through Locke and Rousseau, to Rawls and Gauthier. In his extensive opening essay, Michael Lessnoff provides a stimulating introduction to this vital topic and to the collection of classic readings on it which follows.

[Abstract from Social Contract Annotated Bibliography]

Methods

Review of literature

Keywords

State-Society Relations

Evolution of the Social Contract

Brian Skyrms, (1996)

Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

In this pithy and highly readable book, Brian Skyrms, a recognised authority on game and decision theory, investigates traditional problems of the social contract in terms of evolutionary dynamics. Game theory is skilfully employed to offer new interpretations of a wide variety of social phenomena, including justice, mutual aid, commitment, convention and meaning. The author eschews any grand, unified theory. Rather, he presents the reader with tools drawn from evolutionary game theory for the purpose of analysing and coming to understand the social contract. [...]

[Abridged Cambridge University Press Publisher's Summary:

http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item1152496/?site_locale=en_GB]

This book is perhaps of particular interest as an antecedent of political settlements as it addresses the tradition of Hume and Rousseau distinct from that of Hobbes and Rawls. This tradition, according to Skyrms, asks, "How can the existing implicit social contract have evolved? How may it continue to evolve?"(p.ix), questions pertinent to the literature on political settlements.

Methods

Theoretical Exploration

Keywords

State-Society Relations

The Political Economy of Democratic Transitions

Stephan Haggard and Robert R. Kaufman, (1997)

Comparative Politics, Volume 29, Issue 3, Pages 263-283

Dankwart A. Rustow's emphasis on elite bargaining represented an important advance over static, "structural" explanations and anticipated strategic choice models of regime change. However, these models often ignore underlying economic and social conditions that affect the resources of the contending actors and the stakes of the negotiations. Our theory of democratic transitions focuses on the way economic performance affects constitutional rules, political alignments, and institutions. It can be extended to explain the policy challenges facing new democratic governments and the prospects for consolidation.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Elite Bargains

Change

Elites and Democratic Consolidation in Latin America and Southern Europe

John Higley and Richard Gunther, (1992)

Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

A distinguished group of scholars examine recent transitions to democracy and the prospects for democratic stability in Argentina, Brazil, Chile, the Dominican Republic, Peru, Portugal, Spain and Uruguay. They also assess the role of elites in the longer-established democratic regimes in Columbia, Costa Rica, Italy, Mexico and Venezuela. The authors conclude that in independent states with long records of political instability and authoritarian rule, democratic consolidation requires the achievement of elite 'consensual unity' - that is, agreement among all politically important elites on the worth of existing democratic institutions and respect for democratic rules-of-the-game, coupled with increased 'structural integration' among those elites. Two processes by which consensual unity can be established are explored - elite settlement, the negotiating of compromises on basic disagreements, and elite convergence, a more subtle series of tactical decisions by rival elites which have cumulative effect, over perhaps a generation.

[Cambridge University Press Publisher's Summary:

http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item1142126/?site_locale=en_GB]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Elites

Elite Bargains

Political Settlements

Change

Enfranchisement, intra-elite conflict and bargaining

Sayantan Ghosal, and Eugenio Proto, (2006)

Working Paper. University of Warwick, Department of Economics, Coventry.

Available at: <http://wrap.warwick.ac.uk/1445/>

Does power sharing between competing elites result in franchise extension to non-elites? In this paper, we argue that competing, risk-averse elites will enfranchise non-elites as insurance against future, uncertain imbalances in relative bargaining power. We show that negligibly small changes in the bargaining power of non-elites, conditional on enfranchisement, via coalition formation, constrains the bargaining power of the stronger elite and result in discontinuous changes in equilibrium surplus division. Our results are robust to public good provision following enfranchisement when there is reference heterogeneity over the location of the public good across the different elites. We conclude with a comparative analysis of Indian democracy and show that our model is able to account for some of the distinctive features of Indian democracy.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Elite Bargains

Inclusion

Public Goods

Ethnic bargaining and state breakdown in Africa

Donald Rothchild, (1995)

Nationalism and Ethnic Politics, Volume 1, Issue 1, 1995, Pages 54 - 72

This article analyses the dynamics of state-society relationships in Africa through the prism of changing bargaining relationships in three contexts: the colonial hegemonic regime, the post-colonial hegemonic regime, and the mixed patterns of the contemporary period. It finds that, with the exception of the new, multiparty democratic orders, ethnic bargaining has proved more of a transitional expedient than a method of furthering regularity in political exchange relations over an extended time period. Ethnic bargaining is an indispensable means of promoting the change from colonial rule to independence, facilitating societal compromise and co-operation within an ongoing authoritarian regime (that is, hegemonic exchange), and putting the collapsed state back together again (in most cases, as a pact among elites). However, such instrumental bargaining encounters are limited in what they can achieve. They can promote exchanges among tangible political and economic resources, but are not sufficient to ensure adherence over time to basic norms or to political exchange practices.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Elite Bargains

State-Society Relations

Political Settlements

Institutional Change and Political Continuity in Post-Soviet Central Asia: Power, Perceptions, and Pacts

Pauline Jones Luong, (2002)

Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

The establishment of electoral systems in Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan presents both a complex set of empirical puzzles and a theoretical challenge. Why did three states with similar cultural, historical, and structural legacies establish such different electoral systems? How did these distinct outcomes result from strikingly similar institutional design processes? Explaining these puzzles requires understanding not only the outcome of institutional design but also the intricacies of the process that led to this outcome. Moreover, the transitional context in which these three states designed new electoral rules necessitates an approach that explicitly links process and outcome in a dynamic setting. This book provides such an approach. Finally, it both builds on the key insights of the dominant approaches to explaining institutional origin and change and transcends these approaches by moving beyond the structure versus agency debate.

[Cambridge University Press Publisher's Summary:

http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item1168614/?site_locale=en_GB]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Elite Bargains

Institutions

Change

Political Settlements

The Elite Variable in Democratic Transitions and Breakdowns

John Higley and Michael G. Burto, (1989)

American Sociological Review, Volume 54, Issue 1, Pages 17-32

Stable democratic regimes depend heavily on the "consensual unity" of national elites. So long as elites remain disunited, political regimes are unstable, a condition which makes democratic transitions and democratic breakdowns merely temporary oscillations in the forms unstable regimes take. Disunity appears to be the generic condition of national elites, and disunity strongly tends to persist regardless of socioeconomic development and other changes in mass populations. The consensually unified elites that are necessary to stable democracies are created in only a few ways, two of the most important of which involve distinctive elite transformations. After elaborating this argument, we examine the relationship between elites and regimes in Western nation-states since they began to consolidate after 1500. We show that our approach makes good sense of the Western political record, that it does much to clarify prospects for stable democracies in developing societies today, and that it makes the increasingly elite-centered analysis of democratic transitions and breakdowns more systematic.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Historical Analysis

Keywords

Elite Bargains
Elite Coalitions
Change
Democracy

Do inclusive elite bargains matter? A research framework for understanding the causes of civil war in Sub-Saharan Africa

Stefan Lindemann (2008)

Crisis States Research Centre, Discussion Paper No. 15

London School of Economics

Available at:

<http://www2.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/crisisStates/Publications/discussion/dp15.aspx>

Sub-Saharan Africa combines all the major risk factors commonly associated with the onset of civil war. Accordingly, it is the world's most conflict-intensive region, with 24 out of 48 countries having experienced civil war over the past 50 years. Yet at the same time, half of its crisis-ridden states have managed to maintain political stability despite the odds. Trying to resolve this puzzle, I begin by reviewing the five most influential theoretical approaches in the civil war literature and find that they ultimately all fall short of explaining the observed differences in political stability. In the light of these shortcomings, the paper then outlines an alternative approach to the study of civil war focusing on differences in the inclusiveness of elite politics. My main argument is that the postcolonial trajectories of civil war versus political stability in different states across Sub-Saharan Africa are largely determined by the varying ability of ruling political parties to overcome the specific historical legacy of high social fragmentation, by forging and maintaining 'inclusive elite bargains'. While 'inclusive elite bargains' permit the maintenance of political stability, 'exclusionary elite bargains' give rise to trajectories of civil war. The paper concludes with brief methodological remarks on how to explore the plausibility of my argument and argues in favour of a case-study approach of 'structured, focused comparison'.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Comparative approach

Keywords

Elite Bargains
Inclusion
Exclusion

Inclusive Elite Bargains and Civil War Avoidance: the case of Zambia

Stefan Lindemann (2010)

Crisis States Working Papers, Series 2, Working Paper No. 77

London School of Economics

Available at:

<http://www2.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/crisisStates/Publications/wpPhase2/wp77.aspx>

This paper considers the reasons behind Zambia's avoidance of civil war, despite persistent regional instability, focusing on the inclusiveness of the country's 'elite bargain', i.e. the inter-group distribution of access to positions of state power. The author hypothesises that, although colonial rule left Zambia with high levels of social fragmentation - evident in pronounced tribal, linguistic and class cleavages - the country's post-colonial governments have all managed to accommodate the colonial legacy of high social fragmentation by forging and maintaining inclusive elite bargains. The paper argues that this achievement can be directly related to the avoidance of civil war since independence in 1964.

[Summary from LSE CSRC Website]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Elite Bargains

Exclusionary Elite Bargains and Civil War Onset: the case of Uganda

Stefan Lindemann (2010)

Crisis States Working Papers, Series 2, Working Paper No. 76

London School of Economics

Available at:

<http://www2.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/crisisStates/Publications/wpPhase2/wp76.aspx>

This paper examines the history of civil wars in Uganda through the concept of 'elite bargains', arguing that allowing a biased access to positions of state power fails to accommodate the dominant social cleavages and is more likely to lead to civil war. Drawing on the definition of 'elite bargains' as developed at the Crisis States Research Centre, as well as on the wider literature surrounding issues of state power and the distribution of rights and entitlements, the paper draws a distinction between 'inclusive' and 'exclusionary' bargains and their differential outcomes.

[Summary from LSE CSRC Website]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Elite Bargains

Elites, Crises, and the Origins of Regimes

Mattei Dogan and John Higley. Editors. (1998)

Rowman and Littlefield: Lanham, Maryland

Most political regimes, whether authoritarian or democratic, are born in abrupt, brutal, and momentous crises. In this volume, a group of prominent scholars explores how these seminal events affect elites and shape regimes. Combining theoretical and case study chapters, the authors draw from a wide range of historical and contemporary examples to challenge mainstream developmental explanations of political change, which emphasize incremental changes and evolutions stretching over generations. Instead, the authors argue here, political leaders and elites possess significant autonomy and latitude for maneuver, especially in times of crisis. Elites' choices are frequently decisive in the making of regimes and the forging of national political histories. Providing a sustained comparative analysis of elites, their circulation, and behavior across times and countries, this lucid volume will be invaluable for scholars and students alike.

[Rowman and Littlefield Publishers Summary

<http://www.rowmanlittlefield.com/Catalog/SingleBook.shtml?command=Search&db=^DB/CATALOG.db&eqSKUdata=0847690237>]

Methods

Theoretical engagement

Case Studies

Keywords

Change

Political Settlements

Elites

Elite Coalitions

Limited Access Orders in the Developing World: A New Approach to the Problems of Development

Douglass C. North, John Joseph Wallis, Steven B. Webb, and Barry R. Weingast, (2007)

Policy Research working paper, WPS 4359, World Bank, Washington, D.C.

Available at: <http://139.184.194.47/go/display&type=Document&id=3989>

The upper-income, advanced industrial countries of the world today all have market economies with open competition, competitive multi-party democratic political systems, and a secure government monopoly over violence. Such open access orders, however, are not the only norm and equilibrium type of society. The middle and low-income developing countries today, like all countries before about 1800, can be understood as limited access orders that maintain their equilibrium in a fundamentally different way. In limited access orders, the state does not have a secure monopoly on violence, and society organizes itself to control violence among the elite factions. A common feature of limited access orders is that political elites divide up control of the economy, each getting some share of the rents. Since outbreaks of violence reduce the rents, the elite factions have incentives to be peaceable most of the time. Adequate stability of the rents and thus of the social order requires limiting access and competition—hence a social order with a fundamentally different logic than the open access order. This paper lays out such a framework and explores some of its implications for the problems of development today.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Elite Coalitions

Political Settlements

Violence and Conflict

Perpetuating Poverty in Sub-Saharan Africa: How African Political Elites Undermine Entrepreneurship and Economic Development

Moeletsi Mbeki, (2005)

International Policy Network, London

Available at: <http://www.policynetwork.net/development/publication/perpetuating-poverty-sub-saharan-africa-how-african-political-elites-undermi>

Most countries in sub-Saharan Africa have experienced declining growth and increasing poverty since independence. This can be attributed to Africa's political elites, who have driven their economies backwards by misusing their countries' economic surplus. This paper published by International Policy Press examines the consequences of the exploitation of the state by Africa's political elites. It argues that a vibrant private sector is essential for economic growth, but the development of entrepreneurship is constrained by Africa's political elites.

[...]

Average per capita income in Africa is now lower than in the 1960s. This is largely because the private sector has been constrained from driving economic development by unproductive political elites. South Africa is unique as the power of South Africa's elite is limited by the absence of a large passive peasantry. Also, the private sector is owned mainly by South African citizens who have a say in the political process. Elsewhere, political elites affect Africa's development in several ways:

- Political elites use marketing and taxation to divert agricultural surplus to finance their own consumption and strengthen the state's repressive instruments.
- Oil revenues allow elites to become detached from the local economy and provide them with funds to repress the local population.
- Foreign-owned companies are subjected to various official and unofficial taxes, ranging from bribes to artificially high tariffs.
- Political elites obstruct industry and divert profits for elite consumption, affecting industrial growth. Sub-Saharan Africa has de-industrialised since 1970.

[...]

[Abridged Summary from GSDRC Website]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Elites

State-Market Relations

State-Society Relations

Growth

Bureaucrats, peasants and the dominant coalition: An Egyptian case study

Richard H. Adams Jr. (1986)

Journal of Development Studies, Volume 22, Issue 2, Pages 336 - 354

This article challenges the thesis that local-level bureaucrats need be part of any 'dominant coalition' at the village level. Based on a case study of Egyptian agricultural officials, the paper argues that local bureaucrats may well be more useless than dominant in any political or economic sense. In rural areas in which local officials lack the resources (supplies, funds) to do their jobs, they may well be quite inconsequential. In such situations their position as 'public servants' may be appropriated by members of the rich peasantry, who have no particular need to work closely with resource-poor local government staff.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Bureaucracy

Elite Coalitions

Inclusion

Exclusion

Leaders, Elites and Coalitions in the Development of Botswana

David Subudubudu, with Patrick Molutsi, (2009)

Developmental Leadership Program, Research Paper 02

Available at: <http://www.dlprog.org/ftp/>

This study, the first of its kind, analyses the inner political story of leaders, elite interactions and coalition formation in the processes of development in Botswana. Its focus is on the role of leaders, elites and coalitions in making Botswana a successful 'developmental state'. It examines the origins, types and operations of Botswana's leaders, the elite in general and different elite coalitions and their workings over the past four decades following the country's independence in 1966. The study focuses on their workings in both formal and informal settings; on political, economic and social interactions (for instance between traditional and modern leaders) and on inter-ethnic and inter-racial coalitions. Through this analysis it isolates what can be identified as moments of coalition, that is specific moments which show the importance of leaders and elite coalitions in decision making.

Our analysis goes beyond the standard institutional and policy-focussed approaches. It identifies elite and coalitional strategies, behaviours and decisions that made an impact on the development policy and practices of the country which, at the same time, held the leaders and elites together as functioning coalitions which were able to reproduce themselves, a rare feature in Africa. The study also points to the way in which the interactions of leaders and elites in forming cross-cutting coalitions were shaped and framed by local factors and institutional contexts.

[...] Instead, it was the leadership's conscious effort to shape Botswana into what it is today – a functioning democratic 'developmental state' – that has been of primary importance (Leftwich, 1995). As in any society, there were and there remain challenges and threats which have been dealt with through the medium of an institutional and policy framework that was locally devised,

locally legitimate and locally appropriate and which ensured broad consultation, participation and consensus building.

[Abridged Executive Summary]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Interviews

Keywords

Elite Coalitions

Political Settlements

Developmental States

Leadership

Cadres, Capitalists and Coalitions: The ANC, Business and Development in South Africa

Jo Ansie van Wyk, (2009)

Developmental Leadership Program, Research Paper 01

Available at: <http://www.dlprog.org/ftp/>

The transition from apartheid to democracy in South Africa is widely regarded as an exemplary case study of an elite political settlement. Moreover, South Africa's political history in the last two decades can be written, and certainly understood, in terms of the way old, new, political and economic elites interacted in different domains and sectors to resolve major collective action problems and produce institutional solutions that would work, even if contentious.

The settlement achieved by opposing elites produced a unique democratic pact. However, less attention is paid to the economic pact achieved by these elites. As a liberation movement, the African National Congress (ANC) advocated nationalisation to undo socio-economic legacies of apartheid, but once the political transition commenced, it discarded nationalisation. Instead ANC elites opted for pro-business/ market policies, which stabilised the economy and attracted much needed foreign direct investment. ANC elites' decision is partly attributable to the negotiated political and economic pacts which ANC elites concluded with National Party elites and white capital. Once the political or democratic pact was in place the negotiation and consolidation of the economic pact was achieved with the formation of numerous formal and informal coalitions with, first, white and then, later, black capital to undo the economic legacies of apartheid. Not only did it result in a stable political transition, but also in political and economic transformation.

More important, early signs of a developmental pact are evident which may result in a successful developmental state to achieve equality and equity to all in post apartheid South Africa.

[Executive Summary]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Analysis of Documents and Biographies

Keywords

Elite Coalitions

Political Settlements

State-Market Relations

Change

Introducing Political Settlements

Eric Gutierrez, (2011)

Christian Aid, Occasional Paper Number 4

Available at: <http://www.christianaid.org.uk/images/final-political-settlements-paper.pdf>

“Powerful local and national elites remain the ‘elephants in the room’ in discussions about international development. They are always in a position, and by definition have the power, to flout, coopt, thwart or even reverse good governance reforms and development-enhancing institutional change. Yet their influence is typically ignored; the analysis of their roles routinely depoliticised.

Warning signs are telling us that this needs to change. Corrupt politicians are reviled, yet they win the vote. Violent criminals are detested, yet many become *de facto* authorities, dispensing street justice. The reach of corruption in many countries has been more extensive than assumed. The understanding of political contestation has become confused. In other words, more analysis of the distribution of power held by different elite and interest groups in countries has become necessary to make reforms realistic and changes more firmly embedded.

In many circumstances, reforms can succeed only if allowed or tolerated by powerful elites who cannot be dislodged or pushed out. More studies now demonstrate that successful reforms and institutional change have not been forced upon but were in fact partly driven by elites, who found it in their interest to do so. For example, the social welfare programmes that brought stability to many developed countries were not forced on an unwilling capitalist class – ‘firms and business leaders cooperated in the creation of these programs’. (North et al, 2009:144)

So there seems to be no choice but to negotiate a bargain with, or present an arrangement to, such elites to create a ‘political settlement’, allowing space for development and growth to take root. A political settlement has been defined as ‘the balance or distribution of power between contending social groups and social classes, on which any state is based’. They are also ‘rolling agreements, at national or subnational level, among powerful actors that are constantly subject to renegotiation and contestation’. (Di John and Putzel, 2009; Parks and Cole, July 2010)

Shaping emerging political settlements in developing countries will be a great challenge. Yet it is a necessary step towards fixing poor governance and removing barriers to the institutional change needed to advance growth and development in poorer nations.”

[Extract from Paper]

Methods

Literature Review

Keywords

Political Settlements

Elite Coalitions

External Assistance

Understanding state-building from a political economy perspective: an analytical and conceptual paper on processes, embedded tensions and lessons for international engagement.

V. Fritz; A.R. Menocal (2007)

Report for DFID's Effective and Fragile States Teams , Overseas Development Institute (ODI), London.

Available at: <http://www.eldis.org/go/home&id=40139&type=Document>

In the new millennium, state-building has become a leading priority for the international development community. This paper provides a more conceptually informed understanding of state-building, adopting a political economy perspective. It considers state formation and state-building as long-term, tumultuous and conflict-ridden processes that are also deeply political.

The main arguments advanced in this paper include:

- state-building is now a major issue of concern, but it lacks conceptual clarity, including in language
- there is a broad understanding that state-building is about controlling violence, establishing legitimacy and building capable and responsive institutions so as to foster a shared sense of the public realm. These are all long-term and potentially conflict-ridden processes
- state-building is a leading priority in fragile (and mostly post-conflict) settings, but ongoing state-building challenges persist in states in comparatively more 'normal' developing settings
- while achieving outputs are the key rationale for supporting state-building, it is important to pay sufficient attention to the core or constitutive dimensions of the state – including the political settlement, security and basic administrative structures. If these constitutive domains remain weak, states are not able to deliver output functions in a sustained and reliable way

[...]

[Abridged ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Review of literature

Keywords

State Formation

External Assistance

Political Settlements

Clientelism

States in Development: Understanding State Building

Alan Whaites, (2008)

Department for International Development (DFID) Working Paper

Available at: <http://tna.europarchive.org/20081212094836/http://dfid.gov.uk/pubs/files/State-in-Development-Wkg-Paper.pdf>

Why do some states manage state-building better than others? How can development actors support positive state-building? This paper from the UK Department for International Development's Governance and Social Development Group examines factors leading to positive or negative state development. International actors should consider underlying realities, and put social, economic and political analysis into a historical context. Sequencing within each of the three areas of state-building (political settlements, survival functions and expected functions) is important.

State-building is the process through which states enhance their ability to function. The structures of the state are determined by an underlying political settlement; the forging of a common understanding, usually among elites, that their interests or beliefs are served by a particular way of organising political power.

International architecture for economic, political and development cooperation is based on assumptions about state capability and structure that do not take account of complex realities. Two contrasting models of state-building highlight this complexity, with many states having some characteristics of both responsive and unresponsive state-building.

Responsive state-building involves three necessary areas of progress. First, a political settlement must be established. Then the state created must fulfil three core 'survival' functions: security (controlling the use of violence), revenue (raising funds, particularly through taxation), and ruling through law. Lastly, the state must achieve 'expected' functions, fulfilling expectations from its own citizens and external actors on issues such as social provision, policing, and roads. Efforts to build capacity bring the state into greater contact with society, fuelling pressure for it to respond to expectations.

Unresponsive states lack drive towards capacity and accountability and are often ineffective, repressive and corrupt. Causes of unresponsive state-building include difficulties in satisfying key elites, domestic pressures, and poorly designed political institutional structures. Other problematic issues are ideological constraints, globalised crime and international corruption.

Confidence in potential progress is crucial for responsive state-building: settlements must appear durable and capable, and the state must respect the rule of law. However, confidence can be undermined by spoilers, including unreconciled elites, globalised crime and access to arms. Other findings include the following:

- Growth and state-building have a mutually reinforcing relationship.
- Creating a revenue base through taxation can generate public confidence in the state's permanence.
- An external threat can focus the minds of elites. Internal threats also provide focus: if stakeholders perceive threats from other parts of society, they may see the state as a protector.
- Political inclusion is important, particularly if political settlements are to keep pace with social change.
- External actors can help or hinder. Outsiders can confer a degree of legitimacy to new political settlements, for example.

- Some political settlements inherit a strong infrastructural legacy, others are hampered by weak institutions. Some leaders have a clear state-building agenda, while others take a patronage-based approach.

[...]

[Abridged summary from GSDRC Website:

<http://www.gsdr.org/go/display&type=Document&id=3264>]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

State Formation

Political Settlements

State-Society Relations

Inclusion

States in Development: State-building and Service Delivery

Jack Eldon and Derek Gunby, (2009)

Available at: <http://www.gsdr.org/go/display&type=Document&id=3377>

How, when and why do basic services matter for responsive state building? This paper from HLSP uses cases studies from Cambodia, Nigeria, South Sudan and Zimbabwe to explore these questions. It is part of wider research on fragile states and Whaites' model of 'responsive' and 'unresponsive' states. The relationship between state responsiveness and service delivery is not straightforward. Fragility, violence, patronage, ethnicity and economic growth all play a part. To maximise the state building impacts of service delivery, donors should seek to develop the state's ability to: (i) provide strategic oversight; (ii) manage and, where appropriate, deliver basic services.

[...]

Five key contextual factors that have helped shape political settlements and influenced the trajectory of state (un)responsiveness emerge from the case studies. These factors are:

- *Fragility*: Responsive state building is the process of developing states that are legitimate; have political processes to manage conflict; have basic organisational and institutional capacity and access to resources. Fragile states lack some or all of these characteristics.
- *Violence and instability*: It is unsurprising that states affected by conflict face difficulties establishing responsive service delivery. But there is evidence that services can help gain support during conflict and be part of the 'peace dividend'.
- *Patronage*: Corruption and patronage are present in all four case studies. They form 'shadow states'; informal networks operating in parallel to state structures. Local elites use manipulation to enhance their power and wealth, often actively undermining state effectiveness.
- *Ethnicity*: Ethnic and religious differences have played a role in the political economies of Nigeria, Sudan and Zimbabwe. These differences are exploited as a way of diverting discontent about wider social and political problems.
- *The role of economic growth*: Opportunities for economic growth can be critical to whether elites are defensive or confident during state building. Economic growth can also increase opportunities to escape fragility.

Donor policy and practice must be rooted in an understanding of the state building process and the trade-offs it involves. Donors should understand the state building trajectory and recognise stages at which support can make a difference. They should support emerging political settlements, especially those that can evolve as responsive states, and state stability, but recognise trade-offs between security and fostering an open society. Long term engagement is needed to support accountability. [...]

[Abridged Summary from GSDRC Website]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Clientelism

Ethnicity

Public Goods

State Formation

Political Settlements

Developmental Crises: A Comparative-Historical Analysis of State-Building in Colonial Botswana and Malaysia

Matthew Lange, (2009)

Commonwealth and Comparative Politics, Volume 47, Issue 1, Pages 1-27

The construction of states with the capacity to provide collective goods is a common developmental goal, yet state-building is a very difficult process that cannot be accomplished at will. This article investigates factors that make possible punctuated state institutional change through a comparative-historical analysis of two former British colonies: Botswana and Malaysia. It provides evidence that crises have the potential to break institutional inertia and thereby create openings for relatively rapid and extensive state-building. In particular, crises can promote reforms by transforming incentives, readjusting power relations, and forging a political consensus. Both cases also show that these changes occurred during the late colonial period and therefore provide evidence that colonial transitions had the potential to adjust the institutional legacies of colonialism.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

State Formation

State-Society Relations

Elite Coalitions

Political Settlements

Critical elements underpinning statebuilding

OECD, (2011)

In Supporting Statebuilding in Situations of Conflict and Fragility: Policy Guidance, OECD Publishing.

doi: [10.1787/9789264074989-7-en](https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264074989-7-en)

Available at: http://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/development/supporting-statebuilding-in-situations-of-conflict-and-fragility/critical-elements-underpinning-statebuilding_9789264074989-7-en

There are three critical elements of statebuilding that underpin the social contract and are at the core of state-society relations: (i) political settlement and political processes through which state and society are connected; (ii) state capability and responsiveness to effectively perform its principal state functions; and (iii) social expectations. In addition to analysing these three elements, this chapter also examines state legitimacy and its sources.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Theoretical Exploration

Keywords

Political Settlements

State Formation

Double-edged swords: armies, elite bargaining and state building

Antonio Giustozzi, (2011)

Crisis States Research Centre, Series 2, Working Paper No. 86

London School of Economics

Available at:

<http://www2.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/crisisStates/Publications/phase2papers.aspx>

This paper proposes a framework for the study of the role of armies in elite bargaining and state building. The author accepts that the institutionalisation of the army and its subordination to the political elite has proved a successful path for most western democracies, but argues that this same path may not be attractive or feasible for ruling elites in every circumstance, particularly in fragile or developmental states. The paper describes a range of alternative approaches and highlights the trade-offs implicit in each of them. The author draws on examples from a wide range of countries studied during the Centre's second phase of work, including Afghanistan, Colombia, DR Congo, Pakistan, Tanzania, Uganda and Zambia.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of literature

Keywords

Political Settlements

Elite Coalitions

State Formation

Collapse, war and reconstruction in Rwanda: An analytical narrative on state-making

Frederick Golooba-Mutebi, (2008)

Crisis States Research Programme (CSRC) Working Paper No. 28

London School of Economics

Available at:

<http://www2.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/crisisStates/Publications/phase2papers.aspx>

Rwanda entered independence following a transition marked by violent internecine conflict. The conflict was stoked by the departing colonial rulers as they sought to place control of the levers of state in the hands of an ethnic majority, which they had hitherto marginalised in favour of a minority they now sought to exclude. It carried on into the country's post-colonial politics. For nearly three decades Rwanda's post-colonial rulers presided over an ethnocracy that perpetuated the negative colonial legacy of ethnic division. They systematically practiced a politics of exclusion and repression that placed the country's long-term stability under threat, eventually led to civil war, and culminated in the genocide of 1994. After the genocide and the defeat and overthrow of the ancient regime of ethnic supremacists, the new ruling elite - most of whom had spent nearly three decades in exile or been born there - embarked on re-building a collapsed state and re-ordering the country's politics. The last fourteen years have witnessed deliberate efforts to re-orient the country away from three decades of politics of division and exclusion under the First and Second Republics, towards a system which privileges national reconciliation and unity, equity, and inclusion. This paper examines developments in post-1994 Rwanda against the background of pre-1994 politics and society, and the factors that led to and facilitated the war that culminated in the genocide and eventual overthrow of the Second Republic. It provides insights into the efforts and achievements made by the new ruling elites in pursuit of long-term peace and stability. A great deal, however, remains inadequately explored, including political organisation and the role of political parties, economic reform and management, and the reform and management of the security sector, all of which are the focus of on-going research.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Political Settlements

State Formation

Change

The Role of Public Services in State- and Nation-building: Exploring Lessons from European History for Fragile States

Steven Van de Walle and Zoe Scott, Z. (2009)

GSDRC Research Paper, Governance and Social Development Resource Centre, Birmingham

Available at: <http://www.gsdr.org/go/display&type=Document&id=3541>

What role can public service delivery play in state-building? This article explores lessons from Western European history to argue that the design of public services is a far more political matter than is often recognised. Rather than being a neutral process, a historical review of service provision shows that it has been used as a political tool for building state legitimacy and concepts

of nationhood. The paper concludes that donors need to rethink their approaches to service provision in fragile states in light of these findings.

Concerns about failed and fragile states have put state- and nation-building firmly on the academic and policy agenda. The crucial role of public services in this process, however, remains underexplored. While significant focus is placed on 'how' to deliver services in weak or fragile contexts, less attention is paid to the political impact of these interventions. This omission ignores the inherently political role public service delivery has played in state formation and consolidation throughout history.

Public services make the state visible to its citizens, often forming the principal tangible link between governments and their people. Public services carry and diffuse the values of the new nations and contribute to the bonding between the state and citizens. An analysis of Western European history reveals three main processes through which public services have contributed to state- and nation-building. [...]

[Abridged Summary from GSDRC Website]

Methods

Historical Comparison

Keywords

State Formation

Public Goods

State-Society Relations

Elites

Political Settlements and Effective(?) States

Signposts to More Effective States: Responding to Governance Challenges in Developing Countries

Sue Unsworth (2005)

The Centre for the Future State, Institute of Development Studies, Sussex

Available at: <http://www2.ids.ac.uk/gdr/cfs/pdfs/SignpoststoMoreEffectiveStates.pdf>

“Unlike conventional approaches that start with the symptoms of bad governance and look for solutions, the DRC research is concerned with the underlying causes. It starts with a proposition – well known to political scientists but less familiar to many policymakers – that the critical issue in state building lies in striking a balance between effectiveness and accountability. The challenge was eloquently expressed by James Madison in the ‘Federalist Papers’: ‘In forming a government to be administered by men over men, the great difficulty lies in this: you must first enable the government to control the governed; and in the next place oblige it to control itself’.

Historically this has happened through a process of interaction, bargaining and competition between holders of state power and organised groups in society. This has often involved violent conflict, but it can also produce positive sum outcomes, if the parties involved can identify common interests and negotiate arrangements to pursue them. Over time this may lead to more civic ways of managing competing interests, and result in the creation of legitimate, stable institutions: arrangements which are valued – and thus become ‘institutionalised’ – because they

are seen to serve a common purpose. A prime example of this in the history of state building in Western Europe was the process of bargaining which took place between rulers and organised groups over the payment of tax.”

[Extract from Report]

Methods

Review of Research

Keywords

Political Settlements

State-Society Relations

Governance

Taxation, Resource Mobilisation and State Performance

Jonathan DiJohn, (2010)

Crisis States Research Centre, Series 2, Working Paper No. 84

London School of Economics

Available at:

<http://www2.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/crisisStates/Publications/phase2papers.aspx>

This paper presents the findings of research on the political economy of taxation undertaken in several countries by the Crisis States Research Centre. The countries considered in the research are Zambia, Rwanda, Mozambique, Uganda, Tanzania, Democratic Republic of Congo, Afghanistan, the Philippines and Colombia. The paper has five main aims. First, it identifies how patterns of taxation can be a useful indicator of state performance in general, and the extent to which a state tends to be more fragile or more resilient in particular. Second, it explores the relationship between elite bargains and patterns of taxation. In particular, it explains how taxation reflects the nature of elite bargains and, in turn, how the dynamics of elite bargains affect tax patterns and capacity. Third, it assesses how aid flows affect patterns of state-building. In particular, it focuses on the extent to which aid creates problems of the 'dual public sector'. Fourth, it considers the links between taxation and production strategies, that is, the extent to which taxation is developmental. Finally, it suggests policy implications that emerge from the research and suggests areas for further investigation.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of Research

Keywords

Effective States

Taxation

State Formation

Elite Bargains

Legitimacy

State-Society Relations

State-Building Taxation for Developing Countries: Principles for Reform

Max Everest-Phillips, (2010)

Development Policy Review, Volume. 28, Issue 1, Pages 75-96

The practical implications of adopting a state-building approach to tax reform need clarity now that the international community has come to recognise the importance of taxation as a 'state-building' process. This article seeks to address this gap. It identifies seven operating principles (political inclusion; accountability and transparency; perceived fairness; effectiveness; political commitment to shared prosperity; legitimisation of social norms and economic interests; and effective revenue-raising) as the essential characteristics for state-building taxation, and offers recommendations on potential reforms to implement them, illustrated by DFID/World Bank tax reforms in Yemen, Sierra Leone and Vietnam.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Taxation

Legitimacy

State Formation

Inclusion

State resilience against the odds: an analytical narrative on the construction and maintenance of political order in Zambia since 1960

Jonathan Di John, (2010)

Crisis States Research Centre (CRSC) Working Paper Series 2 No. 75.

London School of Economics

Available at: <http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/28393/>

This paper attempts to explain why the Zambian state has remained resilient over the period 1960-2010 despite confronting a substantial set of crises and unfavourable 'initial conditions', which include: one of the worst declines in per capita income in sub-Saharan Africa since 1970, a heavy debt burden, dramatic price and production declines in its main export (copper), one of the continent's most unequal distributions of income, one of the worst HIV/AIDS epidemics in the world, declines in its Human Development Index in every decade since 1980, relatively high levels of poverty, substantial influxes of refugees (particularly in the 1990s) that reached as high as 200,000, high transport costs as a result of being a landlocked economy, and being surrounded by five countries that have experienced civil wars and political disorder.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Key Words

Political Settlements

Elite Coalitions

States and Social Contracts in Africa

Paul Nugent, (2010)

New Left Review, Volume 63, Pages 35 -68

Available at: <http://www.newleftreview.org/?issue=297>

Nugent critiques what he sees as the recent absence of political analyses of state institutions in Africa. He argues that whilst, “‘[b]ringing the state back in’ has become a cliché, [...] there is a need to integrate an analysis of social dynamics with a closer examination of African state logics”. He contends that a return to a focus on political economy and the utilisation of a comparative approach would provide a means of access to the complexities of state – society interactions within Africa. For Nugent, these complex realities require a multi-scalar approach and a clear focus on the way in which inequalities are produced. In this article he explores the formation of, challenges to and alteration of, social contracts within Ghana, Togo, Senegal and the Gambia. He begins by examining how these contracts were formed during the colonial period, outlining the variations in content between the different states. He then goes on to examine how post-colonial experiences have altered, adapted or reinforced these social contracts. In the final section of the article, Nugent examines the prospects for the emergence of new forms of social contracts in Africa and proposes that there are three changes which would promote healthier social contracts: Firstly, the establishment of a tax regime which allows for negotiation between citizens and the state; secondly, the increased role of the state as a service provider; and thirdly the reestablishment of the role of the state in supporting agriculture.

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Political Settlements

State-Society Relations

Effective States

Political Bargaining and Democratic Transitions: A Comparison of Nicaragua and El Salvador

Laura Nuzzi O'Shaughness and Michael Dodson, (1999)

Journal of Latin American Studies, Volume 31, Issue 1, Pages 99-127

The relationship between pact making & democratic transitions is compared in Nicaragua (1988-1997) & El Salvador (1990-1997). Arguing that the process of elite bargaining about regime change affects prospects for the consolidation of democracy, three factors are emphasized: (1) choices that key actors make as they bargain about bargaining, (2) their willingness to underutilize their power, & (3) the influence of historical & structural contingencies on key choices made. Essential to this discussion of historical & structural contingencies are the interrelation of domestic & international actors & the importance of demilitarization & institutional reform. These three factors favored El Salvador over Nicaragua, although neither nation has overcome the political polarization characteristic of transitional regimes.

[IBSS Abstract]

Methods

Comparative Case Studies

Keywords

Political Settlements

Elite Bargains

Democracy

Understanding social trajectories: structure and actor in the democratisation debate

Vedi R. Hadiz (2008-2009)

Pacific affairs, Volume 81, Issue 4, Pages 527-536, 2008-2009

This article offers a structuralist approach to understanding social trajectories following the demise of authoritarian regimes. It does so by analyzing the case of Indonesia in the context of debates about democratization more broadly, whether in Southeast Asia or elsewhere. The paper presents the argument that although Indonesia today is clearly a democracy, it is important to comprehend the kind of democracy that has been entrenched, and why this has been possible. Prevalent actor-based approaches, such as that found within 'transitology,' as well as 'good-governance' perspectives, tend to emphasize institutional change based on either elite pacts or technocratic crafting. More important, however, is to understand the power relations that underlie institutions and thereby determine the way they actually operate-often in ways that are different from design or intention. This requires analyses of the nature of specific constellations of social power and interest, and the sorts of coalitions that actually preside over institutions of governance-a hallmark of structuralist approaches.

[IBSS Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Elites

Political Settlements

Institutions

Institutions as the Fundamental Cause of Long-Run Growth

Daron Acemoglu, Simon Johnson and James Robinson, (2005)

In Handbook of Economic Growth, Volume 1A. Philippe Aghion and Steven N. Durlauf, Editors.

Elsevier B.V.: Amsterdam

Available at: <http://baselinescenario.files.wordpress.com/2010/01/institutions-as-a-fundamental-cause.pdf>

This paper develops the empirical and theoretical case that differences in economic institutions are the fundamental cause of differences in economic development. We first document the empirical importance of institutions by focusing on two "quasi-natural experiments" in history, the division of Korea into two parts with very different economic institutions and the colonization of much of the world by European powers starting in the fifteenth century. We then develop the basic outline of a framework for thinking about why economic institutions differ across countries. Economic institutions determine the incentives of and the constraints on economic actors, and shape economic outcomes. As such, they are social decisions, chosen for their consequences. Because different groups and individuals typically benefit from different

economic institutions, there is generally a conflict over these social choices, ultimately resolved in favor of groups with greater political power. The distribution of political power in society is in turn determined by political institutions and the distribution of resources. Political institutions allocate *de jure* political power, while groups with greater economic might typically possess greater *de facto* political power. We therefore view the appropriate theoretical framework as a dynamic one with political institutions and the distribution of resources as the state variables. These variables themselves change over time because prevailing economic institutions affect the distribution of resources, and because groups with *de facto* political power today strive to change political institutions in order to increase their *de jure* political power in the future. Economic institutions encouraging economic growth emerge when political institutions allocate power to groups with interests in broad-based property rights enforcement, when they create effective constraints on power-holders, and when there are relatively few rents to be captured by power-holders. We illustrate the assumptions, the workings and the implications of this framework using a number of historical examples.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Theoretical Exploration
Comparative
Case Studies

Keywords

Institutions
Growth
Elite Coalitions

Economic Origins of Dictatorship and Democracy

Daron Acemoglu and James A. Robinson, (2006)

Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

This book develops a framework for analyzing the creation and consolidation of democracy. Different social groups prefer different political institutions because of the way they allocate political power and resources. Thus democracy is preferred by the majority of citizens, but opposed by elites. Dictatorship nevertheless is not stable when citizens can threaten social disorder and revolution. In response, when the costs of repression are sufficiently high and promises of concessions are not credible, elites may be forced to create democracy. By democratizing, elites credibly transfer political power to the citizens, ensuring social stability. Democracy consolidates when elites do not have strong incentive to overthrow it. These processes depend on (1) the strength of civil society, (2) the structure of political institutions, (3) the nature of political and economic crises, (4) the level of economic inequality, (5) the structure of the economy, and (6) the form and extent of globalization.

[Cambridge University Press Publisher's Summary:

http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item1173109/?site_locale=en_GB]

Methods

Theoretical Exploration

Keywords

Effective States
Political Settlements
Institutions
Civil Society

Political Settlements - Violence and Conflict

Elite Settlements and the Taming of Politics

John Higley, Michael Burton (1998)

Government and Opposition, Volume 33, Issue 1, Pages 98–115

A basic question is how politics are tamed and cease being a deadly, warlike affair.' The most dramatic way is through sudden, deliberate and lasting compromises of core disputes among political elites -what we think of as 'elite settlements'. Prior to settlements, elites disagree about government institutions, engage in unchecked fights for dominance, and view politics as winner-take-all. After settlements, elite persons and groups continue to be affiliated with conflicting parties, movements, and beliefs, but they share a consensus about government institutions and the codes and rules of political competition. Settlements tame politics by generating tacitly accommodative and overtly restrained practices among competing political elites.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Political Settlements
Violence and Conflict
Elite Coalitions

Conflict Resolution or Transformation? An Analysis of the South African and Mozambican Political Settlements

R.B. Lloyd, (2001)

International Negotiation, Volume 6, Issue 3, Pages 303-329

How much conflict must be resolved for a political settlement and its implementation to be successful? This article argues that a political settlement must satisfy the combatants' expectations regarding the resolution of the causes of the conflict. How deeply do these causes need to be resolved for the parties to be satisfied? To answer this question two concepts are introduced: the immediate and underlying causes of a conflict. Immediate causes (grievances) are specific, concrete policies that provoke some subset of a state's population to rebel against the government. Underlying causes are diverging interests that led to the introduction of these policies that caused the grievances. This article examines the political settlements in South Africa and Mozambique that terminated armed hostilities, overcame the conflict, and opened the door to normal politics. The research indicates that in both cases the political settlement satisfactorily resolved the immediate causes of the conflict. There was greater dissatisfaction in South Africa because the political settlement did not resolve the underlying causes of the conflict. A major reason for this dissatisfaction was that although the electoral outcome gave the ANC strong

popular support, the political settlement limited its ability to grapple with root causes. In Mozambique, fears of reigniting another protracted armed confrontation and the close electoral outcome dissuaded either side from addressing the underlying causes of the conflict.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Political Settlements

Violence and Conflict

Building the State and Securing the Peace

DFID, (2009)

Emerging Policy Paper, UK Department for International Development : London

Available at: <http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Document&id=3210>

How can support for state-building and peace-building be integrated? This Emerging Policy Paper from the UK Department for International Development (DFID) outlines a strategic framework for DFID's engagement in situations of conflict and fragility, plus operational implications. DFID's integrated approach to state-building and peace-building aims primarily to promote inclusive political settlements. This facilitates the further goals of: (i) addressing causes of conflict and building resolution mechanisms; (ii) developing state survival functions; and (iii) responding to public expectations. Support across all four of these interrelated areas is necessary to help create a positive peace- and state-building dynamic.

The state-building process involves: political settlement between elites; state survival functions (such as security, revenue, rule of law); and action on public expectations such as service delivery. With time, political settlements can broaden beyond elites to win and maintain the consent of societal groups. Peace-building involves: supporting inclusive peace processes and political settlements, building mechanisms to resolve conflict peacefully, and addressing causes and effects of conflict. Donors do not 'do' state-building or peace-building, (as these are internal, long-term, non-linear and continually negotiated processes), but donors can influence change in a positive or negative direction.

Inclusive political settlements are at the centre of the integrated approach to peace-building and state-building. Over time, the other three objectives (addressing causes of conflict and building resolution mechanisms, developing state survival functions, and responding to public expectations) can help to reinforce and shape the political settlement. Further key points are that:

- Peace-building measures must consider the long-term implications for state-building and growth; and state-building approaches must factor in the causes of conflict.
- State-building is not just about the state – it is about the relationship between state and society. Many state-building processes in fragile situations are characterised by friction between formal and informal institutions.
- There may also be tensions between state-building and peace-building processes. Changes to relationships between elites and societal groups that emerge from the state-building process can cause instability and violence, for example. Both legitimate grievances and 'spoilers' need to be addressed.

[...]

[Abridged Summary from GSDRC Website]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Inclusion

Elites

State Formation

Renegotiating the Political Settlement in War-to-Peace Transitions

Catherine Barnes, (2009)

Conciliation Resources, London

Available at: <http://www.gsdrc.org/go/display&type=Document&id=3908>

What are the impacts of political settlements on creating peace? What is the best way to support peace processes to produce inclusive and robust political settlements? This paper explores issues around the renegotiation of the political settlement within war-to-peace transitions. During such transitions there are opportunities to shift the terms of the political settlement. To engage with these challenges in ways that benefit the poor and marginalised, greater understanding is needed of the political processes involved and of links with conflict.

The process of resolving conflict has profound implications for the quality of the state's governance. Out of conflict can emerge an opportunity to create a new framework for political settlement that sets a trajectory for a more responsive state. Too often this opportunity is lost and the settlement that emerges does not address broader governance issues or underlying grievances. This can increase the risk of a return to violence.

[...]

During conflict, external actors can support the creation of a context conducive to peace negotiations. [...]

External actors can use their influence and resources to support the process of peacemaking. They can generate positive incentives and apply pressure. [...]

[Abridged Summary from GSDRC Website]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Political Settlements

Elites

Violence and Conflict

External Assistance

Building Peaceful States and Societies: A DFID Practice Paper

DFID, (2010)

Available at: <http://www.dfid.gov.uk/Documents/publications/governance/Building-peaceful-states-and-societies.pdf>

We will not achieve the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) or eliminate global poverty if the international community does not address conflict and fragility more effectively. Simply increasing the volume of aid will not be enough without tackling the underlying causes directly. There is a tendency in development to work ‘around’ conflict and fragility. A step change in international approaches is required.

This paper outlines a new, integrated approach, which puts state-building and peace-building at the centre of our work in fragile and conflict-affected countries. It is based on four objectives:

1. Address the causes and effects of conflict and fragility, and build conflict resolution mechanisms
2. Support inclusive political settlements and processes
3. Develop core state functions
4. Respond to public expectations

The approach should be applied *as a whole*. It aims to increase the impact of international assistance, while recognising that state-building and peace-building are primarily internal processes. The four objectives are not sequential – they form a ‘virtuous circle’, creating a positive dynamic and strengthening state–society relations.

Strong *state–society relations* are critical to building effective, legitimate states and durable, positive peace. In most fragile and conflict-affected countries, weak state–society relations based on patronage and lack of accountability are the norm. Strengthening them will require engagement with non-state and informal institutions as well as the state.

[...]

[Abridged Executive Summary]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Political Settlements

Violence and Conflict

State-Society Relations

Sub-National and Policy Area Political Settlements

Democratisation without representation? The power and political strategies of a rural elite in north India

Craig Jeffrey, (2000)

Political Geography, Volume 19, Issue 8, Pages 1013-1036

This paper examines how an agrarian elite in Uttar Pradesh (U.P.), India, seek access to the local police force. I argue that rich farmers belonging to the intermediate Jat caste have been quite successful in perpetuating their economic and social advantage through placing relatives in the

police force and nurturing political networks that link them to the police and politicians. The analysis complements macro-structural political economic accounts of India's flawed democratisation by offering a 'thick description' (Geertz, C. (1983). *Local knowledge: Further Essays in Interpretative Anthropology*. New York: Basic Books) of local state/society relations, including attention to spatial and symbolic dimensions of political networks. The paper provides a basis for re-evaluating popular accounts of the relationship between rural people and the local state in India and highlights the broader relevance of this research for political geography.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

State-Society Relations

Elites

The Regional Roots of Developmental Politics in India: A Divided Leviathan

Aseema Sinha, (2005)

Indiana University Press: Bloomington, IN

India is widely regarded as the most celebrated case of a "failed" developmental state, seemingly the exception that belies the prediction of a triumphant Asian century. Its central political and economic institutions have been variously characterized as both "soft" and "strong"—at once weak, predatory, and interventionist. Aseema Sinha presents an innovative model that questions conventional views of economic development by showing that the Indian state is a divided leviathan: its developmental failure is the combined product of central-local interactions and political choices by regional elites. To develop this disaggregated model, she examines three regional states with sharply divergent development trajectories: Gujarat, West Bengal, and Tamil Nadu. Drawing on recent work in comparative political economy, the theory of nested games, incentive theory, and an ethnographic analysis of business actors, this study directs analytical attention at the creation of micro-institutions at the subnational level, explores the role of provinces in shaping investment flows, and considers the role of federalism as a mediating institution shaping the vertical strategies of provinces. A comparative chapter applies the model to data from China, Brazil, Russia, and the former Soviet Union.

[Indiana University Press Publisher's Summary:

http://www.iupress.indiana.edu/contact_us.php?CDpath=13_2]

Methods

Comparative

Case Studies

Ethnographic

Keywords

State-Society Relations

Elites

Between coercion and contract: competing narratives on taxation and governance

Mick Moore, (2008)

In Taxation and State-Building in Developing Countries: Capacity and Consent, Deborah Bräutigam, Odd-Helge Fjeldstad and Mick Moore, Editors.

“This chapter has addressed two main related questions. The first concerns the circumstances in which taxation is more or less coercive or contractual. The news is fairly good. The most coercive taxation is found in circumstances that are becoming less common. [...]

My second question is more action oriented. Are we right to be concerned about the impact on the quality of governance of the dependence of so many contemporary governments on rents from natural resources or development aid- rather than on broad taxation? Were these rents not available, would we find more widely replicated in contemporary poor countries the beneficial consequences of revenue bargaining for the quality of governance that so many people have identified for historical Europe? A combination of historical and contemporary case material, deductive logic and contemporary cross-national and intranational statistical analysis suggest a positive answer to both questions and supports the contractualist notion that polities are significantly shaped by bargaining between states and societal groups around fiscal issues. The extent and character of that bargaining seems, however, to be influenced by a wide variety of structural features of economies and polities, as well as more contingent historical and political trajectories. Modern states are larger and more complex than those of early modern Europe, and modern economies also tend to be more internationalised and interconnected. Contemporary revenue bargaining is both more diverse and, in most cases, less overt than in seventeenth-century Britain.”

[Extract from Conclusion of Chapter]

Methods

Case Studies

Historical Analysis

Statistical Analysis

Keywords

Taxation

Political Settlements

Elite Bargains

Elites oppose the development of political parties [in Russia]⁵

Mick Moore, 2001

Governance and Development Review, Institute of Development Studies

Available at: <http://www.eldis.org/go/home&id=29984&type=Document>

Political parties are institutionalised when they have an organization that is separate from the personal links of their leaders, and when their elected members form a distinct and coherent group in the legislature. The level of institutionalisation is low in many poor countries. This is an obstacle to effective electoral democracy. Only when parties are stable and predictable in terms of membership and policy positions can voters make informed choices, and have some

⁵ This is a review of the article by Kathryn Stoner-Weiss immediately below which it draws out some relevant themes not highlighted so starkly in the abstract for this article.

confidence that their votes on election day will influence the composition, attitudes and policies of governments over the next few years.

After the collapse of the Soviet regime in 1989, the level of institutionalisation of political parties in Russia has been low. However, Kathryn Stoner-Weiss shows that it has been increasing steadily, at national level, over the 1990s. The State Duma is steadily coming to comprise distinct groupings of people who have relatively consistent attitudes to policy issues and contest national elections on some kind of programmatic basis.

Yet at regional level the picture is very different. Here political parties play a tiny role. Elections are contested and won by individuals, and legislative majorities are constructed on an issue-by-issue basis. Voters have very little scope to influence policy.

Why this difference? Because regional elites want things this way. They have done very well out of the transition from Communist rule.

[Eldis Summary]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Political Settlements

Elites

Elite Bargains

The Limited Reach of Russia's Party System: Underinstitutionalization in Dual Transitions

Kathryn Stoner-Weiss, (2001)

Politics & Society, Volume 29, Issue 3, Pages 385-414

While Russian political parties appear to be institutionalizing to some degree at the national level, they are surprisingly absent at the regional level. This is a result of the dynamics of Russia's dual economic and political transition. Regional elites prefer a “partial reform equilibrium” in political institutional development so that they can avoid widening the sphere of accountability for their decisions in order to protect the gains they have made in the early stage of the economic transition. Strong political institutions—like competitive political parties that penetrate the periphery—would render transitional winners more broadly accountable to wider societal interests as well as to national political actors. The argument suggests that the territorial penetration and further institutionalization of Russia's party system are not necessarily inevitable. Under the conditions of dual, simultaneous economic and political transitions, elites may prefer an equilibrium of political underinstitutionalization to preserve their early winnings from the economic transition.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Political Settlements

Elites

Elite Bargains

Welfare capitalism and the origins of welfare states - British industry, workplace welfare and social reform, c.1870-1914

Joseph Melling, (1992)

Social history, Volume 17, Issue 3, Pages 453

Debates on the comparative history of welfare states have been dominated in recent years by the increasing popularity of institutionalist and state-centred interpretations of social reform. Such studies tend to understate economic and social factors, emphasizing instead the differing capacities of nation states and the creativity of political and administrative managers in the formulation of welfare programmes. The essay presented here offers a critique of the state-centred model of explanation and provides an analysis of state welfare as the product of a changing relationship between national capitalisms and the state. It is suggested that social legislation can be understood as an important element in the political settlements reached between capitalism and the state, in which the social infrastructure of capitalism is largely decided. This argument is pursued in an examination of the business welfare schemes in British industry between the mid-nineteenth century and the outbreak of the First World War. It was the evident limitations of 'welfare capitalism' provided by British employers and the increasing concern with the disorders of the labour market and the unions which largely defined the scope of state policy. The passing of social insurance forced employers to reappraise their relationship with the British state and to develop a new form of organized politics to deal with the growth of state regulation in industry.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Historical Analysis

Keywords

Political Settlements

Industrial Capitalism and the Welfare of the State: The Role of Employers in the Comparative Development of Welfare States. A Review of Recent Research

Joseph Melling, (1991)

Sociology Volume 25, Issue 2, Pages 219-239

Recent debates on the future of social benefits in the market economy have focussed attention on the origins of state services and the conditions which encouraged the growth of public welfare in modern society. The emphasis in the recent writing has been upon the political conditions for the evolution of citizenship rather than on economic and industrialisation models of welfare expenditure. At the same time there have been various attempts to adapt and refine the rational choice analysis of public goods to explain individual support for collective services. Each of these approaches has been developed with a strong interest in the historical and comparative analysis of welfare provision. This essay reviews recent research and the definitions of economic and political power which are employed. Many writers stress the continuities of traditional institutions at the expense of recurring economic and political conflict which defined the practical boundaries of citizenship. An alternative view of capitalist prerogatives is outlined. Taking the particular example of industrial capitalism and social insurance in Britain, it is argued that the social policies of the state formed part of a wider political settlement at key moments of development. In this process we can trace the significance of discursive struggles as well as economic structures and state initiatives. Such an approach reveals the complexity of political

processes and the limits of comparative studies which focus primarily on economic or state structures.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of Research

Keywords

Political Settlements

Effective States

The politics behind the non-contributory old age social pensions in Lesotho, Namibia and South Africa

Larissa Pelham, (2007)

Chronic Poverty Research Centre (CPRC), Working Paper No. 83

Available at: http://www.chronicpoverty.org/uploads/publication_files/WP83_Pelham.pdf

Lesotho, Namibia, South Africa and Botswana comprise a cluster of southern African countries which provide monthly non-contributory benefits to their elderly citizens. This paper seeks to understand the differing political and socio-economic conditions in which the three pensions evolved and suggest what implications pensions may have for the nature of the citizen-state relationship. The paper argues that the motivation behind the long-established South African and Namibian pensions was 'supply-driven' to serve political ends. This has shifted over time and today all three pensions are increasingly 'demand-driven', that is, they serve welfare objectives of reducing poverty and promoting equality, although they must still remain acceptable to political and economic elites. This is demonstrated by analysing both ideological and practical facets of the pensions, including the design, the institutional home of the pension and the influence of geopolitical factors. It leads to the conclusion that a bond has built between citizen and state based on three characteristics. Firstly, their ability to foster social solidarity by reinforcing the value and contribution of the elderly to the household and restoring to pensioners a regained sense of citizenship; secondly the persistence of pensions which then become entrenched in the expectations of the citizenry, even before the sense of social contract develops in the political arena; and finally, acknowledgement by the state of its role in and moral commitment to provide welfare to its citizens, and the political expediency of doing so. These three mutually-reinforcing characteristics, maintain the momentum of the pension which, in turn, reinforces the contract.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Social Contract

Elite Bargains

State-Society Relations

Conceptualising the Politics of Social Protection in Africa

Samuel Hickey, (2007)

Brooks World Poverty Institute (BWPI), Working Paper No. 4

Available at: <http://www.bwpi.manchester.ac.uk/resources/Working-Papers/bwpi-wp-0407.pdf>

Despite growing international interest with social protection, little is known about the forms of politics that tend to underpin - and emerge from - such interventions. For example, under what conditions do governments and political elites implement and sustain social protection policies? How important are the forms of politics promoted under the 'good governance' agenda, such as regular elections, civil society involvement and decentralisation? What role do donors play as political actors in poor countries? This paper starts to address these questions via a conceptual framework that is derived from synthesising an analysis of politics in Africa with a review of past social protection policies. This framework embraces four key dimensions: political institutions, political actors and agencies, socio-economic forces and the global dimension. It is argued that the notion of a 'political contract' can explain the ways in which these dimensions combine to shape the politics of social protection in Africa, and that this notion can offer a normative and theoretical framework for thinking about and promoting social protection.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Social Contract

State-Society Relations

Reclaiming Policy Space: Lessons from Malawi's Fertilizer Subsidy Programme

The Future Agricultures Consortium, (2007)

Future Agricultures Briefing , Institute of Development Studies, Sussex

Available at: <http://www.fanrpan.org/documents/d00344/>

This paper is based on research work carried out under the auspices of the Politics and Policy Processes theme of the Future Agricultures Consortium (FAC). It demonstrates that political context matters in agricultural development policy issues, using as illustration the case of the fertilizer subsidy programme launched in Malawi in the 2005/2006 growing season.

The main argument of the paper is that no matter what the technical arguments for or against particular policy positions are, it is ultimately the configuration of political interests that determine policy outcomes on the ground. This resonates very well with recent thinking of the politics of policy which emphasizes the complex and messy processes by which policies are understood, formulated and implemented, and the range of competing actors' interests involved.

This study drew essentially on the review of secondary sources (press reports, academic papers, government and donor documents) and on key informant interviews with officials from government, donor agencies, civil society and the private sector. The paper mainly:

- explains the origins and context for the fertilizer subsidy programme
- provides details on the programme and the evolution in thinking within government

- discusses three different donor positions on the fertilizer programme: those totally opposing it; those supporting it; those reluctant but willing to engage with the government's policy
- analyses the programme's impact and adjustments in government and donor positions.

Finally the author provides the following reflections:

- The domestic political economy context matters in any agricultural policy process.
- Policy designers, and donors in particular, need a deeper awareness of the political and economic history of agriculture, as well as the nature of the implicit 'social contract' between smallholders and the state, and the importance of state organisations in providing in times of need.
- There is need to fully grasp the array of stakeholders and their interests, competing views, and demands in policy issues. Understanding how various interests play out is critical for analysing potential trade-offs in the policy process.
- Government leadership and determination backed up by a democratic mandate means that there must be a culture of pragmatism, negotiation and compromise among donors, who often are used to getting their own way.
- Donors should not only understand the political context of the countries where they operate but should also be more reflexive in their reading of that reality and the role they play in it.

[ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Elite Bargains

State-Society Relations

Political Settlements

Inclusive(?) Political Settlements

Some Reflections on the Notion of an 'inclusive political pact': a perspective from Ahmedabad

Neera Chandhoke (2010)

Crisis States Working Papers, Series 2, Working Paper No. 71

London School of Economics

Available at:

<http://www2.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/crisisStates/Publications/wpPhase2/wp71.aspx>

This paper explores the notion of an 'inclusive political pact', as developed by Prof James Putzel, Director of the Crisis States research programme, taking the city of Ahmedabad in Gujarat as its case study. It looks at the ghettoisation of the Muslim population into resettlement communities following the communal violence of 2002 and examines how this spatial marginalisation has disempowered a whole section of society and rendered them politically irrelevant. The paper argues that the set of circumstances in Ahmedabad that has completely excluded the Muslim section of society from full citizenship and basic civic rights, demonstrates the ramifications of excluding certain groups from a fully inclusive political pact.

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Inclusion

Exclusion

Political Settlements

Citizenship

Strong Party, Weak State? Frelimo and State Survival Through the Mozambican Civil War: An Analytical Narrative on State-Making

Jason Sumich and João Honwana, (2007)

Crisis States Working Papers, Series 2, Working Paper No. 23

London School of Economics

Available at:

<http://www2.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/crisisStates/Publications/phase2papers.aspx>

Mozambique has been described as a model of ‘state resilience’ as the ruling Frelimo party has managed to maintain power through years of economic collapse and civil conflict. However, such a description can be misleading and I argue that in most senses, apart from the symbolic, the state largely collapsed through much of the country during the civil war (1977-1992). By tracing the social formation of the elite who eventually went on to dominate the Frelimo party leadership I demonstrate how they were able to maintain internal unity and survive the trials of the post-independence period. However, the social basis of the unity that has maintained the Frelimo party is also very exclusionary, and in many ways unique to themselves. Thus, instead of a model of state resilience I argue that it is the Frelimo party that has survived, but that the re-establishment of the hegemony of the party-state could deepen the divisions and inequalities that helped fuel civil war.

[Author’s Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Elites

Inclusion

Exclusion

Political Settlements

State Formation

Coalitions, Capitalists and Credibility: Overcoming the crisis of confidence at independence in Mauritius

Deborah Brautigam, with Tania Diolle, (2009)

Developmental Leadership Program, Research Paper 04

Available at: <http://www.dlprog.org/ftp/>

Few countries in the developing world have solved the puzzle of governing for broad-based prosperity. The Indian Ocean island nation of Mauritius is an exception. An isolated plantation economy at the end of the colonial period, dependent on the export of sugar, with a deeply divided, multi-ethnic population that had just experienced violent urban riots, Mauritius was transformed between 1968 and 1988. On multiple measures – growth, stable democracy, social welfare, equity – Mauritius has earned its status as a development “superstar”.

A skillful mix of policies encouraged global competition in some areas (tourism, export manufacturing) while taking full advantage of trade preferences in others (sugar). Leaders were accountable for performance to domestic constituents, but kept their eyes on the outside world, experimenting, learning, adapting. They respected and strengthened key governance institutions: skilled bureaucracy, an independent judiciary, a free press, an inclusive electoral system. Most importantly, an elected leader, avowedly socialist, was able to convince the business community of his government’s credible commitment to their prosperity, and to wrest from them the understanding that their prosperity would have to be shared in order to underwrite the social stability of the country. Social democracy would be combined with managed capitalism. Using a process-tracing methodology, this paper examines how, at the critical juncture of independence, this commitment was forged, and how it was sustained through being embedded into formal and informal institutions

Violent and divisive elections in 1967 launched Mauritius into independence, but the coalition for development took shape through a painstakingly negotiated government of national unity. This brought the party of the economic elite into a coalition government headed by the socialist Labour Party, a firm sign of the latter’s commitment to market-based development. The national unity government provided the framework for decisions in three key policy arenas: upscale tourism; protected sugar exports into Europe; and export processing zones (EPZs). Trust between the public and private sectors was built through three principle means. First, key public and private sector leaders used symbolic, public gestures as signals of commitment to cooperation, thereby shifting societal perceptions and easing a potentially dangerous ethnic polarization. Second, the business class organized itself into a unified, cross-ethnic constituency, with a peak association that could negotiate, and speak with a single voice. Third, government leaders and the private sector fostered dense clusters of consultation: regular formal and informal arenas for government business interaction.

Why did Mauritians have the desire and ability to unify? The paper argues that four factors explain this exceptionalism. (1) Education: The leaders who negotiated these new relationships were exceptionally well-educated. Many were graduates of the main island’s competitive, elite government secondary school, Royal College. At least half of the national unity cabinet of 21 people had earned university degrees in London. (2) Societal support: A free media, new civic associations, and even the Catholic Church gave repeated and vocal societal support. (3) Transnational networks: These provided the ideas (Fabian socialism, export processing zones) and resources that created a concrete hope for the future. Finally, (4) Systemic vulnerability (that is, absence of resources or geopolitical patrons; a price-volatile monocrop; hurricanes and droughts): This fostered a sober realization that the country needed to unify, or sink.

[Executive Summary]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Political Settlements

Inclusion

State-Market Relations

Elite Coalitions

Democracy

Developmental States

Indigenous Institutions, Traditional Leaders & Developmental Coalitions: The Case of Greater Durban, South Africa

Jo Beall, London with Mduduzi Ngonyama, (2009)

Developmental Leadership Program, Research Paper 05

Available at: <http://www.dlprog.org/ftp/>

South Africa was not atypical in having to accommodate indigenous institutions in its new political order when the country made its transition from minority rule to a non-racial democracy in 1994. In many parts of the world, and especially post-colonial states, customary forms of governance remain salient, being deeply rooted in local institutions. [...]

State-making and peace-building in post-Apartheid South Africa was made possible by the creation of an administrative machinery that could contain customary authority structures within a broader polity, political structures and processes that channelled the ambitions and grievances of traditional leaders, and a system of local government that drew on the presence and experience of chieftaincies to bring development to hard-to-reach areas. This was a contested process that is by no means over and with mixed results. Yet pockets of success have emerged out of the transitional period, especially in the city of Durban, giving rise to progressive developmental coalitions promoting economic growth, inclusive governance and social development.

[...]

This paper examines the incorporation of indigenous institutions into the newly democratised eThekweni Metropolitan Municipality (the Metro) in Durban, South Africa, profiling examples of better and worse practice both at provincial level in KwaZulu-Natal and in the context of metropolitan governance and how, in the process, old political settlements and coalitions were broken and new ones constructed. The paper concludes that success is predicated on accommodating institutional multiplicity within a hybrid political order, in which leaders work on premises of the need for trade-offs and least worst option and as a result engage in inclusive processes, which in turn facilitate developmental coalitions.

[Abridged Executive Summary]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Political Settlements

Elite Coalitions

Inclusion

Buffer Zone, Colonial Enclave or Urban Hub? Quetta: Between Four Regions and Two Wars

Haris Gazdar, Ahmad Kaker Sobia and Irfan Khan (2010)

Crisis States Research Programme (CSRC) Working Paper No. 69

London School of Economics

Available at:

<http://www2.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/crisisStates/Publications/phase2papers.aspx>

Quetta straddles four significant historical regions and plays a role in two major armed conflicts - the war in Afghanistan, and the Baloch nationalist insurgency in Pakistan. The city itself has remained relatively peaceful, though a closer look reveals the ways in which the two wars have encroached upon urban life. Quetta is an international border post as well as an internal buffer zone between major ethnic groups. It is a colonial enclave that was originally populated for the purposes of subduing its expansive tribal hinterland. The city is also an urban hub where possibilities of modern political development have been imagined and pursued, and one which bears potential for the appropriation and disbursement of massive economic rents. An analysis of Quetta's geography, history and institutional development shows that three aspects of the city's character - border/buffer zone, colonial enclave and urban hub - have remained significant through its evolution since the late 19th century. A description of the city and its context enables the identification of the various elites and non-elites that have a stake in Quetta and in projects of state-building and state-breaking in its hinterland. The colliding and overlapping interests of the Pakistan central state, its military and political elites, provincial patrons, Baloch and Pashtun ethnic nationalists, settlers, Afghan migrants, and Islamic clerics have shaped Quetta's contributions to state-building in Balochistan, Pakistan and Afghanistan. Whether it is the border/buffer zone, colonial enclave or urban hub that prevails depends on the balance of power between and alignments within these various elites.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

State Formation

Political Settlements

Elites

Forging Democracy from Below: Insurgent Transitions in South Africa and El Salvador

Elisabeth Jean Wood, (2000)

Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

The recent replacement of authoritarian rule by democracy in both South Africa and El Salvador poses a puzzle: why did the powerful and fervently anti-democratic elites of these countries abandon death squads, apartheid, and the other tools of political repression and take a chance on democracy? Forging Democracy From Below shows how popular mobilization - in El Salvador an effective guerilla army supported by peasant collaboration and in South Africa a powerful alliance of labor unions and poor urban dwellers - eventually forced the elite to the bargaining table, and why both a durable settlement and democratic government were the result. Using interviews with both insurgent and elite actors as well as statistical analysis of macroeconomic

developments, Elisabeth Wood documents an 'insurgent path to democracy' and challenges the view that democracy is the result of compromise among elite factions or the modernizing influence of economic development.

[Cambridge University Press Publisher's Summary:

http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item1167550/?site_locale=en_GB]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Political Settlements

Democracy

Elite Coalitions

Civil Society

Change

An African Success Story: Botswana

Daron Acemoglu, Simon Johnson and James A. Robinson, (2002)

Centre for Economic Policy Research (CEPR), Discussion Paper No. 3219

Available at: <http://www.colby.edu/economics/faculty/jmlong/ec479/AJR.pdf>

Botswana has had the highest rate of per capita growth of any country in the world in the last 35 years. This occurred despite adverse initial conditions, including minimal investment during the colonial period and high inequality. Botswana achieved this rapid development by following orthodox economic policies. How Botswana sustained these policies is a puzzle because typically in Africa, 'good economics' has proved not to be politically feasible. In this Paper we suggest that good policies were chosen in Botswana because good institutions, which we refer to as institutions of private property, were in place. Why did institutions of private property arise in Botswana, but not other African nations? We conjecture that the following factors were important. First, Botswana possessed relatively inclusive pre-colonial institutions, placing constraints on political elites. Second, the effect of British colonialism on Botswana was minimal, and did not destroy these institutions. Third, following independence, maintaining and strengthening institutions of private property were in the economic interests of the elite. Fourth, Botswana is very rich in diamonds, which created enough rents that no group wanted to challenge the status quo at the expense of 'rocking the boat'. Finally, we emphasize that this situation was reinforced by a number of critical decisions made by the post-independence leaders, particularly Presidents Khama and Masire.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Political Settlements

Elites

Growth

Is Democracy Possible Here? Principles for a New Political Debate

Ronald Dworkin, (2008)

Princeton University Press: Princeton, NJ

Politics in America are polarized and trivialized, perhaps as never before. In Congress, the media, and academic debate, opponents from right and left, the Red and the Blue, struggle against one another as if politics were contact sports played to the shouts of cheerleaders. The result, Ronald Dworkin writes, is a deeply depressing political culture, as ill equipped for the perennial challenge of achieving social justice as for the emerging threats of terrorism. Can the hope for change be realized? Dworkin, one of the world's leading legal and political philosophers, identifies and defends core principles of personal and political morality that all citizens can share. He shows that recognizing such shared principles can make substantial political argument possible and help replace contempt with mutual respect. Only then can the full promise of democracy be realized in America and elsewhere.

Dworkin lays out two core principles that citizens should share: first, that each human life is intrinsically and equally valuable and, second, that each person has an inalienable personal responsibility for identifying and realizing value in his or her own life. He then shows what fidelity to these principles would mean for human rights, the place of religion in public life, economic justice, and the character and value of democracy. Dworkin argues that liberal conclusions flow most naturally from these principles. Properly understood, they collide with the ambitions of religious conservatives, contemporary American tax and social policy, and much of the War on Terror. But his more basic aim is to convince Americans of all political stripes--as well as citizens of other nations with similar cultures--that they can and must defend their own convictions through their own interpretations of these shared values.

[Princeton University Press Publisher's Summary:

<http://press.princeton.edu/titles/8232.html>]

Methods

Theoretical Exploration

Keywords

Citizenship

Political Settlements

Coercion, Capital and European States: AD 990 - 1992

Charles Tilly, (1993)

Wiley-Blackwell: Oxford

In this pathbreaking work, [...] Charles Tilly challenges all previous formulations of state development in Europe. Specifically, Tilly charges that most available explanations fail because they do not account for the great variety of kinds of states which were viable at different stages of European history, and because they assume a unilinear path of state development resolving in today's national state.

[Wiley-Blackwell Publisher's Summary:

<http://eu.wiley.com/WileyCDA/WileyTitle/productCd-1557863687.html>]

Methods

Historical Analysis

Keywords

Political Settlements

Taxation

The Anatomy of Political Predation: Leaders, Elites and Coalitions in Zimbabwe, 1980-2010

Michael Bratton and Eldred Masunungure, (2011)

Developmental Leadership Program, Research Paper 09

Available at:

<http://www.dlprog.org/ftp/download/Public%20Folder/Executive%20Summary%20-%20An%20Anatomy%20of%20Political%20Predation%20in%20Zimbabwe.pdf>

This essay offers an interpretation of the rise and fall of Zimbabwe's political economy through the lens of leadership.

Of special interest are the actions of elite coalitions that link political parties, the state bureaucracy, and the security sector. We argue that, over time, the civil-military coalition within Zimbabwe's former ruling party placed its own political survival and welfare above broader developmental goals. In consolidating state power, the rulers violently suppressed political opposition, engaged in predatory corruption, and challenged the economic interests of commercial farming and business elites. In so doing, leaders undermined the rule of law and alienated the labor movement and civil society, which went on to form a rival opposition coalition.

The paper also casts light on the limits of externally driven, hastily negotiated and reluctantly accepted political settlements. At critical junctures in the country's history – notably at independence in 1980 and a Global Political Agreement in 2008 – leaders entered compromise power-sharing arrangements. Lacking strong leadership commitments, however, the rules underpinning political settlements in Zimbabwe never took root, thus inhibiting the country's progress toward democracy and development

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Elite Coalitions

Inclusion

Exclusion

Political Settlements

External Assistance

Leadership

'Bound in by History': The Winter of Discontent in British Politics, 1979-2004

James Thomas, (2007)

Media, Culture & Society, Volume 29, Issue 2, Pages 263-283

This article looks at the ideological role of popular history in British politics & the media. It argues that British politics since 1945 has operated under two key successive meta-narratives about the past that have shaped & reflected the political settlement of the present. It charts

briefly how negative images of a free-enterprise, inter-war period played a key role in legitimizing the emergence of a new centre-left political settlement from 1945 onwards. It then explores how this progressive myth gave way from 1979 onwards to a right-wing myth of the 1970s. It details how right-wing politicians & the media between 1979 & 1992 promoted a negative popular history of the 1970s that legitimized the rightward shift in British politics & discredited social democratic alternatives. & it ends by examining the consequences of New Labour's collusion with this right-wing memory as a means to define its own identity.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

Historical Analysis

Keywords

Political Settlements

This section focuses on the processes by which citizenship, as a form of political identity and as a mode of political interaction, is formed.⁶ The emergence of citizenship as the dominant form of political subjectivity, usually in displacement of some form of serfdom or clientelist status, is frequently seen as a key marker of developmental progress, or modernity, whereby individuals are considered to be rights-bearing agents with equal rights and status. Citizenship, or rather the encouragement and empowerment for people to become ‘active citizens’, has been promoted within international development as a way for the poor and the marginalised to have a voice and ultimately overcome poverty and exclusion (Robins, Cornwall and Von Lieres, 2008; Hickey, 2010). This normative, optimistic view of citizenship has however, been increasingly critiqued by a number of scholars as not reflecting the empirical realities of how political subjectivity is experienced and utilised, particularly in postcolonial contexts, which differs to that of the ideal democratic ‘active’ citizen (Robins, Cornwall and Von Lieres 2008, p.1071; Dagnino, 2008).⁷ Citizenship cannot be seen therefore to be a panacea for social-exclusion and poverty (Hickey, 2010). However, many of these scholars who point to this discrepancy between the ideal and the ‘reality’ do not condemn a citizenship approach altogether. Rather, many highlight how citizenship comes to take on different forms in different places, and how it can be utilised to access the state and include as well as marginalise and exclude (Maski, 2010; Robins, Cornwall and Von Lieres, 2008; Kabeer, 2003). Processes of citizenship formation are thus varied in character and outcome this section explores the research conducted on this complex topic.

Subsections

As outlined above the divergent experiences and understandings of citizenship which occur in different parts of the world are addressed by a number of scholars. This subsection *Concepts, Understandings and Experiences of Citizenship* outlines some of the research conducted on these polyvalent meanings.

There is a mutually constitutive relationship between the state and citizens and the nature of the state is highly influential on the forms of citizenship which emerge and vice versa (Cornwall, Robins and Von Lieres, 2011). The *Citizenship Formation and State Formation* subsection lays out some of the literature which discusses this state-citizen relationship.

Much of the promotion of citizenship within the development community rests on the hope that a proactive citizenry will be able to successfully demand accountability and thus produce more effective states. Literature which addresses relationship between citizenship and effective states are outlined in the subsection entitled *Citizenship Formation and Effective(?) States*.

The role of citizenship in offering opportunities for inclusion whilst also operating in other circumstances to exclude is a key debate within the citizenship literature. The subsection *Citizenship Formation - Inclusion/Exclusion and Poverty* outlines some of the research dealing with these issues.

⁶ For a overview of the broader literature on citizenship please see Jones and Gaventa, 2002.

⁷ However, Kabeer (2007) argues that whilst citizenship is not universal there are some common elements to the concept across different contexts.

Civil society has been seen to play a key role in promoting the formation of citizenship. But civil society's role as citizenship advocates has often been complex and contradictory. Literature which analyses these complexities is outlined in the *Citizenship Formation and Civil Society* subsection.

There is a key set of literature emerging which examines the ways in which citizenship interrelates with other forms of interaction between the state and society. Key within these discussions is the relationship between clientelism, patrimonialism and citizenship (Robins, Cornwall and Von Lieres, 2008). The subsection on *Citizenship Formation – Patrimonialism, Clientelism and Patronage* lays out the literature which explores the interactions of citizenship and clientelism.

Overarching Literature on Citizenship Formation

The Messiness of Everyday Life: Exploring Key Themes in Latin American Citizenship Studies

Special edition of *Bulletin of Latin American Research*
Volume 23, Issue 2, Pages 135–284, (2004)

Citizenship: pushing the boundaries

Special edition of *Feminist Review*
Volume 57, Issue 1, Pages 1–178, (1997)

Citizenship, Identity, and Social History

Charles Tilly, (1996)
Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

Citizenship and identity provide the focus for this collection of original essays from a group of theoretically innovative historians and social scientists. The volume explores the competing and sometimes conflicting roles of citizenship and identity, be it racial, class, ethnic or other, in popular politics. The concept of citizenship is also examined. All essays are historically and comparatively grounded. Covering a wide variety of countries, topics covered include: citizenship rights and party-union relations in Western Europe; politics, industrialization, and citizenship; contested citizenship and the dynamics of racial identity; and social movements and nationhood and citizenship in early Meiji 1868–1900.

[Cambridge University Press Publisher's Summary:

http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item1152691/?site_locale=en_GB]

Methods

Various

Keywords

Citizenship
Citizenship Formation

The Politics of the Governed: Reflections on Popular Politics in Most of the World

Partha Chatterjee, (2004)

Columbia University Press: New York

Often dismissed as the rumblings of "the street," popular politics is where political modernity is being formed today, according to Partha Chatterjee. The rise of mass politics all over the world in the twentieth century led to the development of new techniques of governing population groups. On the one hand, the idea of popular sovereignty has gained wide acceptance. On the other hand, the proliferation of security and welfare technologies has created modern governmental bodies that administer populations, but do not provide citizens with an arena for democratic deliberation. Under these conditions, democracy is no longer government of, by, and for the people. Rather, it has become a world of power whose startling dimensions and unwritten rules of engagement Chatterjee provocatively lays bare.

This book argues that the rise of ethnic or identity politics—particularly in the postcolonial world—is a consequence of new techniques of governmental administration. Using contemporary examples from India, the book examines the different forms taken by the politics of the governed. Many of these operate outside of the traditionally defined arena of civil society and the formal legal institutions of the state. This book considers the global conditions within which such local forms of popular politics have appeared and shows us how both community and global society have been transformed. Chatterjee's analysis explores the strategic as well as the ethical dimensions of the new democratic politics of rights, claims, and entitlements of population groups and permits a new understanding of the dynamics of world politics both before and after the events of September 11, 2001.

The Politics of the Governed consists of three essays, originally given as the Leonard Hastings Schoff Lectures at Columbia University in November 2001, and four additional essays that complement and extend the analyses presented there. By combining these essays between the covers of a single volume, Chatterjee has given us a major and urgent work that provides a full perspective on the possibilities and limits of democracy in the postcolonial world.

[Columbia University Press Publisher's Summary

<http://www.cup.columbia.edu/book/978-0-231-13062-2/the-politics-of-the-governed>]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

State Formation

Citizenship Formation

Governance

Citizenship and Social Theory

Bryan S. Turner, (1993)

Sage: London

Going beyond both traditional liberal theories of democracy and Marxist theories of civil society, leading international scholars rethink the relations between the individual and the state, community and family. They assess how social and political participation is changing in the

modern world, investigate the historical roots of citizenship and its development alongside the nation state and urban society, and relate it to issues of welfare and the market. The final chapter asks whether the subordination of nation states to supranational institutions will replace state citizenship with a global conception of human rights.

[Sage Publisher's Summary: <http://www.uk.sagepub.com/books/Book203609>]

Methods

Theoretical Investigation

Keywords

State-Society Relations

Citizenship Formation

Citizenship and Capitalism: The debate over reform

Bryan S. Turner, (1986)

“Citizenship is not simply about class and capitalism but also involves debates about the social rights of women, children, the elderly and even animals. The traditional debate is thus too narrow and requires elaboration and expansion.

[...]I argue that citizenship is a consequence of real and popular struggles against various forms of hierarchy, patriarchy, class exploitation and political oppression; the achievements of these struggles should not be dismissed as mere mystifications of capitalism or illusory forms of democracy. The political achievement of full citizenship where it involves significant social rights is a direct challenge to capitalism, but it is also a challenge to authoritarian form of political rule. Although the notion of progress is now often regarded as utopian or evolutionary, there is an important principle of emancipation in the struggle for social membership and participation which citizenship confers. [...] The societies of western industrial capitalism are essentially contradictory and there is an ongoing dynamic relationship between citizenship and the inequalities of the market place. The dynamic feature of capitalism is precisely the contradiction between politics and economics as fought out in the sphere of social citizenship.”

[Extract from introduction]

Methods

Theoretical Investigation

Keywords

Citizenship

State-Market Relations

Inclusion

Change

Citizenship, Nationality and Ethnicity: Reconciling Competing Identities

T. K. Ooman (1996)

Polity Press: Cambridge

Most interpretations of ethnicity concentrate either on particular societies or on specific dimensions of 'world society'. This work takes quite a different approach, arguing that variations within and across societies are vital for understanding contemporary dilemmas of ethnicity. The author aims to develop a new analysis of the relation between the nation on the one hand, and ethnicity and citizenship on the other.

Oommen conceives of the nation as a product of a fusion of territory and language. He demonstrates that neither religion nor race determines national identities. As territory is seminal for a nation to emerge and exist, the dissociation between people and their 'homeland' makes them an ethnic. Citizenship is conceptualized both as a status to which nationals and ethnicities ought to be entitled and a set of obligations, a role they are expected to play.

Analyses of three historical episodes - colonialism and European expansion, Communist internationalism and the nation-state and its project of cultural unity - are examined to provide the empirical content of the argument.

[Summary from Wiley website:

<http://eu.wiley.com/WileyCDA/WileyTitle/productCd-0745616208.html>]

Methods

Historical Analysis

Keywords

Citizenship

State-Formation

Citizenship: The civic ideal in world history, politics and education

(3rd Edition)

Derek Heater, (2004)

Manchester University Press: Manchester

This book describes, analyses and interprets the topic of citizenship in a global context as it has developed historically, in its variations as a political concept and status, and the ways in which citizens have been and are being educated for that status.

The book provides a historical survey which ranges from the Ancient Greeks to the twentieth century, and reveals the legacies which each era passed on to later centuries. It explains the meaning of citizenship, what political citizenship entails and the nature of citizenship as a status, and also tackles the issue of whether there can be a generally accepted, holistic understanding of the idea.

For this new edition an epilogue has been written which demonstrates the intense nature of the academic and pedagogical debates on the subject, as well as the practical matters relating to the status since 1990.

[Manchester University Press Publisher's Summary:

<http://www.manchesteruniversitypress.co.uk/catalogue/book.asp?id=1483>]

Methods

Historical Analysis

Keywords

Citizenship

Being Political: Genealogies of Citizenship

Engin F. Isin (2002)

A provocative counterhistory—and a bold new approach—to notions of citizenship.

What does it mean to be political? Every age has based its answer on citizenship, bequeathing us such indelible images as that of the Greek citizen exercising his rights and obligations in the agora, the Roman citizen conducting himself in the forum, medieval citizens receiving their charter before the guildhall. *Being Political* disrupts these images by approaching citizenship as otherness, presenting a powerful critique of universalistic and orientalist interpretations of the origins of citizenship and a persuasive alternative history of the present struggles over citizenship.

Who were the strangers and outsiders of citizenship? What strategies and technologies were invented for constituting those forms of otherness? Focusing on these questions, rather than on the images conveyed by history's victors, *Being Political* offers a series of genealogies of citizenship as otherness. Engin F. Isin invokes the city as a "difference machine," recovering slaves, peasants, artisans, prostitutes, vagabonds, savages, flex timers, and squeegee men in the streets of the polis, civitas, metropolis, and cosmopolis. The result is a challenge to think in bolder terms about citizenship at a time when the nature of citizenship is an increasingly open question.

[University of Minnesota Press Publisher's Summary:
http://www.upress.umn.edu/Books/I/isin_being.html]

Methods

Theoretical Exploration

Keywords

Citizenship

Inclusion

Exclusion

Concepts, Understandings and Experiences of Citizenship

Rethinking 'Citizenship' in the Postcolony

Steven Robins, Andrea Cornwall and Bettina Von Lieres, (2008)

Third World Quarterly, Volume 29, Issue 6, Pages 1069 – 1086.

This paper argues for an approach to researching citizenship and democracy that begins not from normative convictions but from everyday experiences in particular social, cultural and historical contexts. The paper starts with a consideration of the ways in which the terms 'democracy' and 'citizenship' have been used in the discourses and approaches taken within mainstream studies of citizenship and democracy, drawing attention to some of the conceptual blind spots that arise. We call for more attention to be paid to contextual understandings of the politics of everyday life, and to locating state, NGO and donor rhetorics and programmes promoting 'active citizenship' and 'participatory governance' within that politics. It is this kind of understanding, we suggest, that, by revealing the limits of the normativities embedded in these discourses, can provide a more substantive basis for rethinking citizenship from the perspectives of citizens themselves.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Conceptual Analysis

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Citizenship

Democracy

Understandings of Citizenship

Participation

Values and meanings of citizenship

Naila Kabeer, (2007)

Development Research Centre on Citizenship, Participation and Accountability

Development Research Reporting Service

Available at: <http://ideas.repec.org/p/ess/wpaper/id1768.html>

What does citizenship mean to poor and socially excluded people? How do their views help us understand and analyse what 'inclusive' citizenship means?

The history of citizenship is largely of struggle over how it is defined and who is included. Today, the views of 'ordinary' citizens are absent in theoretical debates. The Citizenship DRC worked with local community groups in Brazil, Britain, Bangladesh, Kenya, Mexico, Nigeria, Peru and South Africa to examine what citizenship means to people, particularly those whose status as citizens is either non-existent (because the government refuses to recognise their rights) or extremely uncertain.

Findings show that experiences of citizenship vary by context and the nature of exclusion, but there are common values. Although not universal, these values are widespread enough to suggest that they are a significant aspect of how people connect with each other and organise themselves collectively.

People living in illegal housing settlements (favelas) in Brazil, landless women in Bangladesh, indigenous groups in Mexico and housing tenants in Kenya have all experienced exclusion in some form. Their vision of a more inclusive society includes the following values: justice, recognition, self-determination and solidarity.

Justice

This is about when it is fair to treat people the same and when it is fair to treat them differently. For example, citizens in Nigeria prioritised ethnicity as the basis for their identity and primary affiliation. But they expected the state and its representatives to act fairly and impartially to all citizens and protested when citizens were discriminated against on the grounds of ethnicity.

Recognition

This refers to people's right as human beings to be recognised, whether their identity or culture conforms to dominant expectations or not. The 'right to have rights' was at the heart of the Zapatista struggle in Mexico, when indigenous people demanded the right to be different from mainstream society. Dignity and respect are essential to the idea of citizenship in the less visible

and more daily moments of life. In Brazil's favelas, people experienced a lack of citizenship by having no dignity in their everyday interactions with others because of negative stereotyping in wider society.

Self-determination

People's ability to exercise some degree of control over their lives is self-determination. The struggle for rights is expressed in ways that reflect the experiences of people who have been denied self-determination. Naripokkho, a Bangladeshi organisation works with women and their right to self-determination. They challenge gender inequality in access to resources such as education, property, jobs and health care. They also challenge patriarchal power exercised through various forms of control over women's bodies.

Solidarity

This is the capacity to identify with other people and to act in unity with them for justice and recognition. This takes various forms, based on the included or excluded status of individuals and groups. It depends on the extent to which people hope to overcome their excluded status. For those who do not have much hope or experience of solidarity, this is limited to daily struggles in the community, to family or next of kin. In South Africa, for example, an elderly black man said he wanted support, not welfare from the state and expressed solidarity with his immediate community. Solidarity can also take more overtly political forms such as the struggle of the Zapatistas in Mexico to claim their place in the nation's history.

[ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Cases studies of views of citizenship in Brazil, Britain, Bangladesh, Kenya, Mexico, Nigeria, Peru and South Africa

Cross case study analysis of commonalities

Keywords

Citizenship

Understandings of Citizenship

Exclusion

States of Citizenship: Contexts and Cultures of Public Engagement and Citizen Action

Andrea Cornwall, Steven Robins and Bettina Von Lieres, (2011)

Institute of Development Studies (IDS), Working Paper No. 363

Available at: <http://www.ntd.co.uk/idsbookshop/details.asp?id=1223>

Drawing on case studies from the Citizenship Development Research Centre, this paper contends that mechanisms aimed at enhancing citizen engagement need to be contextualised in the states of citizenship in which they are applied. It calls for more attention to be focused on understanding trajectories of citizenship experience and practice in particular kinds of states. It suggests that whilst efforts have been made by donors to get to grips with history and context – such as DFID's Drivers of Change analyses or Sida's Power Studies – less attention has been given to exploring the implications of the dissonance between the normative dimensions of global narratives of participation and accountability, and the lived experience of civic engagement and the empirical realities of 'civil society' in diverse kinds of states. By exploring

instantiations of citizenship in different kinds of states, the paper reflects on what citizen engagement comes to imply in these contexts. In doing so, it draws attention to the diverse ways in which particular subject-positions and forms of identification are articulated in the pursuit of concrete social and political projects.

[Abstract from IDS Website]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Examination of case studies

Keywords

Democracy

Participation

Accountability

Understandings of Citizenship

Civil Society

Meanings of citizenship in Latin America: How can citizenship contribute to a more democratic and equal society in Latin America

E. Dagnino (2005)

Institute of Development Studies (IDS), Working Paper No. 258

Available at: <http://www.drc-citizenship.org/system/assets/1052734448/original/1052734448-dagnino.2005-meanings.pdf>

This paper introduces the Latin American debate on the meanings of citizenship. It examines and discusses:

- the general conditions of the emergence of the notion in different Latin American countries
- general features assumed by the redefinition of citizenship that underlay its emergence in Latin America
- the different nuances and emphases the notion of citizenship has taken up, highlighting the distinctions and specificities of citizenship in different countries
- the neoliberal versions of citizenship and the dilemmas these pose to the original democratising meanings and uses of citizenship in Latin America.

The paper concludes that the struggle against inequality, historically accumulated and aggravated by current neoliberal policies, has been relying, in most countries, on democratic and participatory views of citizenship. These views of citizenship have been able to orient political action, particularly that of excluded sectors. The focus of such collective action relies upon the potential of citizenship as a crucial reference for the building of equality and democracy, whether it is directed towards the defence and extension of rights, the formulation of public policies guided by such principles, within the ambit of the state, or towards the creation of new rights and their recognition by society, affecting cultural dominant orders. The dispute around its meanings, the efforts to confront the reduction and displacement of its significance, constitutes the political debate in Latin America today.

[ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Citizenship

Understandings of Citizenship

Concepts of citizenship: a review

J. Gaventa and E. Jones (2002)

Development Research Centre on Citizenship, Participation and Accountability, Institute of Development Studies, Sussex

Available at: <http://www.ntd.co.uk/idsbookshop/details.asp?id=678>

The review essay in this development bibliography provides a broad map to contemporary thinking around citizenship, building a theoretical frame of reference for empirical work on the contextual relations between citizenship, participation and accountability. It aims to investigate how rights language are actually used in situated struggles by different individuals and groups, and to what effect, in order to understand the realities of how different people see themselves as citizens.

Central to researching citizenship from the perspectives, experiences and knowledges of citizens themselves, is the use of methodologies that enable people to articulate their realities and propose strategies for change. A variety of participatory methods for action research on citizenship are beginning to emerge, which go beyond the formal opening of spaces to those voices that are rarely heard.

As citizens occupy spaces to express the challenges that citizenship presents to them, the authors hope that such an analysis might catalyse processes of reflection and action for change on the part of both citizens and the institutions that affect their lives.

The bibliography features a section of annotated references with brief summaries of recent texts which have been found to be particularly helpful. Other papers in this series explore participation and accountability as they relate to citizenship. The review of literature provided in this paper both points to further direction for research, and emphasises the need to enrich and broaden the debate through the inclusion of citizen's own knowledges, experiences and strategies for change.

[ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Citizenship

Participation

Accountability

Citizenship Narratives in the Absence of Good Governance: Voices of the Working Poor in Bangladesh

Naila Kabeer with Ariful Haq Kabir, (2009)

Institute of Development Studies (IDS), Working Paper No. 331

Available at: <http://www.ntd.co.uk/idsbookshop/details.asp?id=1127>

The complex nature of the challenge posed by state–society relations to the realisation of citizenship rights in the poorer countries of the world reflects the incapacity or unwillingness on the part of the state to guarantee basic security of life and livelihoods to its citizens and its proneness to capture by powerful elites that perpetuate this state of affairs. Consequently, access to resources continue to be defined by position within an unequal social order that is largely constituted by the ascribed relationships of family, kinship, caste and so on. These relationships pervade all spheres of society, rendering irrelevant the idea of an impersonal public sphere which individuals enter as bearers of rights, equal in the eyes of the law. Indeed, given their reliance on patron client relations for their basic survival and security, the idea of individual rights is unlikely to have much meaning or relevance in the lives of most poor people. This paper explores the hypothesis that the possibility of belonging to alternative associations whose membership is not ‘given’ by position in the social order holds out the greatest promise for democratising the social order. Bangladesh offers an interesting context in which to explore this hypothesis because while it embodies most the problems of bad governance outlined above, it also has a large number of civil society organisations, many of whom work primarily with the poorer sections of society. The research focused on the working poor who are most likely to belong to these associations. Analysis of their narratives about their lives and livelihood and their views about rights and social justice suggests, not surprisingly, that there is nothing inherently democratic about civil society organisations in Bangladesh, even those ostensibly oriented to the interests of poor people. What appeared to explain the extent to which organisations were able to achieve democratic outcomes appeared to depend, first of all, on the extent of their commitment to the promotion of citizenship rights among poor people and secondly, on the extent to which they were able to carry out their commitments without interference from the state. In the context of Bangladesh, the state appeared to be far more pro-poor in rural than in urban areas.

[Abstract from IDS Website]

Methods

Semi Structured Interviews with people from ‘poor’ categories in Urban and Rural Bangladesh

Keywords

Clientelism

Poverty

Civil Society

Brazilian Experiences of Participation and Citizenship: A Critical Look

Andrea Cornwall, Jorge Romano and Alex Shankland, (2008)

Institute of Development Studies (IDS), Working Paper No. 389

Available at: <http://www.ntd.co.uk/idsbookshop/details.asp?id=1073>

Brazil’s emergence from two decades of military dictatorship in the mid-1980s gave rise to a flowering of democratic innovation. Experiences during the struggle for democracy shaped the experiments that took place over the following years to create institutions that could ensure the accountability and responsiveness of the new democratic state. Innovations in participatory governance, such as participatory budgeting and sectoral policy councils and conferences at each

tier of government, provided crucibles for new meanings and expressions of citizenship and democracy. Brazil's participatory institutions have attracted considerable international attention. Academics, activists and practitioners in countries, with very different political histories and cultures of governance, have looked to Brazil for inspiration and have sought to replicate Brazil's democratic experiments in their own contexts. Brazilian models may seem an attractive new component to include in the democracy building packages favoured by aid agencies. But, this paper suggests, the contribution that Brazil's democratic innovations have to deepening democracy, enhancing accountability and engaging citizens may lie not only in their innovative institutional design but also in what Brazilian experience can teach us about the pre-conditions for effective participatory governance. Focusing on the north and north east of the country, whose experience is under-represented in the international literature, this paper draws together insights from four extended case studies, carried out as part of a research process that brought together activists, practitioners and academics, in a collaborative study of the meanings and practices of participation and citizenship in Brazil.

[Abstract from IDS Website]

Methods

Four extended case studies

Keywords

Democracy
Participation
Citizenship
Institutions

Challenges to Participation, Citizenship and Democracy: Perverse Confluence and Displacement of Meanings

Evelina Dagnino, (2008)

In Can NGOs Make a Difference? The Challenge of Development Alternatives Anthony J

Bebbington, Samuel Hickey and Diana Mitlin. Editors.

Zed Books: London

The chapter first discusses “the existence of a *perverse confluence* between participatory and neoliberal political projects. This confluence characterises the contemporary scenario of the struggle for deepening democracy in Brazil and in most of Latin America.” It then goes on to explore “the dispute over different meanings of citizenship, civil society and participation that constitute core referents for the understanding of that confluence, and the form that it takes in the Brazilian context”. How the meanings of these terms are contested and displaced within this context is examined in detail. From this analysis the authors conclude that these displacements of these terms depoliticise them and that in the contestation over their meaning “what is at stake is the success or failure of two very different political projects”.

[Summary with extracts from introduction and conclusion of chapter]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Participation
Neo-liberalism
Understandings of Citizenship
Poverty

Rectifying the Anti-Politics of Citizen Participation: Insights from the Internal Politics of a Subaltern Community in Nepal

Katsuhiko Masaki, (2010)

Journal of Development Studies Volume 46, Issue 7, Pages 1196 - 1215

Can 'participatory' approaches to development constitute a viable strategy for promoting citizenship? This paper addresses this question by scrutinising the equivocal reaction of a peasant community in Nepal to the unfolding of one such project, which supposedly reflected their empowerment as equal citizens. Drawing on the notion of 'symbolic citizenship' that values people's 'right to narrate' viewpoints that occur to them naturally, this study proposes a more promising approach that allows people to divulge dilemmas arising from real-world complexities, and then determine the terms of their empowerment, in defiance of the prevailing framework of inclusive liberalism.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Participation

Citizenship

Understandings of Citizenship

Neo-liberalism's New Gendered Market Citizens: The 'Civilizing' Dimension of Social Programmes in Chile

Verónica Schild, (2000)

Citizenship Studies Volume 4, Issue 3, Pages 275 - 305

This article explores the reconfiguration of social citizenship, or 'market citizenship', underway in Chile, as one crucial dimension of the refashioning of state institutions along neo-liberal lines in Latin America. It focuses on the 'civilizing' dimension of social citizenship, as an instance of the state's involvement in the regulation of subordinate populations. Specifically, the article studies the case of new social policy aimed at poverty alleviation. Inspired by Michel Foucault's late work but moving beyond it, it examines institutional transformation as on-the-ground practices through which policies take effect and sees 'market citizenship' as emerging from the rearticulation of the efforts of myriad individuals located at different levels of government, 'civil society', and poor and working-class communities. In this process, state agents are translators on the one hand of official documents into instances of participatory learning and empowerment, and on the other of people's realities into instances of documentary categories of poverty. This cultural-political transformation of neo-liberal modernization in Chile and beyond is potentially radical, and we need to ask: to what extent will the new market terms of belonging in the national community, which increasingly permeate private and public actions and discourse, change the very material and cultural contexts in which people's lives and struggles are framed?

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Neo-liberalism

Citizenship

Understandings of Citizenship

Inclusive Citizenship: Meanings and Expressions

Naila Kabeer. Editor. (2005)

Zed Books: London

People's understandings of what it means to be a citizen go to the heart of the various meanings of personal and national identity, political and electoral participation, and rights. The contributors to this book seek to explore the difficult questions inherent in the notion of citizenship from various angles. They look at citizenship and rights, citizenship and identity, citizenship and political struggle, and the policy implications of substantive notions of citizenship. They illustrate the various ways in which people are excluded from full citizenship; the identities that matter to people and their compatibility with dominant notions of citizenship; the tensions between individual and collective rights in definitions of citizenship; struggles to realize and expand citizens' rights; and the challenges these questions entail for development policy.

[Zed Books Publishers Summary

<http://www.zedbooks.co.uk/book.asp?bookdetail=3787>]

Methods

Review of literature

Case studies of various examples of inclusive citizenship issues in; Peru, South Africa, USA, Bangladesh, Brazil, Mexico, Britain, India and Nigeria.

Keywords

Understandings of Citizenship

Exclusion

Inclusive Citizenship: Realizing the Potential

Ruth Lister (2007)

Citizenship Studies Volume 11, Issue 1, 2007, Pages 49 - 61

Citizenship has been described as a “momentum concept”. One important development over the past decade has been the various ways in which scholars and activists have developed citizenship's inclusionary potential. The first part of the article explores these developments in general terms with regard to the values underpinning inclusive citizenship; the implications of the notion of cultural citizenship; and the theorization of differentiated forms of citizenship, which nevertheless appeal to universalist principles. These principles provide the basis for the citizenship claims of people living in poverty, a group largely ignored in citizenship studies. Other lacunae have been disability and, until recently, childhood. The second part of the article discusses how citizenship studies has reworked the concept in a more inclusionary direction through the development of a multi-tiered analysis, which pays attention to the spaces and places in which lived citizenship is practised. It focuses in particular on the intimate and domestic sphere, with particular reference to debates around care and citizenship, and on the interconnections between the intimate/domestic and the global, using “global care chains” and ecological citizenship as examples.

[Author's abstract]

Methods

Examination of evolution of concepts

Review of literature

Keywords

Inclusive Citizenship
Poverty and citizenship
Citizenship

Citizens and the state: citizenship formations in space and time

Sallie A. Marston and Katharyne Mitchell, (2004)

In Spaces of Democracy: Geographical Perspectives on Citizenship, Participation and Representation

Dr Clive Barnett and Dr Murray Low. Editors.

Sage: London

“In this chapter we examine the ways in which the state’s relationship to citizenship is always shifting, sometimes contradictory and inevitably interrelated with the form and logic of capitalist development. We advocate an approach to citizenship that recognises it, not as a stable and evolving conceptual category, but as a non-static, non-linear social, political, cultural, economic, and legal construction that is best rendered in terms of a *citizenship formation*. The citizenship formation approach recognised citizenship as a process that is both enabling and constraining. Two case studies are described to illustrate this point. The first is an historical geographical case study of turn-of-the-nineteenth-century which, US, urban women’s movements. [...] The second is a contemporary case study of turn-of-the-twentieth-century Hong Kong transitional migrants to Vancouver, Canada.”

[Extract from Chapter]

Methods

Comparative case studies

Keywords

Citizenship
Understandings of Citizenship

How much is citizenship worth? The case of Kyrgyzstani migrants in Kazakhstan and Russia

Vanessa Ruget and Burul Usmanalieva, (2010)

Citizenship Studies Volume 14, Issue 4, Pages 445-459

In the past few decades, political membership has become more complex, for example, through the proliferation of dual and multiple citizenships. Some scholars argue that, as a result, state membership may have become less relevant to individuals. In the same vein, our article argues that Kyrgyzstani migrants working in Russia and Kazakhstan have developed a pragmatic approach to citizenship. This case study, which builds upon in-depth interviews conducted in April and May 2008, is pertinent for several reasons. Labor migration from Kyrgyzstan has surged in recent years and is radically affecting the country's economy, society, and polity. Besides, Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan, and Russia have been separate political units for less than two decades; transnational practices and attitudes are thus not new. Our results show that for Kyrgyzstani migrants in Russia and Kazakhstan, citizenship is mainly defined in terms of concrete, short-term benefits. They have difficulties formulating what it means to be a citizen beyond the expression of a vague patriotic support. Those who have naturalized, mostly in Russia, do it for convenience purposes without attaching much affective meaning to it. Most see

their stay as temporary (particularly in Kazakhstan), are not engaged in diasporic organizations or activities, and are estranged from the politics of both their home and host country. Adapted from the source document.

[Abstract from IBSS Database]

Methods

In-depth interviews

Keywords

Citizenship

Understandings of Citizenship

Political geography: Where's citizenship?

Lynn Staeheli

Progress in Human Geography, Pages 1–8

Published online before print August 26, 2010, doi: 10.1177/0309132510370671

Citizenship is a contested subject in political geography, as a quick review of the literature suggests considerable differences in the way it is conceptualized and its importance is understood. This report reviews debates on the salience of citizenship in the context of broad social, political, and economic changes. Rather than attempting to assign a relative importance to citizenship as status as compared to citizenship as membership, it focuses on the continual rearticulation of the relationships and sites through which citizenship is constructed.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Examination of Concepts

Keywords

Understandings of Citizenship

Dangerous Spaces of Citizenship: Gang Talk, Rights Talk and Rule of Law in Brazil

James Holston, (2009)

Planning Theory, Volume 8, Issue 1, Pages 12-31

This article considers an apparently perplexing aspect of democratization in Brazil: the use by notorious criminal gangs (*comandos*) from the poor urban peripheries and prisons of the discourses of democratic citizenship, justice, and rule of law to represent their own organizations and intentions. I situate this use within an unsettling development in Latin America generally during the last 30 years: the coincidence of increasing political democracy and increasing everyday violence and injustice against citizens. My discussion considers these new territorializations of power and violence and their consequences for citizenship, democracy, and urbanization. To bring them to light, I focus on public pronouncements by Brazilian criminal gangs that typically combine rationalities of crime with those of democracy, citizen rights, rule of law, and revolution. I also compare them with public declarations made by the police. I analyze both in relation to the historically dominant paradigm of Brazilian citizenship that democratization destabilizes. I then evaluate this destabilization with regard to the new kinds of

violence and paradigms of insurgent citizenship that have emerged as characteristics of urbanization and democratization worldwide.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study
Analysis of Public Statements

Keywords

Citizenship
Violence and Conflict
Democracy

Growing Citizenship from the Grassroots: Nijera Kori and Social Mobilization in Bangladesh

Naila Kabeer, (2003)

The Bangladesh Development Studies, Volume 29, Issue 3 and 4

In this paper, Kabeer discusses Nijera Kori (NK), a Bangladeshi NGO which “concentrates entirely on building up the collective capabilities of the poor to demand their rights” (p.2). Her examination lays out how this organisation’s activities were part of the formation of particular kinds of citizenship; especially in terms of rural women coming to be aware of their rights and being able to utilise these within situations of conflict (such as those with kin and communities) (p.18). These outcomes emerge out of NK’s approach, which contrasts to other service delivery NGOs, due to NK’s focuses on structural inequalities. Kabeer concludes that the impacts of KB have been far-reaching in terms of their ability to convince their members of the possibilities to challenge injustice (p.19).

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Citizenship Formation
Change
Poverty

Citizenship Formation and State Formation

Citizen and Subject: Contemporary Africa and the Legacy of Late Colonialism

Mamood Mamdani, (1996)

Princeton University Press: Princeton, NJ

In analyzing the obstacles to democratization in post- independence Africa, Mahmood Mamdani offers a bold, insightful account of colonialism's legacy--a bifurcated power that mediated racial domination through tribally organized local authorities, reproducing racial identity in citizens and ethnic identity in subjects. Many writers have understood colonial rule as either "direct" (French) or "indirect" (British), with a third variant--apartheid--as exceptional. This benign terminology,

Mamdani shows, masks the fact that these were actually variants of a despotism. While direct rule denied rights to subjects on racial grounds, indirect rule incorporated them into a "customary" mode of rule, with state-appointed Native Authorities defining custom. By tapping authoritarian possibilities in culture, and by giving culture an authoritarian bent, indirect rule (decentralized despotism) set the pace for Africa; the French followed suit by changing from direct to indirect administration, while apartheid emerged relatively later. Apartheid, Mamdani shows, was actually the generic form of the colonial state in Africa.

Through case studies of rural (Uganda) and urban (South Africa) resistance movements, we learn how these institutional features fragment resistance and how states tend to play off reform in one sector against repression in the other. Reforming a power that institutionally enforces tension between town and country, and between ethnicities, is the key challenge for anyone interested in democratic reform in Africa.

[Princeton University Press Publisher's Summary:
<http://press.princeton.edu/titles/5839.html>]

Methods

Case Study
Historical Analysis

Keywords

Citizenship
State Formation
Democracy
State-Society Relations

Contesting Citizenship: Indigenous Movements and Democracy in Latin America

Deborah J. Yashar (1998)

Comparative Politics Volume 31, Issue 1, Pages 23-42

Ethnic cleavages have rarely led to political organizing and sustained political conflict in Latin America. However, recently a wave of rural organizing and movements has mobilized Indians to advance and defend their self-proclaimed indigenous rights. Why has indigenous identity become more salient in political organizing and claims in the past two decades? A historically grounded comparative analysis that situates indigenous identity and movement formation in relation to state formation and the changing terms of citizenship can answer this question.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Comparative analysis

Keywords

State Formation
State-Society Relations
Understandings of Citizenship

Making Nations, Creating Strangers: States and Citizenship in Africa

Sara Dorman, Daniel Hammett, and Paul Nugent, Editors. (2007)

Brill: Leiden

Who belongs to the nation? How is citizenship defined? And why have such identities become so politically explosive in recent years? This book explores the instrumental manipulation of citizenship and narrowing definitions of national-belonging which refract recent political struggles in Zimbabwe, Cote d'Ivoire, Cameroon, Somalia, Tanzania, and South Africa. Conflicts which have arisen over the resources of the post-colonial state are increasingly legitimated through recourse to claims of nationhood and citizenship. The contributors address the historical roots of national and ethnic identities, the material and symbolic resources which are contested within states, and the relative importance of elite manipulation and subaltern agency.

[Brill Publisher's Summary: http://brill.nl/product_id28238]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Identity

State Formation

Ethnicity

Resources

State Recognition of Traditional Authority : Authority, Citizenship and State Formation in Rural Post-War Mozambique

Helene Maria Kyed (2007)

Ph.D Dissertation. Roskilde University Centre

Available at: <http://dspace.ruc.dk/handle/1800/3090>

This PhD thesis focuses on “state recognition of traditional authority ten years into the post-war democratic transition in Mozambique.” It demonstrates how formal recognition by the state of chiefs’ authority is mirrored by the chiefs’ recognition of the state. “The key point is that the authority of each is *constituted relationally*, and as a result reshaped. State recognition of traditional authority shapes chiefs’ practices and claims to authority, but by the same token it also shapes the operations and authority of the local tiers of the state. The present study is about this *productive tension* in rural Mozambique. It is about fixations, mutual transformations and relational constitutions of state and traditional authority.”

[Adapted Extract from Thesis]

Methods

Participant Observation

Interviews

Keywords

State Formation

Citizenship

Contesting Citizenship in Latin America: The Rise of Indigenous Movements and the Postliberal Challenge

Deborah J. Yashar (2005)

Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

Indigenous people in Latin America have mobilized in unprecedented ways - demanding recognition, equal protection, and subnational autonomy. These are remarkable developments in a region where ethnic cleavages were once universally described as weak. Recently, however, indigenous activists and elected officials have increasingly shaped national political deliberations. Deborah Yashar explains the contemporary and uneven emergence of Latin American indigenous movements - addressing both why indigenous identities have become politically salient in the contemporary period and why they have translated into significant political organizations in some places and not others. She argues that ethnic politics can best be explained through a comparative historical approach that analyzes three factors: changing citizenship regimes, social networks, and political associational space. Her argument provides insight into the fragility and unevenness of Latin America's third wave democracies and has broader implications for the ways in which we theorize the relationship between citizenship, states, identity, and social action.

[Cambridge University Press Publisher's Summary:

http://www.cambridge.org/gb/knowledge/isbn/item1170914/?site_locale=en_GB]

Methods

Comparative Case Studies

Keywords

Citizenship

Identity

State Formation

State-Society Relations

Understandings of Citizenship

Marching for Progress: Rituals of Citizenship, State and Belonging in a High Andes District

Finn Stepputat (2004)

Bulletin of Latin American Research, Volume 23, Issue 2, pages 244-259

This article explores processes of citizenship and state formation in the Central Peruvian Andes in the wake of the armed conflict through the lens of a public ritual, the celebration of a district anniversary. The celebration is a reservoir of practices from past forms of state formation and may be read as a claim for recognition as full-blown members of the nation-state. While practices of citizenship as rights are emerging, the celebration is permeated by the association between citizenship and civilization, with discipline playing a major role as an instrument of modernisation and progress.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

State Formation

Identity

Understandings of Citizenship

Citizenship and Ethnicity: An Examination of Two Transition Moments in Kenyan Politics

Stephen N. Ndegwa (1997)

The American Political Science Review Volume 91, Issue 3, Pages 599-616

In some African countries, democratic openings have intensified ethnic competition and led to protracted transitions or outright conflict. In Kenya, I argue, the stalled transition reflects the effects of republican citizenship in ethnic political communities and liberal citizenship in the national political community. This duality in citizenship engenders conflict over democracy - conceived as liberal majoritarian democracy - and results in ethnic coalitions disagreeing over which institutions are appropriate for a multiethnic state. I provide evidence from discourses over institutions from two transition periods in Kenya: at independence and in the recent shift from one-party rule. This study makes two contributions. First, it adds to current citizenship theory, which is largely derived from Western experience, by demonstrating that republican and liberal citizenships are not necessarily compatible and that the modern nation-state is not the only relevant community for forming citizens. Second, it adds to studies of African transitions by highlighting citizenship issues in institutional design with regard to ethnicity in Kenya.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Analysis of discourses

Keywords

Institutions

Ethnicity

State Formation

Understandings of Citizenship

Negotiating Statehood: Dynamics of Power and Domination in Africa

Tobias Hagmann and Didier P'eclard, (2010)

Development and Change, Volume 41, Issue 4, Pages 539-562

This article, which forms the introduction to a collection of studies, focuses on processes of state construction and deconstruction in contemporary Africa. Its objective is to better understand how local, national and transnational actors forge and remake the state through processes of negotiation, contestation and bricolage. Following a critique of the predominant state failure literature and its normative and analytical shortcomings, the authors identify four key arguments of the scholarly literature on the state in Africa, which concern the historicity of the state in Africa, the embeddedness of bureaucratic organizations in society, the symbolic and material dimensions of statehood and the importance of legitimacy. A heuristic framework entitled 'negotiating statehood' is proposed, referring to the dynamic and partly undetermined processes of state formation and failure by a multitude of social actors who compete over the institutionalization of power relations. The article then operationalizes this framework in three sections that partly conceptualize, partly illustrate who negotiates statehood in contemporary Africa (actors, resources and repertoires); where these negotiation processes occur (negotiation arenas and tables); and what these processes are all about (objects of negotiation). Empirical examples drawn from a variety of political contexts across the African continent illustrate these propositions.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

State Formation

Bureaucracy

Legitimacy

Citizenship Formation and Effective(?) States

Building effective states: Taking a citizen's perspective

Rosalind Eyben and Sarah Ladbury (2006)

Citizenship DRC Report

Available at: [http://www.drc-](http://www.drc-citizenship.org/docs/publications/reports/drccitizensperspective.pdf)

[citizenship.org/docs/publications/reports/drccitizensperspective.pdf](http://www.drc-citizenship.org/docs/publications/reports/drccitizensperspective.pdf)

The purpose of this paper is to present findings of the Development Research Centre on Citizenship, Participation and Accountability (DRC) that are relevant to current policy debates on what makes for effective states and country ownership. At the heart of the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness lies a commitment to partner countries exercising leadership over their development policies and strategies and effectively co-ordinating these.

The DRC work draws on empirical examples to demonstrate the connection between effective states and empowered citizens. What characterises the DRC work is that it takes a citizen's perspective – in contrast to how concepts of citizenship and citizen action are framed in other dominant approaches to development. 'In the market approach the assumption is that if one can get the market right, the benefits will follow for the citizen as consumer. In the state approach if one can get the institutions of the state right, then citizens can also play a role in holding it accountable and delivering its services. In the democracy building approach, if democracy can be designed and spread effectively, then citizens can play a role as voters and watchdogs of those in power. In the civil society approach, if the NGO sector can grow and become more professional, it can help communicate the messages for citizens as its constituents to market, state and elected leaders. In contrast...the 'seeing like a citizen' approach... starts with the perceptions of citizens themselves and asks how they interact and view the institutions from which they are expected to benefit.'

The paper is organised into two sections:

- An overview of current donor debates around effective states, the ways that citizenship, participation and accountability are dealt with in these debates and the insights offered by the DRC research
- Selected DRC research findings from fieldwork undertaken by the research partnership; the policy messages arising from these that are pertinent to the effective states agenda. A brief conclusion provides some key themes for international aid agencies arising from this research.

[Adapted from the paper]

Methods

Review of the literature

Review of Development Research Centre on Citizenship, Participation and Accountability research findings

Keywords

Effective States

Participation

Accountability

The micro-dynamics of welfare state retrenchment and the implications for citizenship in Africa

L.M. McLean (2007)

Afrobarometer, Working Paper No. 73

Available at:

http://next.pls.msu.edu/index.php?option=com_docman&task=doc_download&Itemid=176&gid=154

In Africa, neoliberal reform has represented a major reduction in spending on the public provision of health and education services. This paper investigates two key questions through an examination of the micro-effects of the macro-policies associated with the current era of globalisation. Firstly, how do Africans at the local level differentially experience cuts in health and education services? Secondly, how do the differences in the micro-experience of social policy shape the ways that Africans conceptualise and practice citizenship.

Key points include:

- it is important to analyse the impact of public policies at a micro-level, as similar policies applied across different countries will have varied impacts on individuals
- full understanding the political process of globalisation and the retrenchment of the welfare state cannot be achieved without examining how these policies are experienced differentially on the ground
- in some cases there appears to be a two-tiered system where the poor rely on public services and those with more resources elect to use private service providers
- those with more experience in public services are more likely register, vote and participate in a wide range of non-electoral political activities

The paper concludes that a critical issue for policymakers in Africa and other parts of the developing world is that donors and governments around the world need to invest in improving not just the accessibility, but the quality of social services. It is suggested that the more well-to-do might be choosing not to receive their health and education services from the state. This has important consequences for the public social welfare system if those who are more able to pay for services are opting out.

[ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Analysis of surveys

Keywords

Public Goods

Citizenship

Poor people and democratic citizenship in Africa

M. Bratton (2006)

Afrobarometer, Working Paper No. 56

Available at:

http://next.pls.msu.edu/index.php?option=com_docman&task=doc_download&Itemid=176&gid=667

A democratic political regime has long been regarded as an attribute of high-income, industrialized economies. This paper challenges this assumption by exploring the relationship between poor people and the concept of democratic citizenship in sub-Saharan Africa.

The fundamental questions the author attempts to answer are:

- are poor people any more or less attached to democracy than rich people?
- Are they any more or less likely to act as democratic citizens?

These ideas are tested, in the African contexts, from data drawn from the Afrobarometer - a series of comparative national surveys that, among other things, measures the economic living conditions and political orientations of ordinary Africans. The most important findings of this paper include:

- people at all levels of material wellbeing tend to have similar views on political tolerance, political accountability, and political equality
- poorer people are less inclined than wealthier people to think they are getting democracy from current African governments - one cannot, however, be certain if poor people actually want less of this political regime
- voter turnout is higher amongst the poor, who are also more likely to participate in political activity between elections
- evidence from the Afrobarometer suggests that ordinary Africans remain wedded to patronage norms - they still see themselves as the clients of political "big men" rather than citizens with rights.

[ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Analysis of surveys

Keywords

Poverty

Citizenship

Democracy

Clientelism

From Users and Choosers to Makers and Shapers: Repositioning Participation in Social Policy

Andrea Cornwall and John Gaventa, (2001)

Institute of Development Studies (IDS), Working Paper No. 127

Available at: <http://www.ids.ac.uk/go/idspublication/from-users-and-choosers-to-makers-and-shapers-repositioning-participation-in-social-policy>

How do ordinary people, especially poor people, affect the social policies that in turn affect their well-being? What is the role of citizen participation in social policy formation and implementation in this era of globalisation? How do changing contexts and conditions affect the

entry points through which actors in civil society, especially the poor or those working with the poor, can exercise voice and influence in critical aspects of social care, be they in the areas of health, education, welfare, social security, programmes for the disabled, low-income housing, or other significant social policy arenas?

In this paper, we take up these questions. We explore an approach to social policy that sees citizens not only as users or choosers, but as active participants who engage in making and shaping social policy and social provisioning. In doing so, we argue that the concept of 'social citizenship' that has often underpinned considerations of social welfare should be expanded to include not only concepts of social rights, but also of social responsibilities and social accountability through direct forms of democratic governance.

Repositioning participation in the context of debates on citizenship and agency, we review strategies that have been used to strengthen participation in social policy and social provisioning. We examine in turn four approaches to participation. These include: (a) those in which beneficiaries of social services are consulted as users or consumers, (b) those that have emphasised self-provisioning through civil society, (c) social and advocacy movements through which citizens have advocated for social provisioning from the state, as a social right, and, (d) lastly, accountability approaches which emphasise new relationships between service providers and citizens through their active participation in processes of democratic governance.

Reflecting on these approaches, we suggest that the more functional concepts of participation, through which beneficiaries participate as users or consumers of pre-determined public services, are of limited utility. Not only do they fail to include people in broader aspects of the policy process, but they also ignore their contribution to self-provisioning outside formal government arenas. Most importantly, they fail to recognise or realise the potential of more active citizen engagement in making and shaping social policy and with it opportunities for enhanced service responsiveness, transparency and accountability.

[Abstract from IDS Website]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Public Goods

Civil Society

Participation

Spaces For Change? The Politics of Citizen Participation in New Democratic Arenas

Andrea Cornwall, Editor, (2006)

Zed Books: London

This book studies one of the greatest challenges of our age: building democratic polities where all can realize their rights and claim substantive citizenship. In recent years, innovations in governance have created a plethora of new democratic spaces in many countries. Yet there remains a gap between the intention to institutionalize participation and the reality of exclusion of poorer and marginalized citizens. Through case studies of a diversity of institutions - hospital facility boards in South Africa, a national-level deliberative process in Canada, sectoral

management councils and community groups in Brazil, India, Mexico and Bangladesh, budgeting processes in Argentina, NGO-created forums in Angola and Bangladesh, community forums in the UK, and new intermediary spaces created by social movements in South Africa - contributors examine how the democratic potential of these new spaces might be enhanced.

[Abstract from IDS Website]

Methods

Case studies across, various state sectors and levels, conducted in countries including; Brazil, Bangladesh, India, South Africa, Canada, Angola and England

Keywords

Democracy

Participation

Public Goods

Civil Society

So What Difference Does it Make? Mapping the Outcomes of Citizen Engagement

John Gaventa and Gregory Barrett, (2010)

Institute of Development Studies (IDS), Working Paper No. 347

Available at: <http://www.ntd.co.uk/idsbookshop/details.asp?id=1197>

Over the last two decades, the idea that citizen engagement and participation can contribute to improved governance and development outcomes has been mainstreamed in development policy and discourse. Yet despite the normative beliefs that underpin this approach, the impact of participation on improved democratic and developmental outcomes has proved difficult to assess. Where previous research studies have attempted to demonstrate impact, they tend to be limited to single interventions, a small number of country contexts or by various conceptual and methodological constraints. In this paper, we report on a meta-case study analysis of a ten-year research programme on citizenship, participation and accountability which analysed a nonrandomised sample of 100 research studies of four types of citizen engagement in 20 countries. By mapping the observable effects of citizen participation through a close reading of these studies, we created a typology of four democratic and developmental outcomes, including (a) the construction of citizenship, (b) the strengthening of practices of participation, (c) the strengthening of responsive and accountable states, and (d) the development of inclusive and cohesive societies. We find that citizen participation produces positive effects across these outcome types, though in each category there are also examples of negative outcomes of citizen participation. We also find that these outcomes vary according to the type of citizen engagement and to political context. These findings have important implications for the design of and support for participatory programmes meant to improve state responsiveness and effectiveness.

[Abstract from IDS Website]

Methods

Analysis of 100 previously published research studies

Including 100 (non-randomised) case studies

Keywords

Citizenship
Participation
Governance
Accountability
Democracy
Effective States
Inclusion

Debating Social Protection

Stephen Devereux and Rachel Sabates-Wheeler, Editors. (2007)
IDS Bulletins Volume 38, Issue 3,

The rapid rise of social protection up the development policy agenda has been startling: it can achieve bigger development objectives, such as economic growth and the MDGs. Its predecessor ‘social safety nets’ was disparaged and attacked during the 1990s, and was then reborn as ‘social protection’ at the turn of the millennium. The new agenda comes with a fresh array of conceptual frameworks, analytical tools, empirical evidence, national policy processes, heavyweight agencies and big names in development studies behind it. It is amenable to the ‘right’ and ‘left’, and prioritises moving people productive livelihoods. Advocates for social protection fall into two broad camps – the ‘instrumentalists’ and the ‘activists’. For instrumentalists social protection is about putting in place risk management mechanisms that will compensate for incomplete insurance (and other) markets, until poverty reduction and market deepening allow private insurance to play a more prominent role. Activists view the persistence of extreme poverty, inequality and vulnerability as symptoms of social injustice and structural inequity, and campaign for social protection as an inviolable right of citizenship. These issues are debated in this *IDS Bulletin*. Commentators were encouraged to be provocative and pithy – and the protagonists are given a ‘right to reply’ to their critics. Some stirring encounters result. This overview highlights how rapidly thinking and practice have moved forward in a few short years, but it has also revealed that a range of conceptual, empirical and policy issues remain unresolved.

[Abstract from IDS Website]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Public Goods
Poverty

Mobilising the State? Social Mobilisation and State Interaction in India, Brazil and South Africa

Ranjita Mohanty, Lisa Thompson and Vera Schattan Coelho, (2011)

Institute of Development Studies (IDS), Working Paper No. 359

Available at: <http://www.ids.ac.uk/go/idspublication/mobilising-the-state-social-mobilisation-and-state-interaction-in-india-brazil-and-south-africa>

This paper explores how social mobilisation and the state interact, influence and mutually constitute each other in India, Brazil and South Africa. Given their broad similarities of

democratic political structures, as emerging economies that now often commonly characterise them as 'middle-income' and of their persistent socioeconomic inequalities, a focus on these three countries offers opportunities for a comparative analysis on whether and to what extent democracy is deepened to meet the needs of the poor through state-society interactions. Through a political process approach that combines historical analysis with select cases from each country, we critically examine the modes of interaction between forms of mobilisation that raise citizen demands and the state response.

The findings show that these states find it comfortable to adopt participatory modes and to engage with forms of mobilisation that are perceived (from within their institutional ranks) to be close to their own framework and strategy of action. However, the cases in which citizens raise legitimate yet contentious demand through protests and other forms of contestations are highly likely to meet state resistance. However, from the citizen's point of view, action is important, and despite the potential lack of state response, contributes to a sense of agency and empowerment which is crucial for democracy. Not letting the state off the hook, the paper argues, is in itself an empowering expression of citizenship and political identity.

[Abstract from IDS Website]

Methods

Review of literature and recent research

Keywords

Citizenship

Participation

Democracy

Governance

From Poverty to Power: How Active Citizens and Effective States Can Change the World

Duncan Green, (2008)

Oxfam International; Oxford

The twenty-first century will be defined by the fight against the scourges of poverty, inequality, and the threat of environmental collapse – as the fight against slavery or for universal suffrage defined earlier eras. From Poverty to Power argues that it requires a radical redistribution of power, opportunities, and assets to break the cycle of poverty and inequality and to give poor people power over their own destinies. The forces driving this transformation are active citizens and effective states. Why active citizenship? Because people living in poverty must have a voice in deciding their own destiny, fighting for rights and justice in their own society, and holding states and the private sector to account. Why effective states? Because history shows that no country has prospered without a state structure that can actively manage the development process. There is now an added urgency beyond the moral case for tackling poverty and inequality: we need to build a secure, fair, and sustainable world before climate change makes it impossible. This book argues that leaders, organisations, and individuals need to act together, while there is still time.

[Abstract from IDS Website]

Methods

Discussions with development professionals

Institutional experiences

Keywords

Citizenship

Effective States

Do Rights Work? Law, Activism, and the Employment Guarantee Scheme

Anuradha Joshi, (2010)

World Development Volume 38, Issue 4, Pages 620–630.

Recent, “rights-based approaches” offer a promising route for bringing about social change. However, we have little experience with state-provided legally enforceable socio-economic rights. This paper examines one of the few examples of a legally granted socio-economic right - a limited “right to work” - that has existed in one state of India for over 25 years in the form of the Employment Guarantee Scheme. The paper argues that legal underpinnings do not automatically enable the poor to obtain rights; however, legal rights have important indirect effects for pro-poor activist organizations including mobilizing membership, protecting activists from arbitrary action, and shifting public discourse.

[Author’s Abstract]

Methods

Case Study of Employment Guarantee Scheme

Keywords

Poverty

State-Society Relations

Citizen Action and National Policy Reform: Making Change Happen

John Gaventa and Rosemary McGee. Editors. (2010)

Zed Books: London

How does citizen activism win changes in national policy? Which factors help to make myriad efforts by diverse actors add up to reform? What is needed to overcome setbacks, and to consolidate the smaller victories?

These questions need answers. Aid agencies have invested heavily in supporting civil society organizations as change agents in fledgling and established democracies alike. Evidence gathered by donors, NGOs and academics demonstrates how advocacy and campaigning can reconfigure power relations and transform governance structures at the local and global levels. In the rush to go global or stay local, however, the national policy sphere was recently neglected. Today, there is growing recognition of the key role of champions of change inside national governments, and the potential of their engagement with citizen activists outside. These advances demand a better understanding of how national and local actors can combine approaches to simultaneously work the levers of change, and how their successes relate to actors and institutions at the international level.

This book brings together eight studies of successful cases of citizen activism for national policy changes in South Africa, Morocco, Brazil, Chile, Mexico, Turkey, India and the Philippines. They detail the dynamics and strategies that have led to the introduction, change or effective implementation of policies responding to a range of rights deficits. Drawing on influential social

science theory about how political and social change occurs, the book brings new empirical insights to bear on it, both challenging and enriching current understandings.

[Zed Books Publisher's Summary: <http://www.zedbooks.co.uk/book.asp?bookdetail=4329>]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

State-Society Relations

Effective States

Civil Society

Citizenship

Policy

Subjecting Nature to Central Authority: The Struggle over Public Goods in the Formation of Citizenship

Nyangabyaki Bazaara, (2006)

Africa Development, Volume 31, Issue 2, Pages 19–35

Available at: http://www.codesria.org/IMG/pdf/2_Bazaara.pdf

Uganda is widely cited for its participatory orientation and strong commitment to implementation with regard to its decentralisation reforms. The implementation and outcomes of Uganda's decentralisation reforms are examined to test the assumption that when decision-making powers over the environment are devolved to locally elected representatives, this increases participation and leads to better environmental outcomes. This article's analysis accounts for actors who have received environmental powers, the central–local government relations, the local government relationship with local population, and social and environmental outcomes. Evidence indicates that collaborative management schemes lack decision-making powers and fail to represent all groups with interest in the resources. The centre retains control of natural resources through deconcentrated functions that are not accountable to the interests of local populations. Under such conditions it is not possible to test whether greater participation leads to better social and environmental outcomes, although it is evident that the current resource management arrangement does not favour sustainable environmental or better social outcomes.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Primary research on decentralisation programmes

Review of the literature

Keywords

Participation

State-Society Relations

Effective States

Citizenship, the 'Right to the City' and State Fragility

Lucy Earle, (2011)

Crisis States Research Programme (CSRC) Working Paper No. 87

London School of Economics

Available at:

<http://www2.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/crisisStates/Publications/wpPhase2/wp87.aspx>

This paper draws together insights from a wide range of work carried out for the Cities and Fragile States component of the Crisis States programme between 2005 and 2010.

The author examines the city as a site in which the provision of public goods and services for citizens is demanded and provided through the transfer of central state revenues. The relationship between state and citizens is not conceived simply in the relatively passive and limiting terms of welfare delivery, but rather within the broader arena of *social rights*, understood as a core component of substantive citizenship – an important characteristic of developmental states. The focus of the paper is derived from the recognition that social rights, notably access to land and housing, are of particular importance in cities. Conflicts over the appropriate use of land are more likely to arise in urban areas, and the high value of land combined with its potential to contribute to economic development mean that the state almost inevitably becomes involved in these conflicts. This paper's examination of the spatial aspects of social rights in urban areas gives rise to a discussion of the 'right to the city', and how the denial of this right can create increased tension and destabilisation in the cities of fragile states. The author outlines the theoretical basis for the paper with an examination of social rights and substantive citizenship, illustrated through the case of a housing movement of the urban poor in São Paulo, Brazil. The paper then develops the discussion of the link between social rights and state stability through a reading of a selection of CSRC case studies of cities in fragile states.

[Summary from LSE CSRC Website]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Public Goods

Citizenship

Developmental States

Putting Citizens at the Centre: Linking States and Societies for Responsive Governance

Nicholas Benequista, (2010)

Development Research Centre on Citizenship, Participation and Accountability. Prepared for the DFID Conference on 'The Politics of Poverty, Elites, Citizens and States', 21-23 June, Sunningdale, UK

Available at: <http://139.184.194.47/go/display&type=Document&id=3863>

How does citizen engagement contribute to responsive governance? This paper summarises ten years of research from the Development Research Centre on Citizenship, Participation, and Accountability, presenting the key findings of more than 150 case studies of citizen engagement. It argues that existing donor programmes fail to recognise the full potential of citizen engagement, resulting in lack of understanding of the complex relationship between citizens and

the state that shapes governance outcomes. Citizens need greater political knowledge and awareness of rights and of agency as a first step to claiming rights and acting for themselves. Involvement in associations has been an effective way of strengthening notions of citizenship and citizen engagement, which can contribute to more responsive states.

[...]

New strategies are needed in constructing and implementing development policy which focus on the relationship and interaction *between* state institutions and citizens. Key findings include the following:

- *Citizen capabilities are a crucial yet often ignored intermediate outcome:* Developing an active citizenry requires not only awareness campaigns, training or civil society membership, but also citizen action, through which citizens can learn skills and build alliances.
- *Citizen action can contribute to development by improving service delivery:* Citizens can be active participants in making and shaping the service delivery systems they depend upon. Collective engagement can transform a development *resource* into a *right*.
- *Citizen action can contribute to new accountability frameworks:* Demands for state accountability can be driven from below, through citizen movements. Citizen strategies include informal methods that can change cultures of accountability.
- *Meaningful citizenship often begins with associational life:* Local associations can play important roles in strengthening cultures of citizenship, which can contribute to more responsive states.
- *Citizen mobilisation can contribute to making rights and democracy real for marginalised groups:* Organised citizens strengthen democratic practice when they demand new rights, mobilise pressure for policy change and monitor government performance. Social movements and other forms of collective action provide opportunities for engagement and contribute to democratic politics and social change.
- *Participation requires basic infrastructure:* Citizen engagement requires a place to meet, inclusive new spaces, and essential services such as documentation. In the absence of support, poorer segments of society may find it difficult to participate.
- *Violence and insecurity contribute to fragile citizenship:* In violent settings, citizens's strategies include withdrawal into partial citizenship or self-censorship, peaceful coexistence with violent actors, and establishing parallel governance or security structures.

[...]

[Abridged Summary from GSDRC Website]

Methods

Review of Research

Keywords

Citizenship

Effective States

Public Goods

State-Society Relations

Decentralization, Local Taxation and Citizenship in Senegal

K Juul, (2006)

Development and Change, Volume 37, Issue 4, Pages 821-846

This article deals with the politics of revenue collection in a framework of decentralization, democratization and multiparty politics as experienced in the small village of Barkedji in the pastoral region of Senegal. In Senegal, revenue collection has recently been transferred from state administrators to locally elected councillors. Contrary to the assumption of the 'good governance' doctrine, this transfer of responsibility has not resulted in a strengthening of democratic structures where taxpayers demand (and gain) public services and more political representation in exchange for increasing taxes. In Barkedji, as elsewhere in Senegal, tax-compliance hit rock-bottom after tax collection became the responsibility of local councillors. Meanwhile other types of local institutions, with less clear state relations, are able to mobilize large amounts of revenue outside the normal tax channels for the provision of goods and service. These non-state institutions seem to have taken over as providers of political representation as well as suppliers of public goods and of access or rights to crucial local resources. The article explores the motivation among first-comers and newcomer populations to adopt or reject tax requirements to different types of organizations, and discusses the implications of this parallel tax collection for the exercise of public authority and the crafting of state and citizenry.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Taxation

State-Society Relations

Democracy

Public Goods

Legitimacy

Politics and Governance in the Social Sectors in Bangladesh: 1991-2006

Naomi Hossain and Ferdous Osman, (2007)

BRAC, Research Monograph Series No. 34

Bangladesh has made impressive gains in poverty reduction and social and human development since 1991 although these achievements are increasingly overshadowed by rising concerns about quality and equity in social service provision. The achievements also contrast sharply with worsening governance over the period. This odd pairing of development success with governance failure has given rise to the so-called Bangladesh 'paradox': how were pro-poor development achievements possible, given the poor state of governance?

The paper addresses this question through a review of the evidence on a) safety nets for the poor; b) primary and lower secondary (or basic) education; and c) publicly-provided healthcare services. For each sector, it sketches the main achievements and challenges of service delivery and analyses the key political and administrative issues, with an emphasis on evaluating the impact of corruption, leakage and accountability.

The paper concludes by drawing together lessons from across these sectoral experiences. These include that a) achievements of the social sectors during 1991-2006 were substantially achievements of expanded access, which were politically popular; b) progress on improving service quality was limited, reflecting the need for stronger commitment required to address politically difficult governance problems that determine institutional performance; c) evidence about the extent of corruption across the social sectors is uneven and may create a distorted picture of where the substantive governance weaknesses lie; and d) formal accountability institutions do not work – at least not as expected. However, ‘rough’ forms of accountability – from individual complaints and lobbying through social networks, to collective protest and the threat of mob violence – help fill the accountability deficit left by the failures of formal mechanisms to empower citizens to participate in an unregulated and unpredictable way.

One implication of the findings is that governance conditions sufficient to support the achievements of the 1990s will not support reforms slated for the 2000s. Programmes of expansion remain politically popular. They are also administratively more feasible than the deeper institutional changes needed to improve accountability and transparency in the system. Governance conditions have been less conducive of reforms targeted at improving quality and equity in the first half of the 2000s. So while weak governance did not necessarily impede Bangladesh’s social sector achievements in the 1990s, already by the 2000s there were clear indications that deeper institutional and broader governance reforms would be necessary for these gains to be extended or even sustained.

[Summary from BRAC: http://www.bracresearch.org/srch_dtls.php?tid=435]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Citizenship

Governance

Public Goods

Effective States

Citizenship Formation - Inclusion/Exclusion and Poverty

The Government of Chronic Poverty: From Exclusion to Citizenship?

Sam Hickey (2010)

Journal of Development Studies Volume 47, Issue 7, Pages 1139 – 1155

Development trustees have increasingly sought to challenge chronic poverty by promoting citizenship amongst poor people, a move that frames citizenship formation as central to overcoming the exclusions and inequalities associated with uneven development. For sceptics, this move within inclusive neoliberalism is inevitably depoliticising and disempowering, and our cases do suggest that citizenship-based strategies rarely alter the underlying basis of poverty. However, our evidence also offers some support to those optimists who suggest that progressive moves towards poverty reduction and citizenship formation have become more rather than less likely at the current juncture. The promotion of citizenship emerges here as a significant but incomplete effort to challenge poverty that persists over time.

[Author’s Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Citizenship

Poverty

Neo-liberalism

Struggles for citizenship in Africa

B. Manby (2010)

Africa Governance Monitoring and Advocacy Project

Available at: <http://www.eldis.org/go/home&id=51450&type=Document>

'We needed a war because we needed our identity cards. Without an identity card you are nothing in this country.' As the author points out, a fighter for the rebel 'new forces' in Côte d'Ivoire condenses the argument of the book into two short sentences: that the denial of a right to citizenship has been at the heart of many of the conflicts of post-colonial Africa, and that it is time to change the rules.

Without citizenship, the author points out, people:

- Cannot get their children registered at birth or entered in school or university
- Cannot obtain travel documents, or employment without a work permit
- If they leave the country they may not be able to return
- Most of all, they cannot vote, stand for office or work for state institutions.

Furthermore, as the book highlights questions of citizenship have been used to prevent specific individuals from challenging for political position.

This book gives more details on issues such as:

- Citizenship law in Africa: a history of discrimination and exclusion
- Denationalized groups: disputes over the law have been at the heart of the wider debate
- Silencing individuals: citizenship law has also proved a useful tool to incumbent governments wishing to silence critics
- The scale of the problem: the true number of people affected by the crisis of citizenship in Africa is difficult to estimate.

Conclusions

- A denial of the right to citizenship itself under national law is often central to the denial of other rights
- Ethnic and gender discrimination in citizenship law may exclude those from the right to access education, health and other goods, as well as from the right to freedom of movement
- The denial of citizenship to these groups means that in practice the issues of land and economic inequality are made more difficult to resolve.

[ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Examination of citizenship law and its interaction with other forms of exclusion

Review of the literature

Keywords

Rights
Citizenship Law
Exclusion
Ethnicity

'We Have Always Lived Here': Indigenous Movements, Citizenship and Poverty in Argentina

Matthias vom Hau, Guillermo Wilde, (2010)

Journal of Development Studies Volume 46, Issue 7, Pages 1283 - 1303

This article explores the nexus between indigenous mobilisation, citizenship, and poverty in Argentina. A subnational comparison of land struggles among the Diaguita Calchaqu in Tucumán and the Mbya Guaraní in Misiones shows that changing global and national opportunity structures, most prominently a new multicultural citizenship regime, set the stage for indigenous mobilisation. In turn, local transformations of capitalist development motivate indigenous mobilising efforts, whereas leadership patterns and state-movement relations shape the capacity to mobilise. Diaguita and Mbya mobilisation reveals that indigenous movements play a central role in the activation of formal citizenship rights and the contestation of dominant notions of poverty. At the same time, the current design of multicultural citizenship and the adverse socioeconomic incorporation of indigenous communities also counteract indigenous mobilising efforts in Argentina.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Comparative case studies

Keywords

Citizenship
Inclusion
Exclusion
Poverty

Adverse incorporation, social exclusion and chronic poverty

Sam Hickey and Andries du Toit, (2007)

Chronic Poverty Research Centre, (CPRC) Working Paper No. 81

Available at:

http://www.chronicpoverty.org/uploads/publication_files/WP81_Hickey_duToit.pdf

There are a number of compelling reasons to focus on the ways in which the processes and relations of adverse incorporation and social exclusion (AISE) underpin chronic poverty. In particular, AISE research draws attention to the causal processes that lead poverty to persist, and to the politics and political economy of these processes and associated relationships over time. Specific dimensions of AISE are explored in relation to chronic poverty – namely political, economic, socio-cultural and spatial – and are found to relate closely to long-term historical processes, particularly concerning the nature and forms of capitalism, different stages and types of state formation, and institutionalised patterns of social norms and attitudes. However, it is also stressed that much of the promise of AISE research lies in its capacity to cross analytical

boundaries and capture the multi-dimensional and interlocking character of long-term deprivation. This analysis suggests a number of fruitful areas for research, most of which are currently under-explored in poverty research. In methodological terms, there are benefits to adopting integrated qualitative-quantitative approaches when investigating AISE, although it is argued that (a) the relational nature of AISE and the limitations of quantitative data may dictate that qualitative work should take priority here and (b) that more historical and theoretically oriented forms of research are particularly appropriate in studying AISE. To think about challenging AISE involves shifting the frame from policy to politics and from specific anti-poverty interventions to longer-term development strategies, particularly in terms of industrialisation and labour market restructuring, moves towards developmental states and supporting shifts from clientelism to citizenship. However, a range of more immediate development policy interventions may also be able to make headway in challenging the forms of AISE that perpetuate poverty.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Agenda for future research

Keywords

Exclusion

Poverty

Developmental States

Clientelism

Citizenship

Citizenship and the boundaries of the acknowledged community: identity, affiliation and exclusion. Why western concepts of citizenship don't fit with Southern realities

N. Kabeer (2002)

Institute of Development Studies (IDS), Working Paper No.171

Available at: <http://www.eldis.org/go/home&id=11860&type=Document>

This working paper examines the interaction of two different forms of citizen belonging, and the rights and responsibilities associated with these:

- membership of the imagined community of the nation-state
- membership of various acknowledged communities at the sub-national level.

In these two levels, the author investigates processes of access and exclusion – both separately and in interaction with each other.

The paper aims to contribute to the development of a research agenda on the theme of “inclusive citizenship”, particularly the challenges it presents in the context of poorer southern countries today. Through a historical analysis, it argues that the notions of citizenship constructed in the West are inappropriate in post-colonial contexts, in which pre-existing differences within the population have been exacerbated or artificially suppressed by the strategic manoeuvrings of colonial power. As a result, prevailing ideas about personhood, identity and affiliation lead to fractured notions of citizenship and exclusionary outcomes. The author concludes by proposing three themes for future research into inclusive citizenship in the South.

The study of citizenship began as the study of political rights and democratic governance within Western politics and philosophy. Today however, it encompasses a broader sociological perspective highlighting that a universally shared concept of citizenship is further away from practical articulation and understandings of the concept than ever.

[ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Historical Analysis

Review of the Literature

Keywords

Citizenship

Inclusive Citizenship

Exclusion

Political violence and state formation in post-colonial Africa: Lessons to be learnt from post-colonialism in Africa

Mahmood, Mamdani (2007)

International Development Centre, Open University, Working Paper Series, Paper No.1

Available at: http://idc.open.ac.uk/files/Resource/20090911_031601_2192.pdf

This paper argues for the importance of understanding the political legacy of colonialism. Its author contends that colonialism in Africa left a legacy of dual citizenship - the civil and the customary - which reflected not different histories or different cultures, but a different political relationship between the colonial power and the populations defined as races and tribes. The author argues that the inability of postcolonial states to move away from the colonial legacy and “depoliticize” cultural difference hinders processes of Nation-building and gives rise to political and ethnic violence in Africa.

The discussion concludes that the citizenship challenge needs to be thought through in the concrete context of former colonies with a legacy of 20th century indirect rule mediated through a regime of customary law enforced by customary authorities. The key question in the post-colonial African context is not which rights, but whose rights. Who has the right to rights, the right to be a citizen?

[ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Review of historical development of forms of ethnicity and citizenship within colonial and postcolonial Africa.

Keywords

Citizenship

Ethnicity

Who should be included? non-citizens, conflict and the constitution of the citizenry: The challenge of citizenship in ethnically diverse societies
M.J. Gibney (2006)

Centre for Research on Inequality, Human Security and Ethnicity (CRISE), Oxford University, Working Paper 17

Available at: <http://www.crise.ox.ac.uk/pubs/workingpaper17.pdf>

This article explores how citizenship is constructed in ethnically diverse societies. The paper argues that the distribution of citizenship is likely to impact upon societal stability and the likelihood of conflict.

The paper discusses the following:

- how individuals, both on their own and as members of ethnic groups, become non-citizens and the factors that often force them to remain so over time in the country in which they reside
- why it is important for those interested in horizontal inequalities to consider how the issue of citizenship is distributed across a society and particularly across ethnic groups
- what it means to distribute citizenship fairly
- the challenges associated with citizenship reform

The paper also highlights challenges for citizenship reform:

- the idea of the pre-social rights-bearing individual lacks roots in many post-colonial societies where group memberships have proven far more significant in determining access to rights, privileges and security
- exclusion from citizenship often serves powerful interests. Defining the demos in one way or another may dramatically change the balance of power in many states, empowering some actors and weakening others

[ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Review of the literature

Keywords

Exclusion

Ethnicity

Construction of Citizenship

Citizenship Reform

Inclusive citizenship' for the chronically poor: exploring the inclusion-exclusion nexus in collective struggles

K. Masaki (2007)

Institute for Development Policy and Management, Manchester

Available at: www.chronicpoverty.org/uploads/publication_files/WP96_Masaki.pdf

The promotion of 'inclusive citizenship', through which the disadvantaged engage in collective struggles for justice and recognition, has been attracting growing attention as a solution to chronic poverty. This paper considers this formulation by drawing on a case of landless squatters (Sukumbasis) in Western Nepal.

The case study highlighted here shows that the Sukumbasis' collective actions were bound to

draw a line between ‘us’ and ‘them’ thereby privileging some squatters over ‘immanent others’ who are not entirely outside the realm of association, but are positioned as those lacking the properties required of fully-fledged citizens.

Further conclusions include:

- while claiming rights as citizens, the Sukumbasis were ironically compelled to conform to the dominant social norms which had placed them at a disadvantage
- the disciplinary power contained within the notion of citizenship itself not only imposed particular norms of civility on the Sukumbasis, but also served as leverage for them to gain due recognition as citizens
- it is crucial for proponents of ‘inclusive citizenship’ to heed the contingent and unpredictable nature of collective actions
- to avoid imposing outsiders’ presumptions on the uncertainty and complexity surrounding the lives of the deprived, an ‘ascending’ approach is called for to delve into the micro-level inconspicuous practices of the chronically poor
- outside agencies should seek to devise strategies that capitalise on and make up for the opportunities and the limitations arising from their day-to-day struggles.

[ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Case study of the Sukumbasis in Western Nepal

Keywords

Inclusive Citizenship

Claiming Citizenship

Inclusion

Exclusion

Governance and citizenship from below: Views of poor and excluded groups and their vision for a New Nepal

Nicola Jones with Binod Bhatta, Gerard Gill, Sara Pantuliano, Hukum Bahadur Singh, Deepak Timsina, Shizu Uppadhaya, and David Walker (2009)

Overseas Development Institute, Working Paper 301

Available at: <http://www.odi.org.uk/resources/download/3289.pdf>

Latent and violent unrest has plagued Nepal since the process of parliamentary politics was reintroduced in 1991 after 50 years of monarchical rule. This document focuses on grassroots experiences and understandings of governance and citizenship, and the implications of these for state building in post-conflict Nepal. This study asks how poor people understand citizenship, how do they experience and practise it, what barriers do they face and how do they think these could be overcome?

The authors also explore poor and excluded groups’ vision for a New Nepal following Jana Andolan (the People’s Movement), the November 2006 peace agreement and the emergence of the democratically elected government in May 2008. Overall the findings of this study suggest that many poor and excluded citizens are optimistic about the future following the peace process and are enthusiastic to participate and play a role in the reform process. The documents argues that the importance of this should not be underestimated for the challenging state building process Nepal is now embarking upon. However, in many countries emerging from conflict, governments often fail to capitalise on people’s enthusiasm for peace and to sustain the

expectations of their citizens about peace dividends, especially in terms of services and accountable government structures. The document emphasises that addressing deeply entrenched social hierarchies (caste, ethnicity, gender, class) is an important priority for poor and excluded groups, as social exclusion is an important impediment to poverty alleviation and political representation.

Additional findings include:

- there is very strong support for peace among poor and excluded communities, regardless of their experiences during and views of the decade-long conflict
- there is strong support among poor and excluded groups for greater decentralisation
- there was very limited donor and NGO presence in the study communities, as evidenced by the low levels of reliance on non-state organisations. This suggests that many poverty alleviation efforts are not reaching the poorest
- poor and excluded groups are not habituated to social exclusion, domination and injustice
- poor people's priorities were first and foremost context-specific, suggesting that local level decision-making is critical to ensure that people's development priorities are effectively met

[ELDIS Summary]

Methods

Case study Nepal, Jana Andolan (the People's Movement).
Examination of understandings of Citizenship

Keywords

Citizenship
Exclusion
Poverty

Limits to Liberation After Apartheid: Citizenship, Governance & Culture in South Africa

Steven L. Robins. Editor. (2005)
James Currey: Oxford

The post-apartheid public sphere in South Africa has been characterised by race tensions and distrust. Socio-economic inequalities and structural unemployment are contributing to widespread crises. In addressing the conceptual and empirical questions relating to the transition to democracy, the contributors to this volume take the questions of culture and identity seriously, drawing attention to the creative agency of citizens of the 'new' South Africa. They raise important questions concerning the limits of citizenship and procedural democracy.

[James Currey publisher's summary:

<http://jamescurrey.com/store/viewItem.asp?idProduct=9916>]

Methods

Case Studies
Conceptual Analysis
Review of the Literature

Keywords

Citizenship
Democracy
Inclusion
Exclusion
Poverty
Ethnicity

Citizenship and the Constitution of Structured Social Inequality

Malcolm Waters, (1989)

International Journal of Comparative Sociology Volume 30, Issue 3-4, Pages 159-180.

Both political philosophical and sociological accounts of citizenship stress equal rights and obligations. However, citizenship can be viewed as a vehicle by means of which the state structures social inequality in both state socialist and capitalist societies. This occurs in three ways: by offering formal equality to those who are materially disprivileged; by the establishment of differential citizenship statuses; and by the manipulation of political support. The consequent patterns of "unequal citizenship" are a contradiction and there is a continuous expansion and modification of citizenship practices as the contradiction is manifested. Historically there are three forms of citizenship which emerge in response to this contradiction: individualistic citizenship, uninational citizenship and binational citizenship.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Conceptual Analysis
Review of the Literature

Keywords

Citizenship
Exclusion
Inclusion
Understandings of Citizenship

The Perils of Belonging: Autochthony, Citizenship, and Exclusion in Africa and Europe

Peter Geschiere, (2009)

University of Chicago Press: Chicago

Despite being told that we now live in a cosmopolitan world, more and more people have begun to assert their identities in ways that are deeply rooted in the local. These claims of autochthony—meaning “born from the soil”—seek to establish an irrefutable, primordial right to belong and are often employed in politically charged attempts to exclude outsiders. In *The Perils of Belonging*, Peter Geschiere traces the concept of autochthony back to the classical period and incisively explores the idea in two very different contexts: Cameroon and the Netherlands.

In both countries, the momentous economic and political changes following the end of the cold war fostered anxiety over migration. For Cameroonians, the question of who belongs where rises to the fore in political struggles between different tribes, while the Dutch invoke

autochthony in fierce debates over the integration of immigrants. This fascinating comparative perspective allows Geschiere to examine the emotional appeal of autochthony—as well as its dubious historical basis—and to shed light on a range of important issues, such as multiculturalism, national citizenship, and migration.

[The University of Chicago Press publisher's summary:

<http://www.press.uchicago.edu/ucp/books/book/chicago/P/bo6017282.html>]

Connections to citizenship formation:

Focusing mainly on Cameroon but also looking at other African situations such as Ivory Coast the book addresses some struggles over citizenship as they play into contestations of identity, and belonging, especially – ‘coming from the soil’ - autochthony. Geschiere highlights the way in which elite status plays into citizenship and also examines the everyday processes of nation building. The book examines how citizenship contestations are often about inclusion and exclusion from belonging. Moreover, the analysis brings to light how formal ‘citizenship’ does not always translate in practice to ‘full’ belonging and therefore ‘full’ political/social/economic rights, even if they are supposed to in theory.

Methods

Review of the literature

Case Studies

Examination of media debates

Keywords

Identity

Ethnicity

Inclusion

Exclusion

Understandings of Citizenship

Citizenship, Identity Formation & Conflict in South Kivu: The Case of the Banyamulenge

Koen Vlassenroot (2002)

Review of African Political Economy Volume 29, Issue 93/94, Pages 499-515.

The objectives of this exercise are threefold. First, through a case-study of the Banyamulenge ethnogenesis, I demonstrate that this ethnicity was never constructed in a vacuum, but in a 'pre-imagined' field. The 'creation' of a Banyamulenge identity illustrates perfectly that ethnicities are ongoing processes of continuous change. Ethnicities are dynamic processes that result from the confrontation of a community with its socio-economic and political environment. Contrary to what local political and social leaders like to believe about their followings, the existence of a Banyamulenge identity is not the result of pure invention. I illustrate how historical events gave meaning to the content of this identity. Second, a close look will be taken at the different internal dynamics within this community to reach a better understanding of the real content of this ethnogenesis. While the Banyamulenge in Uvira were undoubtedly subject to exclusion, widespread ethnic resentment and violence, their marginalised position is also due to a lack of coherent leadership and internal division. An inquiry into the reasons why the Banyamulenge community, even today, still lacks any coherent leadership that is capable of improving the position of their community is crucial. Finally, as recent local history in Uvira suggests, I show that political exclusion tends to be the key to conflicting identity formation. In the case of the Banyamulenge, it seems that their claims to political participation not only had the effect of

hardening the boundaries between different identity groups, but also had facilitated the shift to massive violence as an enticing strategy of control and resistance. This work is mainly the result of extensive fieldwork in and around Uvira and Bukavu, complemented by what was learned from the few printed sources that exist.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Identity

Claiming Citizenship

Gender, Justice, Citizenship, and Development

Maitrayee Mukhopadhyay and Navsharan Singh (2007)

International Development Research Centre (IDRC): Ottawa, Canada

Although there have been notable gains for women globally in the last few decades, gender inequality and gender-based inequities continue to impinge upon girls' and women's ability to realize their rights and their full potential as citizens and equal partners in decision-making and development. In fact, for every right that has been established, there are millions of women who do not enjoy it.

In this book, studies from Latin America and the Caribbean, the Middle East and North Africa, and sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia are prefaced by an introductory chapter that links current thinking on gender justice to debates on citizenship, entitlements, and law and development. A concluding chapter situates the discussion of gender justice, citizenship, and entitlements in current development debates on poverty alleviation and social exclusion. The book brings together multidisciplinary perspectives from leading feminist scholars of sociology, political science and legal studies, among others, and in doing so, provides new insights for both advocacy and research.

[International Development Research Centre (IDRC) Publishers Summary:

<http://publicwebsite.idrc.ca/EN/Resources/Publications/Pages/IDRCBookDetails.aspx?PublicationID=96>]

Methods

Case studies

Keywords

Citizenship

Inclusion

Exclusion

Poverty

Markets, Citizenship and Social Exclusion

Charles Gore (1995)

In *Social Exclusion, Rhetoric, Reality, Responses* Gerry Rodgers, Charles Gore and Jose B. Figueiredo. Editors.

A contribution to the World Summit for Social Development, International Institute for Labour Studies, International Labour Organization, Geneva

Full book available at: http://www.ilo.org/public/libdoc/ilo/1995/95B09_55_englpl.pdf

What are the advantages of adopting a social exclusion approach to issues of citizenship rights? Section II. of this chapter, published by the International Labour Organisation, argues that the condition of citizenship must be a clear part of development policy analysis. Citizenship rights appear to be severely limited in many low-income countries, with civil and political rights often as reduced as social rights. Human rights conditionality prods governments to provide certain rights to their citizens, but macro-economic conditionality undermines countries' actual capacity to do so.

Despite there being no single framework for understanding citizenship, the case studies referred to avoid a participatory model in favour of a notion of citizens as rights-bearing individuals. The framework for citizenship developed by Marshall, largely on the basis of the British historical experience, stresses a division into civil rights, political rights and social rights. Social exclusion is seen as a kind of incomplete citizenship, caused by deficiencies in the possession of normal citizenship rights.

[...]

A social exclusion approach to citizenship rights applied to numerous case studies from around the world also yields the following findings:

- Poverty creates a gap between the provision and the realisation of citizenship rights. Negotiation between individuals and groups is critical to that realisation, as shown by the micro-dynamics of property rights in Russia and Thailand.
- With increasing international mobility, whether or not one has the status of a national citizen has more and more to do with possible social exclusion.
- Persons defined as “aliens” of various types, often refugees or migrant workers, may be denied the rights of typical citizens and live under a cloud of expulsion.
- Ambiguity over how the “national community” is constituted is typical in many countries. Citizenship may have as much to do with dominant cultural codes and political behaviour as with formal status.

[...]

[Abridged Summary from GSDRC Website]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Exclusion

Citizenship

Poverty

Inclusion or Exclusion? Emerging Effects of Middle-Class Citizen Participation on Delhi's Urban Poor

Poulomi Chakrabarti, (2008)

IDS Bulletin, Volume 38, Issue 6, Pages 96-104

What are the implications for Delhi's urban poor of increased middle-class participation in formal politics? The Bhagidari programme sought to institutionalise citizen participation in governance by involving Residents Welfare Associations (RWAs) in local level decision-making. It was restricted to middle-class areas. This Institute of Development Studies (IDS) paper explores Bhagidari's impacts on channels of political representation for the poor. It finds that RWAs pursue their own interests, but in the process their activities are often directed against the poor.

Poor people in Delhi use formal politics as the primary channel of accessing the state, often via client-patron relationships. Middle-class associations have traditionally been distant from formal electoral politics. They are more likely to use bureaucratic and judicial channels of representation, reflecting the distinction between 'planned' and 'informal' settlements and occupations. This is central to understanding variations in Delhi's state-society relationships. Bhagidari was restricted to RWAs in planned areas, based on a rationale concerned with scale and legality, particularly regarding land tenure in informal settlements.

[...]

[Abridged Summary from GSDRC Website]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Inclusion

Exclusion

Citizenship

Poverty

State-Society Relations

Associations, active citizenship, and the quality of democracy in Brazil and Mexico

Peter P. Houtzager and Arnab K. Acharya, (2011)

Theory and Society, Volume 40, Issue 1, 1-36

Available at:

<http://www2.ids.ac.uk/gdr/cfs/pdfs/HoutzagerAcharya%20Assoc%20and%20Active%20Citizenship%20TS2010.pdf>

In many Third Wave democracies large classes of people experience diminished forms of citizenship. The systematic exclusion from mandated public goods and services significantly injures the citizenship and life chances of entire social groups. In democratic theory civil associations have a fundamental role to play in reversing this reality. One strand of theory, known as civic engagement, suggests that associations empower their members to engage in public politics, hold state officials to account, claim public services, and thereby improve the quality of democracy. Empirical demonstration of the argument is surprisingly rare, however, and limited to affluent democracies. In this article, we use original survey data for two large cities

in Third Wave democracies—São Paulo and Mexico City—to explore this argument in a novel way. We focus on the extent to which participation in associations (or associationalism) increases “active citizenship”—the effort to negotiate directly with state agents access to goods and services legally mandated for public provision, such as healthcare, sanitation, and security—rather than civic engagement, which encompasses any voluntary and public spirited activity. We examine separately associationalism’s impact on the quality of citizenship, a dimension that varies independently from the level of active citizenship, by assessing differences in the types of citizenship practices individuals use to obtain access to vital goods and services. To interpret the findings, and identify possible causal pathways, the paper moves back-and-forth between two major research traditions that are rarely brought into dialogue: civic engagement and comparative historical studies of democratization.

[Authors’ Abstract]

Methods

Review of the literature

Analysis of Survey Data

Keywords

Inclusion

Exclusion

Citizenship

Poverty

State-Society Relations

Democracy

Insurgent Citizenship: Disjunctions of Democracy and Modernity in Brazil

James Holston, (2009)

Princeton University Press: Princeton, NJ

Insurgent citizenships have arisen in cities around the world. This book examines the insurgence of democratic citizenship in the urban peripheries of São Paulo, Brazil, its entanglement with entrenched systems of inequality, and its contradiction in violence.

James Holston argues that for two centuries Brazilians have practiced a type of citizenship all too common among nation-states—one that is universally inclusive in national membership and massively inegalitarian in distributing rights and in its legalization of social differences. But since the 1970s, he shows, residents of Brazil’s urban peripheries have formulated a new citizenship that is destabilizing the old. Their mobilizations have developed not primarily through struggles of labor but through those of the city—particularly illegal residence, house building, and land conflict. Yet precisely as Brazilians democratized urban space and achieved political democracy, violence, injustice, and impunity increased dramatically. Based on comparative, ethnographic, and historical research, *Insurgent Citizenship* reveals why the insurgent and the entrenched remain dangerously conjoined as new kinds of citizens expand democracy even as new forms of violence and exclusion erode it.

Rather than view this paradox as evidence of democratic failure and urban chaos, *Insurgent Citizenship* argues that contradictory realizations of citizenship characterize all democracies—emerging and established. Focusing on processes of city- and citizen-making now prevalent globally, it develops new approaches for understanding the contemporary course of democratic citizenship in societies of vastly different cultures and histories.

[Princeton University Press Publishers Summary: <http://press.princeton.edu/titles/8533.html>]

Methods

Case Study
Ethnographic Research

Keywords

Citizenship Formation
Democracy
Violence and Conflict

Citizens and Subjects: Democratisation and Ethnic Identity in Rural Ghana

Marianna Ofori, (2008)

Centre for Research on Inequality, Human Security and Ethnicity (CRISE), Working Paper No. 59

Oxford University

Available at: <http://www.crise.ox.ac.uk/pubs.shtml>

This study applies institutional analysis to explore the connections between ethnicity and political choice during elections. Inquiries into the electoral politics of Fanteakwa, a multiethnic administrative district and electoral constituency in Ghana, demand that interactions between three institutions of local power be evaluated to explain when ethnicity is a significant factor in political choice. This is largely because although people determine their political allegiance on the basis of political familiarity, they also do so on the basis of economic well-being. The institutional relationships and the characteristics of the local political party, local government administration and chieftaincy define how resources are distributed, who benefits and who does not. And this in turn, drives voters, sometimes drawing on and transforming cleavages defined by ethnicity. This case study also suggests that 'locality', a sub-category of ethnicity, is a more salient factor than ethnicity in determining how individuals think about their political options in a multiethnic setting.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Citizenship Formation
Inclusion
Exclusion
Democracy

Restructuring Citizenship in Bolivia: El Plan de Todos

Benjamin Kohl, (2003)

International Journal of Urban and Regional Research, Volume 27, Issue 2, Pages 337–351

Current international development policies promote both free markets and democratic states through privatization and decentralization programs. Building on T.H. Marshall's concept of citizenship, this article examines how these programs have affected the rights associated with citizenship in Bolivia since 1993 when the administration of President Gonzalo Sánchez de Lozada introduced a broad set of economic and political reforms. His administration sold state

firms that had accounted for 50% of government revenues at the same time as it adopted a new constitution that recognized the multicultural and pluri-ethnic nature of Bolivian society. His administration also began decentralization programs in government, health and education that transferred 20% of national revenues, as well as the responsibility for providing services, to municipal governments. I show how current development practice has strengthened a neoliberal citizenship regime in which civil rights associated with ownership of private property, and political rights associated with formal democracy and representation, have been promoted at the expense of social rights associated with access to health, education and welfare.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Citizenship

State-Market Relations

Neo-liberalism

Democracy

Elite Associations and the Politics of Belonging in Cameroon

Francis Nyamnjoh and Michael Rowlands, (1998)

Africa: Journal of the International African Institute, Volume 68, Issue 3, Pages 320-337

The development of elite associations has been a consequence of the growth of multi-partyism and the weakening of authoritarian state control in Cameroon in the 1990s. The attachment of electoral votes and rights of citizenship to belonging to ethnicised regions has encouraged the formal distinction between 'natives' and 'strangers' in the creation of a politics of belonging. The article argues that this development has also led to the replacement of political parties at the local level by ethnicised elite associations as prime movers in regional and national politics.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Inclusion

Exclusion

Citizenship Formation

Governance, economic settings and poverty in Bangalore

Solomon Benjamin, (2000)

Environment and Urbanization, Volume 12, Issue 1, Pages 35-56

Available at: <http://eau.sagepub.com/content/12/1/35.full.pdf+html>

This paper suggests that an understanding of poverty in cities such as Bangalore (often referred to as India's Silicon Valley) requires more attention to the governance processes in which different groups compete for public investments and support. It describes the differences between the "local" and the "corporate" economies within Bangalore and their links with government. The local economies provide most of the population (including virtually all poor

groups) with their livelihoods. They mostly develop outside the “master plan” areas, with diverse and complex economies and land tenure forms within which poor groups find accommodation and work. Their links with government are through local government – the City Corporation and its councillors and lower level bureaucracy. The corporate economies include the information technology industries for which Bangalore is well-known. Most of their links with government are with state and national parastatal agencies that control most of Bangalore’s development functions and have access to most government funding. But there is little local representation in these agencies. This profoundly disadvantages poor groups and the local economies in the competition for land, infrastructure and services. Rigid land use controls in the expanding corporate enclave areas exclude most pro-poor economic activity and threaten poorer groups’ fragile claims to land. Poor groups suffer demolition, resettlement, increased land prices and a governance system in which their local representative structure has little power. Meanwhile, the publicly sponsored “mega-projects” in Bangalore do little to support the local economies that are so important for the city’s prosperity; indeed, as this paper describes, many serve to disrupt them.

[Author’s Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Inclusion

Exclusion

Democracy

State-Society Relations

Dis-embedding the Sexual/Social Contract: Citizenship and Gender in Nepal

Seira Tamang, (2002)

Citizenship Studies Volume 6, Issue 3, Pages 309 - 324

Carole Pateman's work has been central to feminist critiques of the social contract, revealing it to be better understood as the sexual/social contract in which not only is the contracting individual male, but constructed through the active exclusion of women from the pact. These gendered roles are argued to be the result of the restructuring of society in the advent of modernity. The ramifications for the relationship between gender and citizenship in the non-West where modernity has taken a different trajectory are unclear. By mapping out the nature of citizenship as it evolves in its historical form in Nepal, this article argues not only that citizenship comes to be gendered in historically and culturally specific ways, but that the specific manner in which Nepal has been inserted in the late capitalist global economy--via 'development'--has resulted in de-politicized forms of citizenship with local and global constraints on the enlargement of its political potential.

[Author’s Abstract]

Methods

Review of Literature

Case Study

Keywords

Citizenship
Inclusion
Exclusion
Social Contract
State-Society Relations

Citizenship Formation and Civil Society

**Pro-democratic social movements, civil society and the public sphere.
The role of the Civic Alliance and the transition to democracy in Mexico**

A. J. Olvera (2000)

Civil Society and Governance Programme, Institute of Development Studies (IDS)

In the prolonged and inconclusive process of democratic transition taking place in Mexico, the role of pro-democratic social movements in constructing new public spaces and creating effective citizenship has been fundamental. The paper:

- first, gives a brief summary of the national political processes that created a suitable atmosphere for the development of social pro- democratic movements in Mexico
- second, analyses the formation and composition of Civic Alliance, Mexico's main pro-democratic movement
- third, studies the limits of pro-democratic collective action in the national context of the "half-way transition to democracy" which the country is presently going through

The major conclusions of the paper focus around the limitations and successes of civil society movements in Mexico to date. The reasons for civil society's limited success include:

- as a grouping of heterogeneous associations with different and sometimes contradictory interests, civil society in Mexico does not have the capacity of representation of interests as a whole block
- whilst the objectives and actions of Civic Alliance have been symbolically successful, they have been limited in legal and institutional terms, caused in part by the low capacity of inclusion of parties, slowness in adopting agendas and a high degree of bureaucratic narrow-mindedness, and also by the persistence of a culture of mistrust towards the political system as a whole
- The fact that Mexico is experiencing a situation of "mid transition to democracy" has reduced the capacity of civil mobilization in the democratic-electoral field, and has forced the pro-democratic movement to a greater specialization and professionalization in its actions

[...]

[Abridged ELDIS summary]

Methods

Case study of Civic Alliance, Mexico's main pro-democratic movement
Review of literature focusing on Civil Society in Mexico and Democratisation

Keywords

Civil Society

Citizenship and Social Movements: The Challenges of Inclusive Governance

Lisa Thompson and Chris Tapscott. Editors. (2010)

Zed Books: London

Debates over social movements have suffered from a predominate focus on North America and western Europe, often neglecting the significance of collective action in the global South. *Citizenship and Social Movements* seeks to partially redress this imbalance with case studies from Brazil, India, Bangladesh, Mexico, South Africa and Nigeria.

This volume points to the complex relationships that influence mobilization and social movements in the South, suggesting that previous theories have underplayed the influence of state power and elite dominance in the government and in NGOs.

As the contributors to this book clearly show, understanding the role of the state in relation to social movements is critical to determining when collective action can fulfil the promise of bringing the rights of the marginalized to the fore.

[Zed Books Publishers Summary: <http://www.zedbooks.co.uk/book.asp?bookdetail=4331>]

Methods

Case studies from Brazil, India, Bangladesh, Mexico, South Africa and Nigeria

Keywords

Citizenship

Civil Society

Associations and the exercise of citizenship in new democracies: evidence from São Paulo and Mexico City

P., P. Houtzager; A. Acharya; A., G. Lavalle (2007)

Centre for the Future State, IDS

Available at: <http://www.ids.ac.uk/go/idspublication/associations-and-the-exercise-of-citizenship-in-new-democracies-evidence-from-s-o-paulo-and-mexico-city>

A well-established body of democratic theory suggests that associations are the schools of democracy and, because they produce civic and active citizens, are vital to the quality of democracy. In this paper we find that this may not be the case in newer democracies with authoritarian legacies. Survey research in the large urban centers of São Paulo and Mexico City reveals that citizens who participate in associations are more likely to actively pursue a range of rights and entitlements, but this participation does not improve the quality of their relations with government.

Participation in associations does not make it more likely that an individual has the type of direct relations to government that approximate the democratic ideal, and that suggests that public officials treat citizens as legal equals and carriers of rights and entitlements. Instead, associations are as likely to reinforce the detached, brokered, or contentious relations to government that are common in newer democracies and vary in their distance from the democratic ideal. Rather than focus on voting behaviour or partisan activities, we explore the civil component of active citizenship that operates when citizens' seek access to the public goods necessary for enjoyment of the rights and entitlements constitutive of contemporary citizenship.

[Abstract from IDS Website]

Methods

Survey research
Review of the Literature

Keywords

Civil Society
Democracy
Citizenship
Public Goods

Transnational NGDOS and participatory forms of rights-based development: converging with the local politics of citizenship in Cameroon

Sam Hickey, (2002)

Journal of International Development Volume 14, Issue 6, Pages 841–857

The transmission of 'participatory development' by transnational non-governmental development organizations (NGDOs) to local 'partners' in developing countries is today widely criticized, often because of an apparent failure to attain the essentially political goal of 'empowerment'. This article argues that this problem relates closely to a failure amongst NGDOs to engage with the political context in which 'citizenship participation' is contested in developing countries. Case study material reveals how one participatory development intervention has converged with a particular moment in the trajectory of citizenship formation amongst the target group, and with the local politics of citizenship in Cameroon more broadly, in ways that have, at best, ambiguous implications for the 'empowerment' of the local participants. The paper concludes by discussing how 'rights-based' approaches might overcome these problems, and the challenge that this poses for the transnational development community.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

International NGOs
Civil Society
Citizenship
Understandings of Citizenship

Accountability Politics: Power and Voice in Rural Mexico

Jonathan A. Fox (2008)

Oxford University Press: Oxford

How can the seeds of accountability ever grow in authoritarian environments? Embedding accountability into the state is an inherently uneven, partial and contested process. Campaigns for public accountability often win limited concessions at best, but they can leave cracks in the system that serve as handholds for subsequent efforts to open up the state to public scrutiny.

This book explores the how civil society "thickens" by comparing two decades of rural citizens' struggles to hold the Mexican state accountable, exploring both change and continuity before,

during, and after national electoral turning points. The book addresses how much power-sharing really happens in policy innovations that include participatory social and environmental councils, citizen oversight of elections, local government social investment funds, participation reforms in World Bank projects, community-managed food programs, as well as new social oversight and public information access reforms. Meanwhile, efforts to exercise voice unfold at the same time as rural citizens consider their exit options, as millions migrate to the US, where many have since come together in a new migrant civil society.

Since explanations of electoral change do not account for how people actually experience the state, this book concludes that new analytical frameworks are needed to understand "transitions to accountability." This involves unpacking the interaction between participation, transparency and accountability.

[Oxford university Press Publisher's Summary:

<http://ukcatalogue.oup.com/product/9780199208852.do>]

Methods

Case Studies

Keywords

Civil Society

Citizenship

Participation

State-Society Relations

Seeing Like a Citizen: Grassroots Understanding of Citizenship and Rights

Simeen Mahmud, Lopita Huq and Kabita Chowdhury, (2009)

BRAC Development Institute , Research Brief, Issue 2

This research brief explores citizen's views of citizenship and how they 'see themselves as citizens'. "The 'citizens' whose meaning and expressions of citizenship and rights are presented below are members of 8 grassroots development organizations in Bangladesh. They constituted the study population under the 'Deepening democracy, building citizenship and promoting participation' research undertaken by BRAC Development Institute (BDI). This study set out to examine whether the mobilization and mediation practices of these organizations were able to build perception of citizenship and awareness of rights as citizens among resource poor people of rural Bangladesh."

It concludes that: "Lived experiences inform how people generally identify themselves and understand rights. [...] 'Citizenship' and 'rights' are terms they are familiar with but the meanings people give to them are not those conventionally ascribed. People's understanding is rooted in the real ways in which citizenship is relevant for them and the rights that are important in their day-to-day survival. 'Belonging' is important and defines the understanding of citizenship. [...] The meaning of rights is equally inscribed with rights relating to social justice and equality. The rights that are most important to the lives of the people are still the basic needs essential to survival, but also the freedom of movement and speech and having the security that allows them this freedom. And the visions of the people for the future of Bangladesh reiterate the need for the security of lives and livelihood in a more democratic Bangladesh. The visions themselves are testimony to the fact that a democratic vision has indeed taken root in Bangladesh, but the promise of democracy is yet to be fulfilled."

[Extracts from Research Brief]

Methods

Case Study of 8 NGOs

Keywords

Citizenship Formation

Civil Society

State-Society Relations

Seeing Like a Citizen: Voice of the People

Simeen Mahmud, Lopita Huq and Kabita Chowdhury, (2010)

BRAC Development Institute , Research Brief, Issue 3

“In Bangladesh there is inadequate and distorted forms of democratic practices on the one hand, but on the other unexpected and visible public commitment and action to improve the lives of the poor on the other. The research hypothesizes that this paradox is explained to a large extent by the mobilizing efforts of grassroots development organizations that help ordinary citizens to raise their voice and be heard. The research is based on a quantitative survey conducted in the south-west districts of Bangladesh with 2400 members belonging to eight grassroots organizations ...”

It concludes that: “The strength with which the voices of the members belonging to rights-based organizations is heard particularly in institutional spaces and in protests and struggles is striking. But the evidence also points to the fact that people’s voices are still curtailed reflecting the politics of gender and power dynamics, where being poor and being women limits the representation of their voice in institutional spaces that govern their lives. What is nevertheless significant is that when spaces are opened up, the opportunity to participate and speak out and protest is being taken up by marginalized women and men and organizations mobilizing around rights in particular are playing a crucial role in opening up these spaces.”

[Extracts from Research Brief]

Methods

Quantitative Survey

Keywords

Citizenship Formation

Civil Society

Inclusion

Exclusion

Citizenship Formation – Patrimonialism, Clientelism and Patronage

Client-ship and Citizenship in Latin America

Lucy Taylor (2004)

Bulletin of Latin American Research, Volume 23, Issue 2, pages 213–227

This article explores the development of political relationships between people and politicians since around 1820 in Latin America. In particular, it develops the idea of client-ship as a form of

political agency and contrasts it to citizenship, linking both to ‘natural’ and ‘historical’ interpretations of inequality. The piece claims that client-ship has dominated political relations and that its twin tools of charisma and votes-for-goods allows it to thrive today in the form of neo-populism. In contrast, citizenship has been thwarted by the efforts of parties which control political agency by imposing norms of intellectual superiority and hierarchies of disdain. Throughout, I argue that issues of race, gender and class are central to political relationships which are the cultural terrain of power, and conclude that parties must begin to take citizens – and citizenship – seriously if they wish to avert a crisis of democracy

[Author’s Abstract]

Methods

Review of the Literature

Historical analysis

Keywords

Clientelism

Citizenship

Participation

Clientelism

Personalist Politics, Clientelism and Citizenship: Local Elections in El Alto, Bolivia

Sian Lazar (2004)

Bulletin of Latin American Research, Volume 23, Issue 2, pages 228–243

The article investigates the citizenship practices of urban Aymara in a neighbourhood of El Alto, Bolivia, through an examination of the municipal elections of December 1999. Using ethnographic methods, I focus on the instrumental and affective sides of clientelism, a central feature of Bolivian elections. I argue that clientelism is a part of citizenship practice, a means of engaging with the state in the person of the politician. A majority of the Bolivian population are marginalised from the oligarchic mestizo system of government, as represented by the traditional political parties. However, at local level, and especially during election campaigns, there is more permeability, and this article sees clientelism as a set of strategies through which citizens attempt to make politics, and politicians, more representative and responsive.

[Author’s Abstract]

Methods

Ethnography

Keywords

Citizenship

Clientelism

Democracy

Participation

The Difficult Transition from Clientelism to Citizenship: Lessons from Mexico

Jonathan Fox (1994)

World Politics, Volume 46, Issue 2, Pages 151-184

How do subordinated people make the transition from clients to citizens? This study analyzes how less-than-democratic regimes come to respect autonomous, representative societal organizations as legitimate interlocutors. It draws on the Mexican experience to illustrate one important indicator of this transition: the process by which poor people gain access to whatever material resources the state has to offer without having to forfeit their right to articulate their interests autonomously.

[Extract from article]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Citizenship

Clientelism

Civil Society

State-Society Relations

Public Goods

Some evidence on the demand side of private-public goods provision by MPs

Staffan I. Lindberg, (2010)

Africa Power and Politics Programme, Working Paper No. 8

Available at: <http://www.institutions-africa.org/publications/working-papers>

Understanding why politicians in Africa sometimes go against the dominant strategy of using clientelism, and instead produce more collective and public goods, still evades us. This paper seeks to illuminate the question, drawing on a pre-election survey carried out in ten strategically selected constituencies in Ghana in August 2008. The analysis shows that to the extent politicians engage in supplying significant levels of clientelistic goods, they are rational actors in the sense of selecting efficient means to achieve their end (reelection). At the same time, it suggests an antidote to the reproduction of clientelism. While clientelism in all likelihood will not disappear completely under any circumstances in Africa or elsewhere, the much higher electoral pay-offs of economic – even if local – development indicated by voters in Ghana suggests that politicians in the era of free and fair elections gain many more votes by seeking to further constituency development (a collective good) than they lose by disengaging from clientelism.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Survey Analysis

Keywords

Citizenship

Clientelism

Democracy

Leadership

The role of private and collective goods in elections: evidence from Ghana

Keith R. Weghorst and Staffan I. Lindberg, (2009)

Africa Power and Politics Programme, Working Paper No. 5

Available at: <http://www.institutions-africa.org/publications/working-papers>

Many accounts of democratization in Africa from the early 1990s were infused with optimism at the outbreak of competitive elections in country after country across the continent. Yet, history has shown that African opposition parties rarely succeed in removing incumbents from office by winning elections. This paper analyzes data from two unique data collection exercises conducted in Ghana as pre- and postelection surveys surrounding the decisive December 2008 election in which NDC came back to power after eight years as the main opposition party. We find that the voters who decided the 2008 elections are more instruments of democracy and provide more rewards to politicians who perform well on constituency development and representation, than to those who act decisively as patrons trying to buy votes.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Survey Analysis

Keywords

Citizenship

Clientelism

Democracy

Leadership

A Strategic Approach to Rights: Lessons from Clientelism in Rural Peru

Aaron Schneider and Rebeca Zúñiga-Hamlin (2005)

Development Policy Review, Volume 23, Issue 5, Pages 567-584

International norms of social, economic and political rights are presented as a means of transforming social relations in developing countries. Yet, when rights norms are introduced into domestic practice, they do not always produce liberal, democratic results. Instead, rights and local practices of clientelism mix. This article examines this political process in rural Peru. Alternatives to clientelism emerge when NGOs and international development agencies forge strategic and selective coalitions between urban middle-class sectors and the rural poor. This calls for an explicit politics of advancing rights by any means necessary: accepting hybrid forms when inevitable, incorporating excluded groups when possible, and striking alliances that displace traditional elites.

[Authors' Abstract]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Citizenship

Inclusion

Elites

Exploring a Political Approach to Rights-Based Development in North West Cameroon: From Rights and Marginality to Citizenship and Justice

Jeidoh Duni, Robert Fon, Sam Hickey and Nuhu Salihu, (2009)

In Rights-Based Approaches to Development: Exploring the Potential and the Pitfalls, Sam Hickey and Diana Mitlin, Editors.

Kumarian Press: Sterling, VA

“We explore this challenge of transformation through a case study of a participatory rights-based program that seeks to assist a marginal pastoral group in North West Cameroon to be empowered citizens. The project involves providing paralegal support aimed at challenging the practices of state and social actors who regularly seek to exploit this marginal (an in some ways isolationist) group. It is run by a local social movement, and funded by an international NGO with a growing reputation for innovative work on empowerment issues (Mohan 2002; Hickey 2002; Waddington and Mohan 2004). This effort to counter exclusion and support minority rights is inherently political, and it reveals both the potential and the problems that arise when certain rights-based approaches engage with the politics of promoting progressive social change. We argue that the program has been relatively successful in catalyzing underlying processes sociopolitical change – particularly shifts from clientelism to citizenship among the programmes participants – and that it has also improved the quality of local governance. However, the program’s explicit, often confrontational engagement with the power relations underpinning exclusion and exploitation – between state and citizens and between social groups in a context of ethnic and gendered inequality and difference – has been both a strength and a liability un advancing progressive social change. This raises critical challenges for the strategic, theoretical, and philosophical dimensions of rights-based approaches.”

[Extract from Introduction to Chapter]

Methods

Case Study

Keywords

Change

Citizenship Formation

Inclusion

Exclusion

Clientelism

Governance in the Gullies: Democratic Responsiveness and Leadership in Delhi’s Slums

Saumitra Jha, Vijayendra Rao and Michael Woolcock, (2007)

World Development, Volume 35, Issue 2, Pages 230-246

We use detailed ethnographic evidence to design and interpret a broad representative survey of 800 households in Delhi’s slums, examining the processes by which residents gain access to formal government services and develop their own (informal) modes of leadership. While ethnically homogeneous slums transplant rural institutions to the city, newer and ethnically diverse slums depend on informal leaders who gain their authority through political connections, education, and network entrepreneurship. Education and political affiliation are more important than seniority in determining a leader’s influence. Informal leaders are accessible to all slum dwellers, but formal government figures are most accessed by the wealthy and the well connected.

[Author's Abstract]

Methods

Ethnography
Survey Analysis

Keywords

Democracy
Leadership
Clientelism
State-Society Relations

Related Research Programmes

Other Newly Established DFID Funded Research Programme Consortia

Secure Livelihoods Research Consortium

Aims to bridge the gaps in knowledge about:

- When it is appropriate to try and build secure livelihoods in fragile and conflict-affected situations (FCAS) in addition to meeting immediate acute needs;
- What building blocks (e.g. humanitarian assistance, social protection, agriculture and basic services – including water, health, education and support to market institutions and infrastructure) are required in different contexts;
- Who can best deliver building blocks to secure livelihoods in different contexts; and
- How key investments can be better and more predictably supported by effective financing mechanisms.

The research will focus on three interlinked thematic areas and one crosscutting area:

- Theme I: People's and community responses
- Theme II: Governance of state institutions, policies and interventions
- Theme III: Aid – roles of aid agencies and non-state actors
- Theme IV: Cross-cutting – Building blocks for livelihoods, basic services and social protection

[Abridged introduction from website:

<http://www.odi.org.uk/work/projects/details.asp?id=2320&title=secure-livelihoods-research-consortium>]

International Centre for Tax and Development

The ICTD's purpose is to build a stronger evidence base for those seeking to build more effective and legitimate institutions that deliver improved outcomes for poor people. Specifically, the research will offer:

- Improved conceptual and empirical understanding of tax systems within public finances that promote economic growth and social inclusion, and capable and accountable states responsive to the needs of their populations, including poor people.
- Improved engagement in and better support for state effectiveness through policy relevant tax research.
- Better results for tax reform initiatives through stronger and clearer evidence of 'what works'.
- Greater uptake of new and existing research findings through more effective synthesis, channeling and communication of conclusions.

The research is divided into 5 main research themes. These are:

- Understanding Taxation in Developing Countries
- Extending the Reach and Inclusiveness of Taxation
- Re-Thinking Tax Administration and Tax Reform
- International Dimensions of Taxation and Tax Evasion
- Foreign Aid, Taxation and State-building

For further information about the programme, contact Adam Randon, Programme Manager.

(a.randon@ids.ac.uk)

[Abridged introduction from website:

<http://www.ids.ac.uk/go/idsproject/international-centre-for-tax-and-development>]

Security and Justice in Fragile and Conflict Affected States

This Research Programme Consortium is based at the London School of Economics (LSE) but does not, (as yet), have a web presence.

The Project Manager is Wendy Foulds w.foulds@lse.ac.uk

Prof. Tim Allen is taking a lead on the research t.allen@lse.ac.uk

Other relevant Research Programmes and Centres

The Development Research Centre on Citizenship, Participation and Accountability (Citizenship DRC)

“An international network of researchers and activists exploring new forms of citizenship that will help make rights real.”

Includes links to recent publications on these themes.

<http://www.drc-citizenship.org/>

The Centre for Citizenship, Identities and Governance (CCIG)

“The Centre for Citizenship, Identities and Governance (CCIG) is a University designated Centre of Research Excellence. The Centre is an inter-disciplinary institution whose primary goal is to conduct and promote research, dialogue, and debate that contributes to a greater understanding of the manifold connections between notions of citizenship, processes of identity formation and practices of governance in the contemporary world.”

<http://www.open.ac.uk/ccig/>

Governance and Social Development Resource Centre

“The Governance and Social Development Resource Centre (GSDRC) provides cutting-edge knowledge services on demand and online. It aims to help reduce poverty by informing policy and practice in relation to governance, conflict and social development. The GSDRC is funded by the UK Department for International Development (DFID) and the Australian Agency for International Development (AusAID).”

<http://www.gsdr.org/>

The Developmental Leadership Program

“The Developmental Leadership Program (DLP) was established in July 2009 (initially as *The Leadership Program: Developmental Leaders, Elites and Coalitions* or *DLP*) with funding from the Australian Government.

Re-named as the DLP, the program builds on work previously undertaken by the *Leaders, Elites and Coalitions Research Program (LECRP)*. LECRP was initiated in 2007 following extensive consultations with leaders and other key stakeholders that made clear the need to know much more about the provenance and characteristics of progressive, developmental leadership. These

earlier programs commissioned research and analysis and built knowledge and evidence about the role and impact of leaders in shaping institutions, state building and development outcomes.”

Includes access to research and background papers.

<http://www.dlprog.org/>

Research Programme Consortium on Improving Institutions for Pro-Poor Growth

The IPPG Programme is the shorthand name for the inter-disciplinary Research Programme Consortium on Improving Institutions for Pro-Poor Growth. The DFID-funded IPPG supports innovative scholarly research, and seeks to influence development policy and practice that contributes to the UN Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). IPPG supports innovative scholarly research, and seeks to influence development policy and practice that contributes to achievement of the MDGs.

The programme came to a close in 2010, however, there remain on the website useful publications on the research conducted. This includes the synthesis paper written at the close of the programme: 'Beyond Institutions: Institutions and organisations in the politics and economics of poverty reduction - a thematic synthesis of research evidence'.

<http://www.ippg.org.uk/index.html>

Crisis State Research Centre

“The Crisis States Research Centre (CSRC) is a leading centre of interdisciplinary research into processes of war, state collapse and reconstruction in fragile states. By identifying the ways in which war and conflict affect the future possibilities for state building, by distilling the lessons learnt from past experiences of state reconstruction and by analysing the impact of key international interventions, Centre research seeks to build academic knowledge, contribute to the development of theory, and inform current and future policy making. The Centre is based within the Department of International Development at LSE.”

<http://www2.lse.ac.uk/internationalDevelopment/research/crisisStates/Home.aspx>

Centre for Future State

“The Centre for the Future State undertakes research into the processes involved in building more effective, accountable and responsive governance in poor countries. It provides a framework for long-term cooperation between social science researchers from different parts of the world. Its aim is to undertake high quality research that is relevant to public policy, and to ensure that it comes to the notice of policymakers.”

<http://www2.ids.ac.uk/futurestate/>

Africa Power and Politics Programme

“Power and Politics in Africa is a five-year programme of research and policy engagement launched in 2007. [...]

The programme is dedicated to "discovering institutions that work for poor people". That means exploring the kinds of political, economic and social arrangements that, if adopted, would enable countries of sub-Saharan Africa to make faster progress towards development and the

elimination of extreme poverty. We aim to identify ways of ordering politics and regulating power and authority that might work better than those now in place. We want to do that on the basis of a careful and critical look at what has worked well in Africa itself in the recent and not-so-recent past.”

<http://www.institutions-africa.org/>

Elites, production and poverty

The programme...focuses on the roles of elites in formulating and implementing productive sector initiatives that promote economic growth and reduce poverty. Case studies cover initiatives in agriculture, agro-processing, fisheries, and manufacturing that feature prominently in the respective countries.

Research outputs

- Analyses of the political economy of policy formulation and implementation in general, and in selected cases of productive sector initiatives in particular, in five country studies;
- Contributions to better theoretical and operational understanding of the role of elites and the factors which affect how productive sector initiatives are designed and succeed or fail;
- Stimulating debate about what is pro-poor economic growth and what approaches to supporting productive sectors have the greatest impact on long term poverty reduction.

<http://www.diiis.dk/sw79386.asp>

Index

- Accountability**, 11, 131, 133, 134, 146, 147, 151, 155, 177, 186, 192
- Aid**, *See* External Assistance
- Balance of Power**, 78, 79
- Bureaucracy**, 18, 35, 37, 49, 52, 53, 55, 58, 60, 62, 67, 68, 91, 146
- Change**, 8, 12, 32, 51, 60, 63, 78, 84, 86, 87, 89, 92, 99, 121, 128, 132, 141, 145, 149, 152, 153, 157, 183
- Citizenship**, 3, 4, 7, 8, 11, 12, 53, 117, 122, 125, 126, 127, 128, 129, 130, 131, 132, 133, 134, 135, 136, 137, 138, 139, 140, 141, 142, 143, 144, 145, 146, 147, 148, 151, 152, 153, 154, 155, 156, 157, 158, 159, 160, 161, 162, 163, 164, 165, 166, 167, 168, 169, 170, 171, 172, 173, 174, 175, 176, 177, 178, 179, 180, 181, 182, 183, 186, 191, 192, 193
- Citizenship Formation**, 4, 126, 127, 128, 173, 183
- Civil Society**, 50, 59, 106, 121, 133, 135, 149, 150, 154, 175, 176, 177, 178, 179, 181
- Clientelism**, 17, 22, 23, 51, 56, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 94, 97, 135, 148, 161, 179, 180, 181, 182, 183, 184
- Democracy**, 8, 17, 19, 50, 51, 53, 54, 56, 58, 59, 60, 63, 87, 104, 119, 120, 121, 122, 131, 133, 136, 139, 141, 142, 148, 150, 151, 152, 157, 166, 171, 172, 173, 174, 177, 180, 181, 182, 184, 191, 192
- Developmental States**, 3, 4, 9, 13, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 30, 31, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 42, 43, 44, 45, 46, 47, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52, 53, 54, 55, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 62, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69, 70, 71, 92, 119, 155, 161, 191
- Economic Development**, *See* Growth
- Effective States**, 3, 10, 12, 13, 18, 21, 22, 28, 30, 32, 37, 38, 49, 52, 54, 57, 62, 68, 77, 100, 101, 103, 106, 114, 147, 151, 152, 153, 154, 156, 158
- Elite Bargains**, 72, 74, 84, 85, 86, 87, 88, 101, 104, 111, 112, 114, 116
- Elite Coalitions**, 6, 51, 54, 61, 70, 71, 72, 87, 89, 90, 91, 92, 93, 97, 98, 102, 105, 106, 119, 121, 123
- Elites**, 6, 10, 13, 14, 16, 18, 21, 23, 30, 59, 62, 69, 70, 71, 75, 84, 89, 90, 91, 100, 104, 108, 110, 111, 112, 117, 120, 121, 123, 155, 182, 186, 188
- Ethnicity**, 11, 96, 97, 128, 143, 145, 160, 162, 163, 166, 167, 172
- Exclusion**, 60, 69, 87, 91, 117, 123, 130, 132, 138, 158, 160, 161, 162, 163, 164, 165, 166, 167, 168, 169, 170, 171, 172, 173, 174, 175, 179, 183, 191
- External Assistance**, 5, 21, 22, 23, 47, 48, 49, 51, 54, 55, 56, 57, 65, 69, 75, 93, 94, 108, 123
- Governance**, 6, 8, 10, 16, 17, 18, 56, 57, 62, 70, 76, 82, 95, 99, 100, 101, 111, 127, 135, 151, 152, 155, 157, 158, 159, 164, 165, 173, 175, 176, 183, 186, 191, 192
- Growth**, 14, 15, 16, 19, 24, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 37, 38, 39, 42, 44, 45, 48, 49, 59, 61, 63, 65, 66, 67, 76, 77, 90, 95, 104, 105, 121, 187, 191, 192
- Identity**, 143, 144, 167, 168
- Inclusion**, 6, 9, 28, 44, 60, 69, 85, 87, 91, 96, 102, 108, 117, 119, 123, 128, 130, 151, 158, 160, 164, 166, 167, 168, 170, 171, 172, 173, 174, 175, 179, 182, 183
- Institutions**, 7, 16, 18, 23, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 33, 39, 49, 50, 63, 66, 68, 69, 74, 76, 77, 79, 82, 86, 104, 105, 106, 119, 136, 145, 187, 192
- Leadership**, 51, 70, 71, 92, 123, 181, 182, 184
- Legitimacy**, 45, 55, 101, 102, 146, 157
- Neo-liberalism**, 136, 13, 159, 173
- Participation**, 11, 131, 133, 134, 135, 136, 137, 139, 146, 147, 148, 149, 150, 151, 152, 154, 155, 156, 170, 176, 178, 180, 186, 191, 192
- Patrimonialism**, *See* Clientelism
- Patronage**, *See* Clientelism
- Policy**, 18, 21, 29, 32, 33, 46, 47, 54, 56, 57, 59, 73, 74, 77, 89, 90, 98, 102, 107, 115,

- 116, 121, 148, 153, 154, 163, 182, 191, 192, 193
- Political Settlements**, 3, 4, 6, 7, 9, 10, 12, 14, 18, 30, 40, 49, 51, 53, 60, 61, 63, 66, 69, 71, 72, 73, 74, 75, 76, 77, 79, 84, 85, 86, 89, 90, 92, 93, 94, 96, 97, 98, 99, 100, 101, 102, 103, 104, 106, 107, 108, 109, 111, 112, 113, 114, 116, 117, 119, 120, 121, 122, 123, 124, 191, 192, 193
- Poverty**, 10, 12, 13, 23, 28, 30, 44, 54, 75, 90, 114, 135, 136, 139, 141, 148, 151, 152, 153, 155, 158, 159, 160, 161, 165, 166, 168, 169, 170, 171, 192
- Public Goods**, 6, 8, 10, 11, 13, 17, 19, 55, 56, 59, 60, 62, 64, 74, 77, 85, 97, 100, 147, 149, 150, 151, 154, 155, 156, 157, 158, 177, 181
- Resources**, 48, 64, 143
- Social Contract**, 82, 83, 114, 115, 174, 175
- Social Exclusion**, *See* Exclusion
- State Formation**, 8, 10, 13, 15, 21, 34, 35, 53, 72, 94, 96, 97, 98, 99, 100, 101, 102, 108, 117, 120, 127, 129, 141, 143,
- State-Market Relations**, 18, 19, 20, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 34, 39, 41, 43, 44, 45, 49, 51, 58, 62, 66, 75, 90, 92, 119, 128, 173
- State-Society Relations**, 6, 7, 8, 10, 12, 13, 14, 18, 20, 25, 29, 30, 34, 35, 37, 39, 40, 41, 43, 45, 46, 50, 51, 52, 53, 57, 58, 59, 62, 72, 75, 77, 78, 80, 81, 82, 83, 85, 90, 96, 97, 100, 101, 103, 109, 110, 114, 115, 116, 128, 142, 144, 153, 154, 156, 157, 170, 171, 174, 175, 178, 179, 181, 184
- Taxation**, 13, 41, 48, 74, 101, 102, 111, 123, 157
- Understandings of Citizenship**, 140, 142, 144, 145, 166
- Violence and Conflict**, 6, 73, 90, 106, 107, 108, 109, 141, 172

References

- Booth, D. and Golooba-Mutebi, F., 2011. *Developmental patrimonialism? The case of Rwanda*, (Africa Power and Politics Programme Working Paper No. 16) [Online] London: Africa Power and Politics Programme. Available at: <<http://www.institutions-africa.org/publications/working-papers>> [Accessed 3 June 2011]
- Calder, K. E., 1983. Review: MITI and the Japanese Miracle. The Growth of Industrial Policy, 1925-1975. by Chalmers Johnson, *Pacific Affairs*, 56, (3), pp. 555-557
- Cammack, D. and Kelsall, T., 2010. *Developmental patrimonialism? The case of Malawi*, (Africa Power and Politics Programme Working Paper No. 12) [Online] London: Africa Power and Politics Programme. Available at: <<http://www.institutions-africa.org/publications/working-papers>> [Accessed 3 June 2011]
- Cornwall, A. Robins, S. and Von Lieres, B. (2011) States of Citizenship: Contexts and Cultures of Public Engagement and Citizen Action (IDS Working Paper No. 363) [Online} Brighton, Sussex: Institute of Development Studies. Available at: <<http://www.ntd.co.uk/idsbookshop/details.asp?id=1223>> [Accessed 3 June 2011]
- Dagnino, E., 2008. Challenges to Participation, Citizenship and Democracy: Perverse Confluence and Displacement of Meanings. In A. J. Bebbington, S. Hickey and D. Mitlin, ed. *Can NGOs Make a Difference? The Challenge of Development Alternatives*, London: Zed Books
- DFID, 2009. *Building the State and Securing the Peace* (DFID, Emerging Policy Paper) [Online] London: UK Department for International Development Available at: <<http://www.gsdr.org/go/display&type=Document&id=3210>> [Accessed 21 June 2011]
- Di John, J. and Putzel, J., 2009. *Political Settlements: Issues Paper* (Discussion Paper) [Online] Governance and Social Development Resource Centre. Available at: <<http://epapers.bham.ac.uk/645/>> [Accessed 3 June 2011]
- Di John, J., 2010. *State resilience against the odds: an analytical narrative on the construction and maintenance of political order in Zambia since 1960*, (Crisis States Research Centre, Working Paper Series 2 No. 75) [Online] London: London School of Economics. Available at: <<http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/28393/>> [Accessed 3 June 2011]
- Evans, P., 1995. *Embedded Autonomy: States and Industrial Transformation*, Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press
- Fritz, V. and Menocal, A. R., 2007. Developmental States in the New Millennium *Development Policy Review*, 25, (5), pp. 531–552
- Hickey, S. 2010. The Government of Chronic Poverty: From Exclusion to Citizenship? *Journal of Development Studies*, 46, (7), pp.1139 – 1155
- Higley, J. and Burton, M., 1998. Elite Settlements and the Taming of Politics, *Government and Opposition*, 33, (1), pp.98–115

- Johnson, C., 1982. *MITI and the Japanese miracle: the growth of industrial policy 1925 – 1975*, Stanford: Stanford University Press
- Johnson, C., 1987. Political Institutions and Economic Performance: The Government-Business Relationship in Japan, South Korea, and Taiwan. In: F. C. Deyo, ed. 1987. *The Political Economy of the New Asian Industrialisation*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press
- Jones, E. and Gaventa, J., 2002. Concepts of Citizenship: a review, (IDS Development Bibliography No. 19) [Online] Brighton Sussex: Development Research Centre on Citizenship, Participation and Accountability, Institute of Development Studies. Available at: <<http://www.ntd.co.uk/idsbookshop/details.asp?id=678>> [Accessed 3 June 2011]
- Kabeer, N. (2007) *Values and meanings of citizenship*, Development Research Centre on Citizenship, Participation and Accountability, Development Research Reporting Service
- Kabeer, N., 2003. Growing Citizenship from the Grassroots: Nijera Kori and Social Mobilization in Bangladesh, *The Bangladesh Development Studies*, 29, (3 and 4)
- Kellsal, T. et al, 2010. Developmental Patrimonialism? Questioning the orthodoxy on political governance and economic progress in Africa (Africa Power and Politics Programme Working Paper No. 9) [Online] London: Africa Power and Politics Programme. Available at: <<http://www.institutions-africa.org/publications/working-papers>> [Accessed 3 June 2011]
- Khan, M. H., 2010. *Political Settlements and the Governance of Growth-Enhancing Institutions*, (Draft Paper in Research Paper Series on 'Growth-Enhancing Governance'.) [Online] Available at: <<http://eprints.soas.ac.uk/9968/>> [Accessed: 1 May 2011].
- Khan, M., 1995. State Failure in Weak States: A Critique of New Institutional Explanations. In J. Harris, J. Hunter and C. M. Lewis, ed. 1995. *The New Institutional Economics and Third World Development*, London: Routledge
- Leftwich, A. 2008. *Developmental states, effective states and poverty reduction* [Online] UNRISD Project on Poverty Reduction and Policy Regimes. Available at <[http://www.unrisd.org/unrisd/website/projects.nsf/89d2a44e5722c4f480256b560052d8ad/68c40b61b9f737f6c125743900508c69/\\$FILE/Leftwichweb.pdf](http://www.unrisd.org/unrisd/website/projects.nsf/89d2a44e5722c4f480256b560052d8ad/68c40b61b9f737f6c125743900508c69/$FILE/Leftwichweb.pdf)> [Accessed 3 June 2011]
- Leftwich, A., 1995. Bringing politics back in: 'Towards a model of the developmental state' *Journal of Development Studies*, 31, (3), pp.400 - 427
- Leftwich, A., 2005. Democracy and development: Is there institutional incompatibility? *Democratization*, 12, (5), pp.686 – 703
- Maski, K., 2010. Rectifying the Anti-Politics of Citizen Participation: Insights from the Internal Politics of a Subaltern Community in Nepal, *Journal of Development Studies*, 46, (7), pp.1196 – 1215
- Noth, D. C. , Wallis, J.J. and Weingast, B.R., 2009. *Violence and Social Orders: A Conceptual Framework for Interpreting Recorded Human History*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

- OECD, (2011) Critical elements underpinning statebuilding, In OECD *Supporting Statebuilding in Situations of Conflict and Fragility: Policy Guidance*, [Online] OECD Publishing. Available at <http://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/development/supporting-statebuilding-in-situations-of-conflict-and-fragility/critical-elements-underpinning-statebuilding_9789264074989-7-en> [Accessed 3 June 2011]
- O'Shaughness, L. N. and Dodson, M., 1999. Political Bargaining and Democratic Transitions: A Comparison of Nicaragua and El Salvador, *Journal of Latin American Studies*, 31, (1), pp. 99-127
- Parkes, T. and Cole, W., 2010. *Political Settlements: Implications for International Development Policy and Practice*, (The Asia Foundation, Occasional Paper No. 2) [Online] The Asia Foundation. Available at: <<http://asiafoundation.org/publications/pdf/745>> [Accessed 3 June 2011]
- Robins, S. Cornwall, A. and Von Lieres, B., 2008. Rethinking 'Citizenship' in the Postcolony, *Third World Quarterly*, 29, (6), pp.1069 – 1086.
- Tilly, C., 2008. *Regimes and Repertoires*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press
- Walton, M. (2010) *Capitalism, the state, and the underlying drivers of human development*, (United Nations Development Programme, Human Development Reports Research Paper) [Online] United Nations Development Programme. Available at: <http://hdr.undp.org/en/reports/global/hdr2010/papers/HDRP_2010_09.pdf> [Accessed 3 June 2011]
- White, G., 1998. Building a democratic developmental state: Social democracy in the developing world *Democratization*, 5, (3), pp.1 - 32